



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS  
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

# Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court's case-law



COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

The Information Note, compiled by the Court's Case-Law Information and Publications Division, contains summaries of cases examined during the month in question which the Registry considers as being of particular interest. The summaries are not binding on the Court. In the provisional version the summaries are normally drafted in the language of the case concerned, whereas the final single-language version appears in English and French respectively.

An annual index provides an overview of all the cases summarised in each calendar year. To facilitate access to materials in the Information Notes, a running cumulative index will be updated online with each new edition of the provisional version of the Note. The important cases summarised in the Information Notes are indexed by Convention Article, keyword, applicant name and respondent State. The Index also contains a list of cases which have been referred to or rrelinquished in favour of the Grand Chamber.

The Information Note and the index may be downloaded at <[www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en](http://www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en)>. Legal summaries published in the Case-law Information Notes are also available in HUDOC under [Legal Summaries](#).

The HUDOC database is available free-of-charge through the Court's Internet site (<<http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/eng>>). It provides access to the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber, Chamber and Committee judgments, decisions, communicated cases, advisory opinions and legal summaries from the Case-Law Information Note), the European Commission of Human Rights (decisions and reports) and the Committee of Ministers (resolutions).

European Court of Human Rights  
(Council of Europe)  
67075 Strasbourg Cedex  
France  
Tel: 00 33 (0)3 88 41 20 18  
Fax: 00 33 (0)3 88 41 27 30  
[publishing@echr.coe.int](mailto:publishing@echr.coe.int)  
[www.echr.coe.int](http://www.echr.coe.int)  
<https://twitter.com/echrpublication>

ISSN 1996-1545

© Council of Europe / European Court of Human Rights, 2016

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>ARTICLE 1.....</b>	<b>9</b>
Jurisdiction of States .....	9
<b>ARTICLE 2.....</b>	<b>9</b>
Life.....	9
Use of force.....	9
Positive obligations (substantive aspect) .....	9
Effective investigation .....	10
Positive obligations (procedural aspect) .....	11
Expulsion .....	11
<b>ARTICLE 3.....</b>	<b>12</b>
Torture .....	12
Inhuman or degrading treatment.....	12
Degrading treatment .....	12
Inhuman or degrading punishment .....	13
Positive obligations (substantive aspect) .....	13
Effective investigation .....	13
Expulsion .....	14
Extradition .....	14
<b>ARTICLE 4.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>Article 4 § 1 .....</b>	<b>14</b>
Positive obligations – Trafficking in human beings .....	14
<b>Article 4 § 2 .....</b>	<b>15</b>
Forced labour – Compulsory labour .....	15
<b>Article 4 § 3 (a) .....</b>	<b>15</b>
Work required of detainees.....	15

<b>ARTICLE 5.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Article 5 § 1 .....</b>	<b>15</b>
Liberty of person.....	15
Deprivation of liberty.....	15
Lawful arrest or detention.....	15
<b>Article 5 § 1 (d) .....</b>	<b>16</b>
Minors.....	16
Educational supervision.....	16
<b>Article 5 § 1 (e).....</b>	<b>16</b>
Persons of unsound mind.....	16
<b>Article 5 § 1 (f).....</b>	<b>16</b>
Expulsion.....	16
<b>Article 5 § 3 .....</b>	<b>16</b>
Brought promptly before judge or other officer .....	16
Reasonableness of pre-trial detention.....	17
<b>Article 5 § 4 .....</b>	<b>17</b>
Take proceedings .....	17
Review of lawfulness of detention.....	17
<b>ARTICLE 6.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Article 6 § 1 (civil) .....</b>	<b>17</b>
Civil rights and obligations.....	17
Access to court.....	17
Fair hearing.....	18
Equality of arms.....	19
Oral hearing .....	19
Independent and impartial tribunal.....	19
Impartial tribunal .....	19
<b>Article 6 § 1 (criminal).....</b>	<b>20</b>
Criminal charge.....	20
Access to court.....	20
Fair hearing .....	20

Independent and impartial tribunal .....	21
Impartial tribunal .....	21
<b>Article 6 § 1 (administrative) .....</b>	<b>21</b>
Access to court .....	21
Adversarial trial – Equality of arms .....	21
Public hearing .....	21
Independent and impartial tribunal .....	21
Impartial tribunal .....	21
<b>Article 6 § 1 (constitutional) .....</b>	<b>21</b>
Fair hearing .....	21
<b>Article 6 § 2 .....</b>	<b>22</b>
Presumption of innocence .....	22
<b>Article 6 § 3 .....</b>	<b>22</b>
Rights of defence .....	22
<b>Article 6 § 3 (c) .....</b>	<b>22</b>
Defence through legal assistance .....	22
<b>Article 6 § 3 (d) .....</b>	<b>22</b>
Examination of witnesses .....	22
<b>ARTICLE 7 .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<i>Nullum crimen sine lege</i> .....	23
<i>Nulla poena sine lege</i> .....	23
Heavier penalty .....	23
Retroactivity .....	23
<b>ARTICLE 8 .....</b>	<b>23</b>
Respect for private and family life .....	23
Respect for private life .....	24
Respect for family life .....	25
Respect for home .....	26
Respect for correspondence .....	26
Positive obligations .....	26
Expulsion .....	27

<b>ARTICLE 9</b> .....	<b>27</b>
Freedom of thought.....	27
Freedom of conscience .....	27
Freedom of religion .....	28
Manifest religion or belief .....	28
<b>ARTICLE 10</b> .....	<b>28</b>
Freedom of expression.....	28
Freedom to impart information.....	29
Freedom to receive information.....	30
<b>ARTICLE 11</b> .....	<b>30</b>
Freedom of peaceful assembly .....	30
Freedom of association .....	31
<b>ARTICLE 12</b> .....	<b>31</b>
Right to marry .....	31
<b>ARTICLE 13</b> .....	<b>31</b>
Effective remedy.....	31
<b>ARTICLE 14</b> .....	<b>32</b>
Discrimination (Article 2).....	32
Discrimination (Article 3).....	32
Discrimination (Article 8).....	32
Discrimination (Article 9).....	33
Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1).....	33
Discrimination (Article 2 of Protocol no. 1).....	33
Discrimination (Article 3 of Protocol No. 1).....	33
<b>ARTICLE 18</b> .....	<b>34</b>
Restriction for unauthorised purposes .....	34
Limitation on use of restrictions on rights .....	34
<b>ARTICLE 33</b> .....	<b>34</b>
Inter-State application.....	34

<b>ARTICLE 34</b> .....	<b>34</b>
<i>Locus standi</i> .....	34
Victim .....	34
<b>ARTICLE 35</b> .....	<b>35</b>
<b>Article 35 § 1</b> .....	<b>35</b>
Exhaustion of domestic remedies .....	35
Effective domestic remedy – Republic of Moldova .....	35
Effective domestic remedy – Russia.....	35
Six-month period .....	35
<b>Article 35 § 3 (a)</b> .....	<b>36</b>
Manifestly ill-founded .....	36
<b>Article 35 § 3 (b)</b> .....	<b>36</b>
No significant disadvantage.....	36
<b>ARTICLE 37</b> .....	<b>36</b>
Striking out applications .....	36
Special circumstances requiring further examination.....	37
<b>ARTICLE 41</b> .....	<b>37</b>
Just satisfaction.....	37
<b>ARTICLE 46</b> .....	<b>37</b>
Pilot judgment – General measures .....	37
Execution of judgment.....	37
Execution of judgment – General measures .....	37
<b>ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</b> .....	<b>38</b>
Possessions.....	38
Peaceful enjoyment of possessions.....	38
Deprivation of property .....	39
Control of the use of property.....	39
<b>ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</b> .....	<b>39</b>
Free expression of the opinion of the people.....	39
Stand for election.....	39

<b>ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4 .....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>Article 2 § 1 .....</b>	<b>40</b>
Freedom to choose residence .....	40
<b>ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4 .....</b>	<b>40</b>
Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens .....	40
<b>ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7 .....</b>	<b>40</b>
Right not to be tried or punished twice .....	40
<b>ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12 .....</b>	<b>40</b>
General prohibition of discrimination .....	40
<b>CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER .....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE .....</b>	<b>44</b>
Andora .....	44
Armenia .....	44
Austria .....	44
Azerbaijan .....	44
Belgium .....	44
Bosnia and Herzegovina .....	44
Bulgaria .....	45
Croatia .....	45
Cyprus .....	45
Czech Republic .....	45
Denmark .....	46
Estonia .....	46
Finland .....	46
France .....	46
Georgia .....	46
Germany .....	47
Greece .....	47
Hungary .....	47
Italy .....	48
Latvia .....	48



Lithuania .....	48
Malta .....	49
Moldova (Republic of).....	49
Netherlands .....	49
Norway.....	49
Poland .....	49
Portugal.....	49
Romania.....	50
Russia.....	50
Serbia .....	51
Slovenia .....	51
Spain .....	51
Sweden.....	51
Switzerland .....	52
The former yugoslav Republic of Macedonia .....	52
Turkey.....	52
Ukraine.....	53
United Kingdom .....	54
<b>CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT .....</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>DECISIONS OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTIONS .....</b>	<b>63</b>
Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) .....	63
Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR).....	64



## CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD

### ARTICLE 1

#### Jurisdiction of States

---

Jurisdiction of Moldovan and Russian Governments in relation to person detained within separatist region of the Republic of Moldova

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016* .....no. 193

-000-

Jurisdiction of Sweden in respect of defamation proceedings brought in respect of a television programme broadcast from a foreign country

*Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016* .....no. 194

### ARTICLE 2

#### Life

---

Presidential pardon and release of convicted murderer following his transfer to Azerbaijan to serve remainder of sentence imposed in Hungary: *communicated*

*Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary, 17247/13* .....no. 193

#### Use of force

---

Unlawful killing of applicant's son by police during demonstration and ineffective investigation: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015)* .....no. 194

-000-

Killing of applicants' relatives by military forces and ineffectiveness of ensuing investigation: *violations*

*Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016* .....no. 195

#### Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

---

Patient allegedly deprived of access to appropriate emergency care as a result of a lack of coordination between departments of a public hospital: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015)* .....no. 196

-000-

Absence of State responsibility for injuries caused to holidaymaker in boating accident: <i>Article 2 applicable; no violation</i>	
<i>Cavit Tınarlıoğlu v. Turkey, 3648/04, 2 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
Lack of adequate medical care for HIV-positive detainee who died in detention and lack of effective investigation into his death: <i>violations</i>	
<i>Karpynenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
Authorities' failure to protect life of domestic-violence victim: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Civek v. Turkey, 55354/11, 23 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
Insufficient consideration given to risk of fatal injuries in context of domestic violence: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Halime Kılıç v. Turkey, 63034/11, 28 June 2016</i> .....	no. 198
Death of newborn baby denied access to adequate emergency care in a public hospital as a result of negligence and structural failings: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Aydoğdu v. Turkey, 40448/06, 30 August 2016</i> .....	no. 199
Failure by domestic authorities to inspect construction site where child subsequently died and inadequacy of judicial authorities: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Cevrioğlu v. Turkey, 69546/12, 4 October 2016</i> .....	no. 200
-000-	
Alleged failure by police to prevent mass shooting by withdrawing firearms licence: <i>com- municated</i>	
<i>Kotilainen and Others v. Finland, 62439/12</i> .....	no. 192
Authorities' failure to close airspace above military conflict zone resulting in incident with the Malaysian Airlines MH17 flight: <i>communicated</i>	
<i>Ioppa v. Ukraine, 73776/14</i> .....	no. 198
Alleged refusal of security forces to allow evacuation of wounded before shelling basement in which they had sought refuge: <i>communicated</i>	
<i>Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016</i> .....	no. 202
<b>Effective investigation</b>	
<hr/>	
Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into fatal shooting of person mistakenly identified as suspected terrorist: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Armani Da Silva v. the United Kingdom [GC], 5878/08, 30 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
-000-	
Unlawful killing of applicant's son by police during demonstration and ineffective investigation: <i>case referred to the Grand Chamber</i>	
<i>Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015)</i> .....	no. 194
-000-	
Lack of adequate medical care for HIV-positive detainee who died in detention and lack of effective investigation into his death: <i>violations</i>	
<i>Karpynenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
Killing of applicants' relatives by military forces and ineffectiveness of ensuing investi- gation: <i>violations</i>	
<i>Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016</i> .....	no. 195

- Ineffective and lengthy investigation into applicant's son's death: *violation*  
*Mučibabić v. Serbia*, 34661/07, 12 July 2016.....no. 198
- Inadequacy of expert medical reports into death of newborn baby in public hospital:  
*violation*  
*Aydoğdu v. Turkey*, 40448/06, 30 August 2016.....no. 199
- Independence and adequacy of investigation into military aircraft crash in which numerous  
spectators were killed at public air show: *no violation*  
*Mikhno v. Ukraine*, 32514/12, 1 September 2016.....no. 199
- 000-
- Alleged refusal of security forces to allow evacuation of wounded before shelling basement  
in which they had sought refuge: *communicated*  
*Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.)*, 5317/16 *et al.*, 6 December 2016.....no. 202

### Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

---

- Patient allegedly deprived of access to appropriate emergency care as a result of a lack of  
coordination between departments of a public hospital: *case referred to the Grand  
Chamber*  
*Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal*, 56080/13 (*Chamber judgment of 15 December  
2015*) .....no. 196
- 000-
- Absence of State responsibility for injuries caused to holidaymaker in boating accident:  
*Article 2 applicable; no violation*  
*Cavit Tınarlıoğlu v. Turkey*, 3648/04, 2 February 2016.....no. 193
- Excessive formalism in application of rule that accused cannot be convicted in absence  
without first being questioned: *violation*  
*Öztünç v. Turkey*, 14777/08, 9 February 2016 .....no. 193
- Failure by domestic authorities to inspect construction site where child subsequently died  
and inadequacy of judicial authorities: *violation*  
*Cevrioğlu v. Turkey*, 69546/12, 4 October 2016.....no. 200
- Delayed enforcement of sentence imposed on accused found guilty of serious assault on the  
applicant: *violation*  
*Kitanovska Stanojkovic and Others v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*,  
2319/14, 13 October 2016 .....no. 200

-000-

- Presidential pardon and release of convicted murderer following his transfer to Azerbaijan  
to serve remainder of sentence imposed in Hungary: *communicated*  
*Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary*, 17247/13.....no. 193

### Expulsion

---

- Proposed expulsion to Iran of low-profile political activist: *deportation would not constitute  
a violation*  
Proposed expulsion to Iran without adequate investigation of reality and implications of  
conversion to Christianity after arrival in Europe: *deportation would constitute a violation*  
*F.G. v. Sweden [GC]*, 43611/11, 23 March 2016.....no. 194

## ARTICLE 3

### Torture

---

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment resulting from applicant's extraordinary rendition under CIA programme: *violations*

*Nasr and Ghali v. Italy*, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

### Inhuman or degrading treatment

---

Conditions of detention and lack of medical assistance in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: *no violation; violation*

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

Failure to provide adequate medical care for minor during detention to "correct his behaviour": *violation*

*Blokhin v. Russia [GC]*, 47152/06, 23 March 2016.....no. 194

-000-

Acute mental suffering and anxiety caused by extraordinary rendition of applicant's husband under CIA programme: *violation*

*Nasr and Ghali v. Italy*, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

Failure to perform *Helicobacter pylori* test and other shortcomings in treatment of detainee's ulcer: *violation*

*Kolesnikovich v. Russia*, 44694/13, 22 March 2016.....no. 194

Shackling of pregnant woman before and after delivery; poor conditions of detention of mother and newborn; insufficient medical care to newborn in detention facility; placement of pregnant woman in metal cage during court hearings: *violations*

*Korneykova and Korneykov v. Ukraine*, 56660/12, 24 March 2016.....no. 194

Conditions of detention and of transfer of paraplegic remand prisoner: *violations*

*Topekhin v. Russia*, 78774/13, 10 May 2016.....no. 196

Excessive use of force to disperse demonstration and lack of effective investigation: *violation*

*Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey*, 37273/10 *et al.*, 24 May 2016.....no. 196

Administrative detention of minors pending expulsion: *violations*

*A.B. and Others v. France*, 11593/12, 12 July 2016

*R.K. and Others v. France*, 68264/14, 12 July 2016

*R.C. and V.C. v. France*, 76491/14, 12 July 2016

*R.M. and Others v. France*, 33201/11, 12 July 2016

*A.M. and Others v. France*, 24587/12, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

-000-

Allegations of unlawful detention and ill-treatment by authorities of so-called Lugansk and Donetsk People's Republics: *communicated*

*L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia*, 45742/15

*O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia*, 22980/16.....no. 198

### Degrading treatment

---

Limited personal space in multi-occupancy prison accommodation: *violation; no violations*

*Muršić v. Croatia [GC]*, 7334/13, 20 October 2016.....no. 200

-000-

Unsubstantiated allegations that prisoner had contracted Hepatitis C in prison and not received proper medical care: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania</i> , 55104/13, 5 January 2016.....	no. 192
Ill-treatment of lawyer representing client at police station: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Cazan v. Romania</i> , 30050/12, 5 April 2016.....	no. 195
Bodies of applicants' relatives displayed at military base for the purpose of examination by prosecutor and doctors: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Cangöz and Others v. Turkey</i> , 7469/06, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195
Structural problem resulting in detention for more than nine years in psychiatric wing of prison with no prospect of change or appropriate medical help: <i>violation</i>	
<i>W.D v. Belgium</i> , 73548/13, 6 September 2016.....	no. 199
Confinement of defendant in glass cabin during criminal trial: <i>violation; no violation</i>	
<i>Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia</i> , 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200
Failure to ensure twelve-year old child was looked after by an adult while his police were held in police custody: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania</i> , 52924/09, 6 December 2016.....	no. 202

### Inhuman or degrading punishment

---

<i>De facto</i> irreducibility of life sentence imposed on prisoner suffering from mental illness: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Murray v. the Netherlands [GC]</i> , 10511/10, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195
-000-	
Life imprisonment with automatic review after 40 years: <i>violation</i>	
<i>T.P. and A.T v. Hungary</i> , 37871/14 and 73986/14, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200

### Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

---

Unsubstantiated allegations that prisoner had contracted Hepatitis C in prison and not received proper medical care: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania</i> , 55104/13, 5 January 2016.....	no. 192
Lack of access to protection measures against domestic violence for divorced or unmarried women: <i>violation</i>	
<i>M.G. v. Turkey</i> , 646/10, 22 March 2016.....	no. 194
Obligation on prison authorities to seek independent medical advice on the appropriate treatment for a drug-addicted prisoner: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Wenner v. Germany</i> , 62303/13, 1 September 2016.....	no. 199
Failure to ensure twelve-year old child was looked after by an adult while his police were held in police custody: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania</i> , 52924/09, 6 December 2016.....	no. 202

### Effective investigation

---

Refusal to reopen criminal proceedings in respect of which Government had submitted unilateral declaration: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Jeronovičs v. Latvia [GC]</i> , 44898/10, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198

-000-

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment resulting from applicant's extraordinary rendition under CIA programme: *violations*

*Nasr and Ghali v. Italy*, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

Authorities' failure to take into account local background of racist violence when investigating assault on migrant: *violation*

*Sakir v. Greece*, 48475/09, 24 March 2016.....no. 194

Excessive use of force to disperse demonstration and lack of effective investigation: *violation*

*Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey*, 37273/10 *et al.*, 24 May 2016.....no. 196

## Expulsion

---

Proposed expulsion to Iran of low-profile political activist: *deportation would not constitute a violation*

Proposed expulsion to Iran without adequate investigation of reality and implications of conversion to Christianity after arrival in Europe: *deportation would constitute a violation*

*F.G. v. Sweden [GC]*, 43611/11, 23 March 2016.....no. 194

Proposed deportation to Iraq of family threatened by al-Qaeda: *deportation would constitute a violation*

*J.K. and Others v. Sweden [GC]*, 59166/12, 23 August 2016.....no. 199

Proposed deportation of person suffering from serious illness to his country of origin in face of doubts as to the availability of appropriate medical treatment there: *expulsion would have constituted a violation*

*Paposhvili v. Belgium [GC]*, 41738/10, 13 December 2016.....no. 202

## Extradition

---

Proposed extradition to United States where applicant faced life imprisonment without parole: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Harkins v. the United Kingdom*, 71537/14.....no. 198

-000-

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment resulting from applicant's extraordinary rendition under CIA programme: *violations*

*Nasr and Ghali v. Italy*, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

-000-

Extradition to the United States where applicant faced charges amounting to a maximum prison sentence of 247.5 years: *inadmissible*

*Findikoglu v. Germany (dec.)*, 20672/15, 7 June 2016.....no. 197

## ARTICLE 4

### Article 4 § 1

#### Positive obligations – Trafficking in human beings

---

Shortcomings in response to criminal complaint of human-trafficking: *violation*

*L.E. v. Greece*, 71545/12, 21 January 2016.....no. 192



## Article 4 § 2

### Forced labour – Compulsory labour

---

Conditions of employment of personal assistant caring for severely disabled relative:  
*inadmissible*

*Radi and Gherghina v. Romania (dec.)*, 34655/14, 5 January 2016 .....no. 192

## Article 4 § 3 (a)

### Work required of detainees

---

Continuing obligation on prisoner to work after reaching retirement age: *no violation*

*Meier v. Switzerland*, 10109/14, 9 February 2016 .....no. 193

## ARTICLE 5

### Article 5 § 1

### Liberty of person

---

Allegations of unlawful detention and ill-treatment by authorities of so-called Lugansk and Donetsk People's Republics: *communicated*

*L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia*, 45742/15

*O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia*, 22980/16.....no. 198

### Deprivation of liberty

---

Lawyer held in office in police station for less than ten minutes: *no violation*

*Cazan v. Romania*, 30050/12, 5 April 2016 .....no. 195

Five hours' detention by airport police purportedly investigating claims of ticket forgeries:  
*violation*

*Kasparov v. Russia*, 53659/07, 11 October 2016.....no. 200

### Lawful arrest or detention

---

Detention ordered by "courts" of separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: *no violation; violation*

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016 .....no. 193

-000-

Protracted detention pending deportation of alien who refused to take necessary steps to obtain travel documents required for his return: *violation*

*J.N. v. the United Kingdom*, 37289/12, 19 May 2016.....no. 196

## Article 5 § 1 (d)

### Minors

---

Placement of minor in closed boarding school owing to antisocial behaviour and risk she would engage in prostitution: *no violation*

*D.L. v. Bulgaria*, 7472/14, 19 May 2016 .....no. 196

### Educational supervision

---

Thirty-day placement of minor in detention centre for young offenders to “correct his behaviour”: *violation*

*Blokhin v. Russia [GC]*, 47152/06, 23 March 2016.....no. 194

## Article 5 § 1 (e)

### Persons of unsound mind

---

Preventive detention of mental-health patient in purpose-built centre offering appropriate medical care: *no violation*

*Bergmann v. Germany*, 23279/14, 7 January 2016 .....no. 192

Preventive detention of violent mental-health patient in purpose-built centre offering appropriate medical care: *no violation*

*Petschulies v. Germany*, 6281/13, 2 June 2016 .....no. 197

## Article 5 § 1 (f)

### Expulsion

---

Protracted detention pending deportation of alien who refused to take necessary steps to obtain travel documents required for his return: *violation*

*J.N. v. the United Kingdom*, 37289/12, 19 May 2016.....no. 196

Authorities required to examine alternative measures to administrative detention of families pending expulsion: *violations; no violations*

*A.B. and Others v. France*, 11593/12, 12 July 2016

*R.K. and Others v. France*, 68264/14, 12 July 2016

*R.C. and V.C. v. France*, 76491/14, 12 July 2016

*R.M. and Others v. France*, 33201/11, 12 July 2016

*A.M. and Others v. France*, 24587/12, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

## Article 5 § 3

### Brought promptly before judge or other officer

---

Lack of independence of military court owing to judges' appraisal system and presence of active officer on the bench: *violation*

*Kerman v. Turkey*, 35132/05, 22 November 2016.....no. 201

**Reasonableness of pre-trial detention** 

---

Absence of relevant and sufficient reasons for pre-trial detention other than reasonable suspicion of commission of an offence: *violation*

*Buzadji v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], 23755/07, 5 July 2016*.....no. 198

**Article 5 § 4****Take proceedings**

Lack of direct access to periodical judicial review of placement of endangered minor in closed boarding school: *violation*

*D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016* .....no. 196

**Review of lawfulness of detention** 

---

Lack of direct access to periodical judicial review of placement of endangered minor in closed boarding school: *violation*

*D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016* .....no. 196

Unduly limited scope of review of administrative court ruling on an appeal against administrative detention order: *violation*

*A.M. v. France, 56324/13, 12 July 2016*.....no. 198

**ARTICLE 6****Article 6 § 1 (civil)****Civil rights and obligations** 

---

Sanctions imposed on applicants on basis of UN Security Council resolution without judicial scrutiny: *violation*

*Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC], 5809/08, 21 June 2016*.....no. 197

Inability of Supreme Court President to contest premature termination of his mandate: *Article 6 applicable*

*Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016* .....no. 197

-000-

Unfairness of lustration proceedings against Constitutional Court president owing to remarks made by Prime Minister while proceedings were pending: *violation*

*Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016*.....no. 192

**Access to court** 

---

Sanctions imposed on applicants on basis of UN Security Council resolution without judicial scrutiny: *violation*

*Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC], 5809/08, 21 June 2016*.....no. 197

Inability of Supreme Court President to contest premature termination of his mandate: *violation*

*Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016* .....no. 197

Decision regarding restitution of places of worship based on “wishes of the adherents of the communities which owned the properties”: *no violation*

*Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016*.....no. 201

-000-

Supreme Court ruling that civil courts had no jurisdiction to hear pastor's claim for wrongful dismissal by church: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Károly Nagy v. Hungary, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015)* .....no. 196

Absence of universal jurisdiction of civil courts in torture cases: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Nait-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016)*.....no. 201

-000-

Waiver of right to appeal against arbitration award: *inadmissible*

*Tabbane v. Switzerland (dec.), 41069/12, 1 March 2016* .....no. 194

Absence of proper procedural safeguards in proceedings to deprive applicant suffering from mental disorders of his legal capacity: *violation*

*A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016* .....no. 196

Absence of universal jurisdiction of civil courts in torture cases: *no violation*

*Nait-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07, 21 June 2016*.....no. 197

Inadmissibility of appeal on points of law due to failure to comply with statutory requirement to formulate a “legal question” at the end of a ground of appeal: *no violation*

*Trevisanato v. Italy, 32610/07, 15 September 2016*.....no. 199

Grant of State immunity from jurisdiction in respect of claim for unfair dismissal by Embassy employee working on cultural and information matters: *inadmissible (Sweden); violation (Lithuania)*

*Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden, 26126/07, 8 November 2016* .....no. 201

## Fair hearing

---

Enforcement in Latvia of judgment delivered in Cyprus in the debtor's absence: *no violation*

*Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC], 17502/07, 23 May 2016*.....no. 196

Profound and lasting divergences in the case-law of a superior court and failure to use mechanism designed to avoid case-law conflict: *violation*

*Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016*.....no. 201

-000-

Unfairness of lustration proceedings against Constitutional Court president owing to remarks made by Prime Minister while proceedings were pending: *violation*

*Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016*.....no. 192

Detainees' inability to attend hearings in civil proceedings to which they were parties: *violation*

*Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia, 27236/05 et al., 16 February 2016*.....no. 193

Application of supervisory review procedure in applicants' civil cases following 2008 reform in conformity with legal certainty requirement: *no violation*

*Trapeznikov and Others v. Russia, 5623/09 et al., 5 April 2016* .....no. 195

Absence of proper procedural safeguards in proceedings to deprive applicant suffering from mental disorders of his legal capacity: *violation*

*A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016*.....no. 196

Failure by appellate courts to verify whether absent parties had received notification of hearing: *violation*

*Gankin and Others v. Russia, 2430/06 et al., 31 May 2016*.....no. 196

Failure of domestic authorities to thoroughly assess evidence in civil proceedings: *violation*

*Saliba v. Malta, 24221/13, 29 November 2016*.....no. 201

## Equality of arms

---

Enforcement in Latvia of judgment delivered in Cyprus in the debtor's absence: *no violation*

*Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC], 17502/07, 23 May 2016*.....no. 196

## Oral hearing

---

Lack of substantive reasons for small-claims court's refusal to hold oral hearing: *violation*

*Pönkä v. Estonia, 64160/11, 8 November 2016*.....no. 201

## Independent and impartial tribunal

---

Impartiality and independence of members of State Judicial Council in professional misconduct proceedings against a judge: *violation*

*Gerovska Popčevska v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 48783/07, 7 January 2016*.....no. 192

Alleged lack of independence and impartiality of military courts: *inadmissible*

*Mikhno v. Ukraine, 32514/12, 1 September 2016*.....no. 199

## Impartial tribunal

---

Impartiality of State Judicial Council in professional misconduct proceedings against judges: *violation*

*Jakšovski and Trifunovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 56381/09 and 58738/09, 7 January 2016* .....no. 192

Indication by judge that litigant's refusal to accept friendly settlement in domestic proceedings might adversely affect the outcome: *violation*

*Vardanyan and Nanushyan v. Armenia, 8001/07, 27 October 2016* .....no. 200

## Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

### Criminal charge

---

- Proceedings leading to minor's placement in detention centre for young offenders to "correct his behaviour": *Article 6 applicable*  
*Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016*.....no. 194
- Bus driver found guilty of causing road accident in proceedings in which he was not involved: *Article 6 applicable*  
*Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova, 25555/10, 30 August 2016*.....no. 199

### Access to court

---

- Rejection by Supreme Court of request for revision of criminal judgment following judgment of European Court finding violation of Article 6 of the Convention: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*  
*Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.), 19867/12*.....no. 192
- 000-
- Swedish courts refusal to exercise jurisdiction in respect of defamation proceedings concerning a television broadcast from a foreign country: *violation*  
*Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016*.....no. 194
- Unduly formalistic refusal to reinstate appeal proceedings lodged with wrong court by psychiatric patient: *violation*  
*Marc Brauer v. Germany, 24062/13, 1 September 2016*.....no. 199

### Fair hearing

---

- Adequate procedural safeguards in place to enable accused to understand reasons for jury's guilty verdict in assize court: *no violation*  
*Lhermitte v. Belgium [GC], 34238/09, 29 November 2016*.....no. 201
- 000-
- Manifestly unreasonable conviction of political activist and his alleged accomplice: *violation*  
*Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016*.....no. 193
- Court of Appeal's decision to overturn acquittal on the basis of its own assessment of the record of evidence that had been before the trial court: *no violation*  
*Kashlev v. Estonia, 22574/08, 26 April 2016*.....no. 195
- Decision of court of appeal to overturn applicant's acquittal without hearing oral testimony from main prosecution witnesses: *violation*  
*Lazu v. the Republic of Moldova, 46182/08, 5 July 2016*.....no. 198
- Bus driver found guilty of causing road accident in proceedings in which he was not involved: *violation*  
*Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova, 25555/10, 30 August 2016*.....no. 199
- Impact of confinement in glass cabin on the exercise of an accused's right to participate effectively in proceedings: *violation*  
*Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016*.....no. 200

**Independent and impartial tribunal**

Alleged influence of parliamentary commission of inquiry and media coverage on a criminal trial: *no violation*

*Rywin v. Poland*, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016.....no. 193

**Impartial tribunal**

Criminal trial conducted by a court where victim's mother worked as a judge: *violation*

*Mitrov v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 45959/09, 2 June 2016.....no. 197

**Article 6 § 1 (administrative)****Access to court**

Appeal dismissed by Supreme Administrative Court for lack of clear and detailed evidence that statutory conditions of admissibility were met: *no violation*

*Papaioannou v. Greece*, 18880/15, 2 June 2016.....no. 197

**Adversarial trial – Equality of arms**

Lack of access to classified information constituting decisive evidence in judicial-review proceedings: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Regner v. the Czech Republic*, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015).....no. 196

**Public hearing**

Limited scope of review by Supreme Court of Judicial Services Commission's decisions in disciplinary proceedings: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal*, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016).....no. 200

**Independent and impartial tribunal**

Limited scope of review by Supreme Court of Judicial Services Commission's decisions in disciplinary proceedings: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal*, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016).....no. 200

**Impartial tribunal**

Lack of a prosecuting party in administrative offence proceedings: *violation*

*Karelin v. Russia*, 926/08, 20 September 2016.....no. 199

Lack of impartiality, owing to statements made in earlier public report, of Court of Audit to determine balance of accounts in case concerning the *de facto* management of public funds: *violation*

*Beausoleil v. France*, 63979/11, 6 October 2016.....no. 200

**Article 6 § 1 (constitutional)****Fair hearing**

Conflicting Constitutional judgments concerning the Court's *Salduz* case-law: *no violation*

*Borg v. Malta*, 37537/13, 12 January 2016.....no. 192

## Article 6 § 2

### Presumption of innocence

---

Alleged influence of parliamentary commission of inquiry and media coverage on a criminal trial: *no violation*

*Rywin v. Poland*, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016 .....no. 193

## Article 6 § 3

### Rights of defence

---

Lack of adequate procedural guarantees in proceedings leading to minor's placement in detention centre for young offenders to "correct his behaviour": *violation*

*Blokhin v. Russia [GC]*, 47152/06, 23 March 2016.....no. 194

## Article 6 § 3 (c)

### Defence through legal assistance

---

Delayed access to a lawyer during police questioning owing to exceptionally serious and imminent threat to public safety: *violation; no violation*

*Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC]*, 50541/08 *et al.*, 13 September 2016 ....no. 199

-000-

Lack of access to a lawyer during first three days of detention: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Simeonovi v. Bulgaria*, 21980/04 (*Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015*).....no. 194

Lawyer not permitted to conduct his own defence in criminal proceedings: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Correia de Matos v. Portugal*, 56402/12 .....no. 199

-000-

Domestic law not providing for legal assistance during pre-trial investigations: *violation*

*Borg v. Malta*, 37537/13, 12 January 2016 .....no. 192

## Article 6 § 3 (d)

### Examination of witnesses

---

Conviction on basis of statement of overseas witness who could not be cross-examined: *violation*

*Paić v. Croatia*, 47082/12, 29 March 2016 .....no. 194

Admission and use of the incriminating conclusions of an absent expert: *no violation*

*Constantinides v. Greece*, 76438/12, 6 October 2016 .....no. 200



## ARTICLE 7

### *Nullum crimen sine lege*

---

Juror's committal for contempt of court for disobeying judge's instructions to jury not to conduct Internet research into case they were trying: *no violation*

*Dallas v. the United Kingdom*, 38395/12, 11 February 2016.....no. 193

### *Nulla poena sine lege*

---

Inconsistent interpretation by the domestic courts of ambiguous provision of domestic law: *violation*

*Žaja v. Croatia*, 37462/09, 4 October 2016.....no. 200

### Heavier penalty

---

Retrospective extension of preventive detention intended to secure medical and therapeutic treatment: *no violation*

*Bergmann v. Germany*, 23279/14, 7 January 2016 .....no. 192

Refusal to apply more lenient sentence existing during short interval in legislation between abolition of death penalty and ensuing amendment of the law: *no violation*

*Ruban v. Ukraine*, 8927/11, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

-000-

Increased tax liability as a result of loss of special tax status: *inadmissible*

*Société Oxygène Plus v. France (dec.)*, 76959/11, 17 May 2016.....no. 197

### Retroactivity

---

Failure to apply new reduced penalty retrospectively: *violation*

*Gouarré Patte v. Andorra*, 33427/10, 12 January 2016.....no. 192

## ARTICLE 8

### Respect for private and family life

---

Restrictions on visits by family members and on right to converse in own language in prison in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: *no violation; violation*

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

Legislation preventing health professionals assisting with home births: *no violation*

*Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic [GC]*, 28859/11 and 28473/12, 15 November 2016.....no. 201

-000-

Change of recognised paternity at request and in favour of biological father without child's consent: *no violation*

*Mandet v. France*, 30955/12, 14 January 2016.....no. 192

*De facto* discrimination against women arising out of method of calculation of invalidity benefits: *Article 8 applicable*

*Di Trizio v. Switzerland*, 7186/09, 2 February 2016.....no. 193

Court order for children's return to their father against their will: <i>violation</i> <i>N.Ts. and Others v. Georgia, 71776/12, 2 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
Religious education teacher's dismissal following withdrawal of canonical mandate: <i>no violation</i> <i>Travaš v. Croatia, 75581/13, 4 October 2016</i> .....	no. 200

## Respect for private life

---

Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: <i>case referred to the Grand Chamber</i> <i>Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016)</i> .....	no. 197
--	---------

-000-

Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: <i>no violation</i> <i>Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08, 12 January 2016</i> .....	no. 192
Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance: <i>violation</i> <i>Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary, 37138/14, 12 January 2016</i> .....	no. 192
Constitutional Court president's removal from public office as a result of lustration proceedings: <i>violation</i> <i>Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016</i> .....	no. 192
Transfer of deputy prefect to less important post on account of his religious convictions: <i>violation</i> <i>Sodan v. Turkey, 18650/05, 2 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
No award of damages against publisher for breaching injunction not to publish photographs: <i>no violation</i> <i>Kahn v. Germany, 16313/10, 17 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
Refusal to prosecute for joke made during television comedy show about homosexual celebrity referred to as a "female": <i>no violation</i> <i>Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
Inadequate investigation into racist abuse directed at woman of Roma origin: <i>violation</i> <i>R.B. v. Hungary, 64602/12, 12 April 2016</i> .....	no. 195
Failure to take into account the kind or degree of applicant's mental disorder when depriving him of his legal capacity: <i>violation</i> <i>A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196
Unjustified lack of <i>ex post facto</i> notification of temporary phone-tapping measure: <i>violation</i> <i>Cevat Özel v. Turkey, 19602/06, 7 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
Use in disciplinary proceedings of data obtained from telephone tapping in criminal proceedings: <i>violation</i> <i>Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey, 30083/10, 7 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
Loss of teaching post as a result of subsequent amendment of certificate recognising overseas diploma: <i>violation</i> <i>Şahin Kuş v. Turkey, 33160/04, 7 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
Absolute prohibition on growing a beard in prison: <i>violation</i> <i>Biržietis v. Lithuania, 49304/09, 14 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197

Use as evidence in disciplinary proceedings against a lawyer of transcript of conversation with client whose telephone was being monitored: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France</i> , 49176/11, 16 June 2016.....	no. 197
Withdrawal of citizenship following annulment of simulated marriage: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Ramadan v. Malta</i> , 76136/12, 21 June 2016.....	no. 197
Asylum-seeker living under precarious conditions for years owing to continuing failure of highest appellate authority to decide his appeal: <i>violation</i>	
<i>B.A.C. v. Greece</i> , 11981/15, 13 October 2016.....	no. 200
Unlawful surveillance of activities of social-insurance claimant by private investigators: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Vukota-Bojić v. Switzerland</i> , 61838/10, 18 October 2016.....	no. 200
Inability of man claiming to be biological father to contest paternity of child whose paternity had already been recognised by another man: <i>violation</i>	
<i>L.D. and P.K. v. Bulgaria</i> , 7949/11 and 45522/13, 8 December 2016.....	no. 202
-000-	
Dam construction threatening important archaeological site: <i>communicated</i>	
<i>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.)</i> , 6080/06, 21 June 2016.....	no. 198
Public exposure of holders of public office as collaborators of communist regime on basis of former security-service records: <i>communicated</i>	
<i>Anchev v. Bulgaria</i> , 38334/08.....	no. 202
<b>Respect for family life</b>	
Imposition of immediate custodial sentence on mother for preventing father from seeing their child: <i>no violation</i>	
<i>Mitrova and Savik v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 42534/09, 11 February 2016.....	no. 193
Placement of children for adoption on grounds of mother's poverty and refusal to undergo sterilisation: <i>violations</i>	
<i>Soares de Melo v. Portugal</i> , 72850/14, 16 February 2016.....	no. 193
Refusal to order child's return pursuant to Hague Convention in view of abducting mother's unwillingness to return with child: <i>violation</i>	
<i>K.J. v. Poland</i> , 30813/14, 1 March 2016.....	no. 194
Parental authority of father with mild intellectual disability restricted on insufficiently demonstrated grounds: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Kocherov and Sergeyeva v. Russia</i> , 16899/13, 29 March 2016.....	no. 194
Permanent exclusion order against settled migrant resulting in separation from wife and children: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Kolonja v. Greece</i> , 49441/12, 19 May 2016.....	no. 196
Inadequacy of measures taken by State to secure father's right of access to his children pursuant to court order: <i>violation</i>	
<i>Fourkiotis v. Greece</i> , 74758/11, 16 June 2016.....	no. 197

## Respect for home

---

- Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance: *violation*  
*Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary*, 37138/14, 12 January 2016.....no. 192
- Order, without proportionality assessment, for demolition of applicants' home for breach of building regulations: *demolition would constitute a violation*  
*Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria*, 46577/15, 21 April 2016.....no. 195
- Search warrant issued on strength of evidence allegedly obtained in breach of domestic and international law: *no violation*  
*K.S. and M.S. v. Germany*, 33696/11, 6 October 2016.....no. 200
- Forced eviction of Roma families and destruction of their homes with no offer of alternative accommodation: *violation*  
*Bagdonavicius and Others v. Russia*, 19841/06, 11 October 2016.....no. 200
- Lack of appropriate legal framework to protect occupant of flat from harassment by co-owners: *violation*  
*Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine*, 1870/05, 13 October 2016 .....no. 200

## Respect for correspondence

---

- Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Bărbulescu v. Romania*, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016).....no. 197
- 000-
- Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *no violation*  
*Bărbulescu v. Romania*, 61496/08, 12 January 2016.....no. 192
- Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance: *violation*  
*Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary*, 37138/14, 12 January 2016.....no. 192
- Blanket and indiscriminate surveillance of correspondence and telephone conversations for minors placed in closed boarding school: *violation*  
*D.L. v. Bulgaria*, 7472/14, 19 May 2016 .....no. 196
- Unjustified lack of *ex post facto* notification of temporary phone-tapping measure: *violation*  
*Cevat Özel v. Turkey*, 19602/06, 7 June 2016.....no. 197
- Use in disciplinary proceedings of data obtained from telephone tapping in criminal proceedings: *violation*  
*Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey*, 30083/10, 7 June 2016 .....no. 197
- Use as evidence in disciplinary proceedings against a lawyer of transcript of conversation with client whose telephone was being monitored: *no violation*  
*Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France*, 49176/11, 16 June 2016 .....no. 197

## Positive obligations

---

- Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Bărbulescu v. Romania*, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016).....no. 197

-000-

- Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *no violation*  
*Bărbulescu v. Romania*, 61496/08, 12 January 2016 .....no. 192
- Refusal to order child's return pursuant to Hague Convention in view of abducting mother's unwillingness to return with child: *violation*  
*K.J. v. Poland*, 30813/14, 1 March 2016 .....no. 194
- Refusal to prosecute for joke made during television comedy show about homosexual celebrity referred to as a "female": *no violation*  
*Sousa Goucha v. Portugal*, 70434/12, 22 March 2016 .....no. 194
- Inadequate investigation into racist abuse directed at woman of Roma origin: *violation*  
*R.B. v. Hungary*, 64602/12, 12 April 2016 .....no. 195
- Inadequacy of measures taken by State to secure father's right of access to his children pursuant to court order: *violation*  
*Fourkiotis v. Greece*, 74758/11, 16 June 2016 .....no. 197
- Lack of appropriate legal framework to protect occupant of flat from harassment by co-owners: *violation*  
*Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine*, 1870/05, 13 October 2016 .....no. 200
- Inability of man claiming to be biological father to contest paternity of child whose paternity had already been recognised by another man: *violation*  
*L.D. and P.K. v. Bulgaria*, 7949/11 and 45522/13, 8 December 2016 .....no. 202

## Expulsion

---

- Proposed deportation of person suffering from serious illness to his country of origin in face of doubts as to the availability of appropriate medical treatment there: *expulsion would have constituted a violation*  
*Paposhvili v. Belgium [GC]*, 41738/10, 13 December 2016 .....no. 202

-000-

- Asylum-seeker living under precarious conditions for years owing to continuing failure of highest appellate authority to decide his appeal: *violation*  
*B.A.C. v. Greece*, 11981/15, 13 October 2016 .....no. 200

## ARTICLE 9

### Freedom of thought

---

- Assessment of the genuineness of an objection to military service by commission composed of majority of military officers: *violation*  
*Papavasiliakis v. Greece*, 66899/14, 15 September 2016 .....no. 199

### Freedom of conscience

---

- Conscientious objection to military service not based on genuine religious convictions: *inadmissible*  
*Enver Aydemir v. Turkey*, 26012/11, 7 June 2016 .....no. 197

Assessment of the genuineness of an objection to military service by commission composed of majority of military officers: *violation*

*Papavasylakis v. Greece*, 66899/14, 15 September 2016.....no. 199

### **Freedom of religion**

---

Refusal by prison authorities in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova to allow prisoner to see pastor: *no violation; violation*

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

Refusal to provide public religious services to members of Alevi faith: *violation*

*İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC]*, 62649/10, 26 April 2016.....no. 195

-000-

Planning restrictions making it impossible for small religious community to have a place of worship: *violation*

*Association for Solidarity with Jehovah's Witnesses and Others v. Turkey*, 36915/10 and 8606/13, 24 May 2016 .....no. 196

Conscientious objection to military service not based on genuine religious convictions: *inadmissible*

*Enver Aydemir v. Turkey*, 26012/11, 7 June 2016 .....no. 197

### **Manifest religion or belief**

---

Refusal to provide public religious services to members of Alevi faith: *violation*

*İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC]*, 62649/10, 26 April 2016.....no. 195

-000-

Refusal to grant applicant leave from house arrest to attend Mass: *no violation*

*Süveges v. Hungary*, 50255/12, 5 January 2016.....no. 192

## **ARTICLE 10**

### **Freedom of expression**

---

Fine imposed on opposition MPs for showing billboards and using a megaphone during parliamentary votes: *violation*

*Karácsony and Others v. Hungary [GC]*, 42461/13 and 44357/13, 17 May 2016.....no. 196

Premature termination of Supreme Court President's mandate as a result of views expressed publicly in his professional capacity: *violation*

*Baka v. Hungary [GC]*, 20261/12, 23 June 2016 .....no. 197

-000-

NGOs liable for defamation of public servant for sending private letter of complaint to a local authority which was then published in the press: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 17224/11 (Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015) .....no. 194

-000-

Search and seizure operation conducted to identify journalistic source: *violation*

*Görmüş and Others v. Turkey*, 49085/07, 19 January 2016.....no. 192

- Civil award of damages against journalist for comments criticising quality of medical care received by Prime Minister: *violation*  
*Erdener v. Turkey*, 23497/05, 2 February 2016.....no. 193
- Objective liability of Internet portals for third-party comments: *violation*  
*Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary*, 22947/13,  
 2 February 2016.....no. 193
- Court order to black out photograph of captive and tortured person in magazine on sale: *no violation*  
*Société de Conception de Presse et d'Édition v. France*, 4683/11, 25 February 2016.....no. 193
- Detention and administrative conviction of solo demonstrators for breach of prior-notification requirement: *violation*  
*Novikova and Others v. Russia*, 25501/07 et al., 26 April 2016.....no. 195
- Criminal conviction and imposition of a fine on journalist for article mocking local government officials: *violation*  
*Ziemiński v. Poland (no. 2)*, 1799/07, 5 July 2016.....no. 198
- Failure of political party chair to prevent congress delegates from speaking in Kurdish: *Article 10 applicable; violation*  
*Semir Güzel v. Turkey*, 29483/09, 13 September 2016.....no. 199
- Dismissal of diplomats for alleging in public that a presidential election had been fraudulent: *no violation*  
*Karapetyan and Others v. Armenia*, 59001/08, 17 November 2016.....no. 201
- Conviction of journalists for satirical publication found to be insulting to regional prosecutor: *violation*  
*Grebneva and Alisimchik v. Russia*, 8918/05, 22 November 2016.....no. 201
- Seizure and confiscation for more than five years of all copies of edition of a magazine containing article on “pornography”: *violation*  
*Kaos GL v. Turkey*, 4982/07, 22 November 2016.....no. 201

-000-

- Conviction of journalist for taking weapon on board aircraft with a view to exposing security flaws: *inadmissible*  
*Erdtmann v. Germany (dec.)*, 56328/10, 5 January 2016.....no. 192
- Journalists fined for purchasing a firearm to illustrate an article they were writing on the local black market in weapons: *inadmissible*  
*Salihu and Others v. Sweden (dec.)*, 33628/15, 10 May 2016.....no. 196

### **Freedom to impart information**

---

- Conviction of a journalist for the publication of materials covered by the secrecy of a pending investigation: *no violation*  
*Bédat v. Switzerland [GC]*, 56925/08, 29 March 2016.....no. 194

-000-

- Conviction of television company for defamation for broadcasting report implicating Saudi Prince in attacks of 11 September 2001: *violation*  
*De Carolis and France Télévisions v. France*, 29313/10, 21 January 2016.....no. 192

- Objective liability of Internet portals for third-party comments: violation  
*Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary*, 22947/13,  
2 February 2016.....no. 193
- Conviction of journalist for broadcasting recording of court hearing without permission:  
*violation*  
*Pinto Coelho v. Portugal (no. 2)*, 48718/11, 22 March 2016.....no. 194

### **Freedom to receive information**

---

- Conviction of a journalist for the publication of materials covered by the secrecy of a  
pending investigation: *no violation*  
*Bédát v. Switzerland [GC]*, 56925/08, 29 March 2016.....no. 194
- Authorities' refusal to provide an NGO conducting a survey with the names of public  
defenders and the number of their appointments: *violation*  
*Magyar Helsinki Bizottság v. Hungary [GC]*, 18030/11, 8 November 2016.....no. 201

-000-

- Restrictions placed on prisoner's access to Internet sites containing legal information:  
*violation*  
*Kalda v. Estonia*, 17429/10, 19 January 2016.....no. 192
- Conviction of journalists for possessing and using radio equipment to intercept confidential  
police communications: *no violation*  
*Brambilla and Others v. Italy*, 22567/09, 23 June 2016.....no. 197

## **ARTICLE 11**

### **Freedom of peaceful assembly**

---

- Authorities' failure to communicate with the leaders of a protest demonstration in order to  
ensure its peaceful conduct: *violation*  
*Frumkin v. Russia*, 74568/12, 5 January 2016.....no. 192
- Imposition of lengthy prison sentence on a minor for taking part in and throwing stones at a  
demonstration: *violation*  
*Gülçü v. Turkey*, 17526/10, 19 January 2016.....no. 192
- Administrative conviction and detention of opposition members aimed at preventing them  
from participating in a demonstration and punishing them for their political activity:  
*violation*  
*Huseynli and Others v. Azerbaijan*, 67360/11, 67964/11 and 69379/11,  
11 February 2016.....no. 193
- Insufficient judicial scrutiny of use of force by police to disperse peaceful demonstrations:  
*violation*  
*Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey*, 37273/10 *et al.*, 24 May 2016.....no. 196
- Conviction and sentence of protester for participation in mass disorder: *violation*  
*Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia*, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016.....no. 200



**Freedom of association**

- Dissolution on grounds that it supported terrorism of a political party advocating a peaceful solution to the Kurdish problem: *violation*  
*Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey, 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016*.....no. 192
- Legally unforeseeable and thus unlawful confiscation of political party's assets: *violation*  
*Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi v. Turkey, 19920/13, 26 April 2016*.....no. 195
- Alleged breach of applicant company's negative right to freedom of association: *no violation*  
*Geotech Kancev GmbH v. Germany, 23646/09, 2 June 2016*.....no. 197
- Dissolution of association of football supporters as a result of repeated acts of violence by members resulting in supporter's death: *no violation*  
*Les Authentiks and Supras Auteuil 91 v. France, 4696/11 and 4703/11, 27 October 2016*.....no. 200
- 000-
- Alleged inability of trade union to engage in collective bargaining owing to abolition of the relevant wages council: *inadmissible*  
*Unite the Union v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 65397/13, 3 May 2016*.....no. 196

**ARTICLE 12****Right to marry**

- Undue delays in providing prisoner with divorce certificate required for remarriage: *violation*  
*Chernetskiy v. Ukraine, 44316/07, 8 December 2016*.....no. 202

**ARTICLE 13****Effective remedy**

- Lack of effective domestic remedies to complain of breach of Convention rights for person detained in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: *no violation; violation*  
*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016*.....no. 193
- Lack of suspensive effect of remedy for alleged collective expulsion: *no violation*  
*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016*.....no. 202
- 000-
- Lack of suspensive effect of remedy for collective expulsions: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015)*.....no. 193
- 000-
- Effectiveness of "Pinto" remedy for length of administrative proceedings where no application for expedited hearing was made: *violation*  
*Olivieri and Others v. Italy, 17708/12 et al., 25 February 2016*.....no. 193

No requirement under Article 13 for States to set up second level of appeal with suspensive effect in asylum cases: *no violation*

*A.M. v. the Netherlands*, 29094/09, 5 July 2016.....no. 198

-000-

Alleged inability to challenge applicants' deportation orders: *inadmissible*

*Sakkal and Fares v. Turkey (dec.)*, 52902/15, 7 June 2016.....no. 197

-000-

Alleged lack of effective remedy for holders of public office exposed as collaborators of communist regime on basis of former security-service records: *communicated*

*Anchev v. Bulgaria*, 38334/08.....no. 202

## ARTICLE 14

### Discrimination (Article 2)

---

Persistent climate of impunity in matters of domestic violence, mainly to the detriment of women: *violation*

*Halime Kılıç v. Turkey*, 63034/11, 28 June 2016.....no. 198

-000-

Presidential pardon and release of convicted murderer following his transfer to Azerbaijan to serve remainder of sentence imposed in Hungary for ethnically motivated crimes: *communicated*

*Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary*, 17247/13.....no. 193

### Discrimination (Article 3)

---

Lack of access to protection measures against domestic violence for divorced or unmarried women: *violation*

*M.G. v. Turkey*, 646/10, 22 March 2016.....no. 194

Failure to take into account possible discriminatory motives in investigation of homophobic attack: *violation*

*M.C. and A.C. v. Romania*, 12060/12, 12 April 2016.....no. 195

### Discrimination (Article 8)

---

More favourable conditions for family reunion applying to persons who had held Danish citizenship for at least 28 years: *violation*

*Biao v. Denmark [GC]*, 38590/10, 24 May 2016.....no. 196

-000-

Method of calculation of invalidity benefits which in practice was discriminatory against women: *violation*

*Di Trizio v. Switzerland*, 7186/09, 2 February 2016.....no. 193

Discrimination between unmarried same-sex couples and unmarried different-sex couples in obtaining family reunification: *violation*

*Pajić v. Croatia*, 68453/13, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

- Difference in treatment of HIV-positive aliens regarding application for residence permit and permanent ban on re-entering Russia: *violation*  
*Novruk and Others v. Russia, 31039/11 et al., 15 March 2016*.....no. 194
- Refusal to prosecute for joke made during television comedy show about homosexual celebrity referred to as a “female”: *no violation*  
*Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016*.....no. 194
- Difference in rights to retrospective survivor’s pension between same-sex couples and unmarried different-sex couples: *no violation*  
*Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016*.....no. 197
- Refusal to grant a residence permit for family reunion to a same-sex foreign partner: *violation*  
*Taddeucci and McCall v. Italy, 51362/09, 30 June 2016* .....no. 197

### Discrimination (Article 9)

---

- Difference in treatment between members of Alevi faith and citizens adhering to majority branch of Islam: *violation*  
*İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC], 62649/10, 26 April 2016*.....no. 195

### Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

---

- Difference in treatment between publicly and privately employed retirees and between various categories of civil servants as regards payment of old-age pension: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Fábián v. Hungary, 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015)* .....no. 196
- 000-
- Failure to take account of the needs of child with disabilities when determining applicant father’s eligibility for tax relief on the purchase of suitably adapted property: *violation*  
*Guberina v. Croatia, 23682/13, 22 March 2016*.....no. 194
- Difference in rights to retrospective survivor’s pension between same-sex couples and unmarried different-sex couples: *no violation*  
*Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016*.....no. 197
- Alleged discrimination of Gurkha Soldiers as regards their pension entitlement: *no violation*  
*British Gurkha Welfare Society and Others v. the United Kingdom, 44818/11, 15 September 2016*.....no. 199

### Discrimination (Article 2 of Protocol no. 1)

---

- Refusal by academy of music to enrol blind person despite her having passed competitive entrance examination: *violation*  
*Çam v. Turkey, 51500/08, 23 February 2016*.....no. 193

### Discrimination (Article 3 of Protocol No. 1)

---

- Application of 5% threshold in parliamentary elections in Lower Saxony: *no violation*  
*Partei Die Friesen v. Germany, 65480/10, 28 January 2016*.....no. 192

## ARTICLE 18

### Restriction for unauthorised purposes

---

Pre-trial detention of politician and leader of opposition party, allegedly performed only to exclude him from the political life of the country: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016)* .....no. 200

-000-

Human-rights activist arrested and detained for reasons other than those prescribed by the Convention: *violation*

*Rasul Jafarov v. Azerbaijan, 69981/14, 17 March 2016* .....no. 194

Pre-trial detention of politician and leader of opposition party, allegedly performed only to exclude him from the political life of the country: *violation*

*Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13, 14 June 2016*.....no. 197

### Limitation on use of restrictions on rights

---

Allegedly improper restriction of rights under Articles 6 and 7 of the Convention: *inadmissible*

*Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016* .....no. 193

## ARTICLE 33

### Inter-State application

---

Request for revision of Court's judgment of 18 January 1978: *questions communicated*

*Ireland v. the United Kingdom, 5310/71* .....no. 194

## ARTICLE 34

### Locus standi

---

Standing of non-governmental organisation to lodge application on behalf of deceased children: *absence of victim status*

*Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.), 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016* .....no. 198

### Victim

---

*Locus standi* of heirs to make Article 3 complaint on behalf of man who died before application to the Court was lodged: *victim status upheld*

*Boacă and Others v. Romania, 40355/11, 12 January 2016* .....no. 192

Standing of mother to make complaint under Article 3 of the Convention on behalf of her son who died while in detention

*Karpylenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016* .....no. 193

Lack of effective and sufficient redress for death of applicant's son: *victim status upheld*

*Mučibabić v. Serbia, 34661/07, 12 July 2016* .....no. 198

-000-

Standing of non-governmental organisation to lodge application on behalf of deceased children: *absence of victim status*

*Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016.....no. 198

## ARTICLE 35

### Article 35 § 1

#### Exhaustion of domestic remedies

---

Application for compensation under Law no. 1545 (1998) in Moldova not effective remedy in respect of unlawful detention in separatist region: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

-000-

Application alleging violation of Article 2 of the Convention lodged less than six months after final decision in civil proceedings but more than six months after final decision in criminal proceedings: *inadmissible*

*Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.)*, 30173/12, 28 June 2016.....no. 199

Failure to use new cassation appeal procedure in commercial proceedings introduced by Constitutional Amendment Act No. 2-FKZ: *inadmissible*

*Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.)*, 16559/16, 18 October 2016 .....no. 201

Possibility to challenge measures taken on the basis of legislative-decrees adopted under state-of-emergency regime: *inadmissible*

*Zihni v. Turkey (dec.)*, 59061/16, 29 November 2016.....no. 202

#### Effective domestic remedy – Republic of Moldova

---

Application for compensation under Law no. 1545 (1998) in Moldova not effective remedy in respect of unlawful detention in separatist region: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

#### Effective domestic remedy – Russia

---

New cassation appeal procedure in criminal proceedings introduced by Federal Law no. 433-FZ did not constitute an effective remedy requiring exhaustion: *inadmissible*

*Kashlan v. Russia (dec.)*, 60189/15, 19 April 2016.....no. 196

Failure to use new cassation appeal procedure in commercial proceedings introduced by Constitutional Amendment Act No. 2-FKZ: *inadmissible*

*Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.)*, 16559/16, 18 October 2016 .....no. 201

#### Six-month period

---

New cassation appeal procedure in criminal proceedings introduced by Federal Law no. 433-FZ did not constitute an effective remedy requiring exhaustion: *inadmissible*

*Kashlan v. Russia (dec.)*, 60189/15, 19 April 2016.....no. 196

Application alleging violation of Article 2 of the Convention lodged less than six months after final decision in civil proceedings but more than six months after final decision in criminal proceedings: *inadmissible*

*Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.)*, 30173/12, 28 June 2016.....no. 199

### Article 35 § 3 (a)

#### Manifestly ill-founded

---

Failure to provide prima facie evidence in support of complaints about destruction of property in context of armed conflict: *inadmissible*

*Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.)*, 5355/15, 5 July 2016.....no. 198

### Article 35 § 3 (b)

#### No significant disadvantage

---

Discrimination with respect to enjoyment of right to fair trial: *inadmissible*

*Kiril Zlatkov Nikolov v. France*, 70474/11 and 68038/12, 10 November 2016.....no. 201

-000-

Complaint that national courts had failed to recognise that a pupil's temporary suspension from school in breach of his procedural rights under domestic law also constituted a violation of his rights under Article 2 of Protocol No. 1: *inadmissible*

*C.P. v. the United Kingdom (dec.)*, 300/11, 6 September 2016.....no. 199

## ARTICLE 37

#### Striking out applications

---

Continuing obligation of the respondent State to investigate Article 3 complaints even following a decision striking out the complaint following a unilateral declaration

*Jeronovičs v. Latvia [GC]*, 44898/10, 5 July 2016.....no. 198

Assurance that the applicant would not be expelled on the basis of the expulsion order which was the subject of the application: *struck out*

*Khan v. Germany [GC]*, 38030/12, 21 September 2016.....no. 199

Applicants' failure to keep in touch with their lawyer: *struck out*

*V.M. and Others v. Belgium [GC]*, 60125/11, 17 November 2016.....no. 201

-000-

Exceptional circumstances justifying unilateral declaration in absence of prior attempt to reach a friendly settlement: *struck out following unilateral declaration*

*Telegraaf Media Nederland Landelijke Media B.V. and van der Graaf v. the Netherlands (dec.)*, 33847/11, 30 August 2016.....no. 199

Complaint concerning adequacy of domestic compensation scheme set up for the "erased": *struck out; pilot judgment closed*

*Anastasov and Others v. Slovenia (dec.)*, 65020/13, 18 October 2016.....no. 201

**Special circumstances requiring further examination**

Procedural issues justifying continued examination of complaint despite expiration of deportation order: *request to strike out dismissed*

*F.G. v. Sweden [GC]*, 43611/11, 23 March 2016.....no. 194

**ARTICLE 41****Just satisfaction**

Pecuniary damage incurred by the applicant shareholder as a result of the unlawful takeover of a bank

*Reisner v. Turkey (just satisfaction)*, 46815/09, 1 December 2016 .....no. 202

**ARTICLE 46****Pilot judgment – General measures**

Respondent State required to reduce number of detainees held in prison psychiatric wings without access to suitable therapeutic treatment

*W.D v. Belgium*, 73548/13, 6 September 2016.....no. 199

**Execution of judgment**

Rejection by Supreme Court of request for revision of criminal judgment following judgment of European Court finding violation of Article 6 of the Convention: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.)*, 19867/12.....no. 192

**Execution of judgment – General measures**

Respondent State required to continue to adopt measures to address structural problem relating to excessive length of pre-trial detention

*Zherebin v. Russia*, 51445/09, 24 March 2016.....no. 194

Respondent State reminded that senior officials should not be excluded from scope of judicial scrutiny of use of force by security forces

*Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey*, 37273/10 *et al.*, 24 May 2016.....no. 196

Respondent State required to identify causes of structural malfunctioning of health service, find appropriate solutions and change the rules governing forensic medical expert reports

*Aydoğdu v. Turkey*, 40448/06, 30 August 2016.....no. 199

Respondent State required to take general measures to ensure judicial impartiality in administrative-offence proceedings

*Karelin v. Russia*, 926/08, 20 September 2016.....no. 199

Respondent State required to take further measures to eliminate structural problems relating to pre-trial detention

*Ignatov v. Ukraine*, 40583/15, 15 December 2016.....no. 202

## ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

### Possessions

---

Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: *cases referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Jakeljić v. Croatia*, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016)

*Radomilja and Others v. Croatia*, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) .....no. 201

-000-

Refusal to grant compensation for accidental public-works damage to building erected without permission: *violation*

*Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey*, 22035/10, 15 November 2016.....no. 201

Payment of partial compensation rather than full expropriation value for land encumbered by material and legal restrictions owing to nearby construction of hydraulic dam: *violation*

*Kutlu and Others v. Turkey*, 51861/11, 13 December 2016.....no. 202

### Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

---

Loss of disability benefits due to newly introduced eligibility criteria: *violation*

*Bélané Nagy v. Hungary [GC]*, 53080/13, 13 December 2016.....no. 202

-000-

Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: *cases referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Jakeljić v. Croatia*, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016)

*Radomilja and Others v. Croatia*, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) .....no. 201

-000-

Five-year instalment payment plan set up to remedy delays in compensation for war-related property loss: *no violation*

*Lukats v. Romania*, 24199/07, 5 April 2016.....no. 195

Automatic forfeiture of applicant's civil-service pension following disciplinary proceedings resulting in his dismissal: *no violation*

*Philippou v. Cyprus*, 71148/10, 14 June 2016.....no. 197

Rescheduling of national debt entailing decrease in nominal value of bonds without consent of private investors: *no violation*

*Mamatas and Others v. Greece*, 63066/14, 64297/14 and 66106/14, 21 July 2016.....no. 198

Costs ordered in civil proceedings amounted to disproportionate burden: *violation*

*Cindrić and Bešlić v. Croatia*, 72152/13, 6 September 2016.....no. 199

Unreasonably high repurchase price demanded for expropriated land compared to compensation paid for the expropriation: *violation*

*Kanaginis v. Greece*, 27662/09, 27 October 2016.....no. 200

Refusal to grant compensation for accidental public-works damage to building erected without permission: *violation*

*Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey*, 22035/10, 15 November 2016.....no. 201

-000-



Inability of public servant who did not qualify for a pension to obtain reimbursement of her pension contributions: *inadmissible*

*Mauriello v. Italy (dec.)*, 14862/07, 13 September 2016.....no. 200

### Deprivation of property

---

Failure to pay interest on final instalment of compensation for expropriation despite the owner being deprived of possession after payment of the provisional instalment: *violation*

*Dökmeci v. Turkey*, 74155/14, 6 December 2016.....no. 202

### Control of the use of property

---

Order for demolition of applicants' home for breach of building regulations: *demolition would not constitute a violation*

*Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria*, 46577/15, 21 April 2016.....no. 195

Order for provisional seizure of assets in criminal proceedings without an assessment of the proportionality of the measure: *violation*

*Džinić v. Croatia*, 38359/13, 17 May 2016.....no. 196

Court order requiring copyright manager to enter into licence agreement with two radio stations and to set an equitable royalty rate: *no violation*

*SIA AKKA/LAA v. Latvia*, 562/05, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

Confiscation of revenue for period in which company continued, without requisite permits, activity affecting environment: *no violation*

*S.C. Fiercolect Impex S.R.L. v. Romania*, 26429/07, 13 December 2016.....no. 202

## ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

### Free expression of the opinion of the people

---

Refusal to terminate mandate of European Parliament members elected as a result of eligibility threshold declared unconstitutional: *inadmissible*

*Strack and Richter v. Germany (dec.)*, 28811/12 and 50303/12, 5 July 2016.....no. 199

### Stand for election

---

Removal of members of parliament from office on account of words or deeds that led to dissolution of their political party: *violation*

*Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey*, 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016.....no. 192

House arrest of candidate politician during parliamentary elections: *no violation*

*Uspaskich v. Lithuania*, 14737/08, 20 December 2016.....no. 202

## ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

### Article 2 § 1

#### Freedom to choose residence

---

Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016)* .....no. 199

-000-

Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: *no violation*

*Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09, 23 February 2016*.....no. 193

## ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

#### Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

---

Removal to Tunisia of large group of Tunisian sea-migrants after each had been identified individually and allowed to raise any personal objections: *no violation*

*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016*.....no. 202

-000-

Alleged collective expulsion of migrants to Tunisia: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015)* .....no. 193

## ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

#### Right not to be tried or punished twice

---

Parallel administrative and criminal proceedings in respect of the same conduct: *no violation*

*A and B v. Norway [GC], 24130/11 and 29758/11, 15 November 2016* .....no. 201

-000-

Revocation of firearms licence by police authority following conviction for assault: *inadmissible*

*Palmén v. Sweden (dec.), 38292/15, 22 March 2016*.....no. 195

## ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12

#### General prohibition of discrimination

---

Ineligibility of Bosniac living in the Republika Srpska to stand for election to the national presidency: *violation*

*Pilav v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 41939/07, 9 June 2016* .....no. 197

# CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERRAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER

## REFERRALS

- Bărbulescu v. Romania*, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016).....no. 197  
ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE – RESPECT FOR CORRESPONDENCE – POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS  
Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Fábián v. Hungary*, 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015).....no. 196  
ARTICLE 14: DISCRIMINATION (ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1)  
Difference in treatment between publicly and privately employed retirees and between various categories of civil servants as regards payment of old-age pension: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Garib v. the Netherlands*, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016).....no. 199  
ARTICLE 2 § 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 4: FREEDOM TO CHOOSE RESIDENCE  
Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Jakeljić v. Croatia*, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) .....no. 201  
ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1: POSSESSIONS – PEACEFUL ENJOYMENT OF POSSESSIONS  
Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: *cases referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Károly Nagy v. Hungary*, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015).....no. 196  
ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CIVIL): ACCESS TO COURT  
Supreme Court ruling that civil courts had no jurisdiction to hear pastor’s claim for wrongful dismissal by church: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Khlaifia and Others v. Italy*, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015).....no. 193  
ARTICLE 13: EFFECTIVE REMEDY  
Lack of suspensive effect of remedy for collective expulsions: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4: PROHIBITION OF COLLECTIVE EXPULSION OF ALIENS  
Alleged collective expulsion of migrants to Tunisia: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal*, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015) ...no. 196  
ARTICLE 2: POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (SUBSTANTIVE ASPECT) – POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (PROCEDURAL ASPECT)  
Patient allegedly deprived of access to appropriate emergency care as a result of a lack of coordination between departments of a public hospital: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

- Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 17224/11  
(Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015) .....no. 194  
ARTICLE 10: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION  
NGOs liable for defamation of public servant for sending private letter of complaint to a local authority which was then published in the press: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Merabishvili v. Georgia*, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016) .....no. 200  
ARTICLE 18: RESTRICTION FOR UNAUTHORISED PURPOSES  
Pre-trial detention of politician and leader of opposition party, allegedly performed only to exclude him from the political life of the country: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Nagmetov v. Russia*, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015) .....no. 194  
ARTICLE 2: USE OF FORCE – EFFECTIVE INVESTIGATION  
Unlawful killing of applicant's son by police during demonstration and ineffective investigation: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Naït-Liman v. Switzerland*, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016).....no. 201  
ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CIVIL): ACCESS TO COURT  
Absence of universal jurisdiction of civil courts in torture cases: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Radomilja and Others v. Croatia*, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) .....no. 201  
ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1: POSSESSIONS – PEACEFUL ENJOYMENT OF POSSESSIONS  
Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: *cases referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal*, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016) .....no. 200  
ARTICLE 6 § 1 (ADMINISTRATIVE): PUBLIC HEARING – INDEPENDENT AND IMPARTIAL TRIBUNAL  
Limited scope of review by Supreme Court of Judicial Services Commission's decisions in disciplinary proceedings: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Regner v. the Czech Republic*, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015).....no. 196  
ARTICLE 6 § 1 (ADMINISTRATIVE): ADVERSARIAL TRIAL – EQUALITY OF ARMS  
Lack of access to classified information constituting decisive evidence in judicial-review proceedings: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
- Simeonovi v. Bulgaria*, 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015).....no. 194  
ARTICLE 6 § 3 (C): DEFENCE THROUGH LEGAL ASSISTANCE  
Lack of access to a lawyer during first three days of detention: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

## RELINQUISHMENTS

- Correia de Matos v. Portugal*, 56402/12 .....no. 199  
ARTICLE 6 § 3 (C): DEFENCE THROUGH LEGAL ASSISTANCE  
Lawyer not permitted to conduct his own defence in criminal proceedings: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

- Harkins v. the United Kingdom*, 71537/14.....no. 198  
ARTICLE 3: EXTRADITION  
Proposed extradition to United States where applicant faced life imprisonment without parole: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*
- Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.)*, 19867/12.....no. 192  
ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CRIMINAL): ACCESS TO COURT  
ARTICLE 46: EXECUTION OF JUDGMENT  
Rejection by Supreme Court of request for revision of criminal judgment following judgment of European Court finding violation of Article 6 of the Convention: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

## CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE

### Andora

---

#### Judgments

*Gouarré Patte v. Andorra*, 33427/10, 12 January 2016 .....no. 192

### Armenia

---

#### Judgments

*Karapetyan and Others v. Armenia*, 59001/08, 17 November 2016 .....no. 201

*Vardanyan and Nanushyan v. Armenia*, 8001/07, 27 October 2016 .....no. 200

### Austria

---

#### Decisions

*Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.)*, 6080/06, 21 June 2016 .....no. 198

### Azerbaijan

---

#### Judgments

*Huseynli and Others v. Azerbaijan*, 67360/11, 67964/11 and 69379/11, 11 February 2016.....no. 193

*Rasul Jafarov v. Azerbaijan*, 69981/14, 17 March 2016 .....no. 194

#### Communicated cases

*Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary*, 17247/13.....no. 193

### Belgium

---

#### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Lhermitte v. Belgium [GC]*, 34238/09, 29 November 2016.....no. 201

*Paposhvili v. Belgium [GC]*, 41738/10, 13 December 2016 .....no. 202

*V.M. and Others v. Belgium [GC]*, 60125/11, 17 November 2016.....no. 201

#### Judgments

*W.D v. Belgium*, 73548/13, 6 September 2016.....no. 199

### Bosnia and Herzegovina

---

#### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 17224/11  
(Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015 – referral).....no. 194

#### Judgments

*Pilav v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 41939/07, 9 June 2016 .....no. 197

**Bulgaria****Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Simeonovi v. Bulgaria*, 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015 – referral) .....no. 194

**Judgments**

*D.L. v. Bulgaria*, 7472/14, 19 May 2016 .....no. 196

*Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria*, 46577/15, 21 April 2016.....no. 195

*L.D. and P.K. v. Bulgaria*, 7949/11 and 45522/13, 8 December 2016.....no. 202

**Decisions**

*Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016.....no. 198

**Communicated cases**

*Anchev v. Bulgaria*, 38334/08.....no. 202

**Croatia****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Muršić v. Croatia [GC]*, 7334/13, 20 October 2016 .....no. 200

**Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Jakeljić v. Croatia*, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral).....no. 201

*Radomilja and Others v. Croatia*, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral).....no. 201

**Judgments**

*Cindrić and Bešlić v. Croatia*, 72152/13, 6 September 2016.....no. 199

*Džinić v. Croatia*, 38359/13, 17 May 2016.....no. 196

*Guberina v. Croatia*, 23682/13, 22 March 2016.....no. 194

*Paić v. Croatia*, 47082/12, 29 March 2016 .....no. 194

*Pajić v. Croatia*, 68453/13, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

*Travaš v. Croatia*, 75581/13, 4 October 2016.....no. 200

*Žaja v. Croatia*, 37462/09, 4 October 2016.....no. 200

**Cyprus****Judgments**

*Philippou v. Cyprus*, 71148/10, 14 June 2016.....no. 197

**Czech Republic****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic [GC]*, 28859/11 and 28473/12, 15 November 2016.....no. 201

**Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Regner v. the Czech Republic*, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015 – referral).....no. 196

## Denmark

---

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Biao v. Denmark [GC]*, 38590/10, 24 May 2016.....no. 196

### Decisions

*Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.)*, 30173/12, 28 June 2016.....no. 199

## Estonia

---

### Judgments

*Kalda v. Estonia*, 17429/10, 19 January 2016.....no. 192

*Kashlev v. Estonia*, 22574/08, 26 April 2016.....no. 195

*Pönkä v. Estonia*, 64160/11, 8 November 2016.....no. 201

## Finland

---

### Communicated cases

*Kotilainen and Others v. Finland*, 62439/12 .....no. 192

## France

---

### Judgments

*A.B. and Others v. France*, 11593/12, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

*A.M. v. France*, 56324/13, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

*A.M. and Others v. France*, 24587/12, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

*Beausoleil v. France*, 63979/11, 6 October 2016 .....no. 200

*De Carolis and France Télévisions v. France*, 29313/10, 21 January 2016.....no. 192

*Kiril Zlatkov Nikolov v. France*, 70474/11 and 68038/12, 10 November 2016.....no. 201

*Les Authentiks and Supras Auteuil 91 v. France*, 4696/11 and 4703/11, 27 October 2016.....no. 200

*Mandet v. France*, 30955/12, 14 January 2016.....no. 192

*R.C. and V.C. v. France*, 76491/14, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

*R.K. and Others v. France*, 68264/14, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

*R.M. and Others v. France*, 33201/11, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

*Société de Conception de Presse et d'Édition v. France*, 4683/11, 25 February 2016.....no. 193

*Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France*, 49176/11, 16 June 2016.....no. 197

### Decisions

*Société Oxygène Plus v. France (dec.)*, 76959/11, 17 May 2016.....no. 197

## Georgia

---

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Merabishvili v. Georgia*, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016 – referral).....no. 200

### Judgments

*Merabishvili v. Georgia*, 72508/13, 14 June 2016.....no. 197

*N.Ts. and Others v. Georgia*, 71776/12, 2 February 2016 .....no. 193



**Germany****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Khan v. Germany* [GC], 38030/12, 21 September 2016.....no. 199

**Judgments**

*Bergmann v. Germany*, 23279/14, 7 January 2016.....no. 192

*Geotech Kancev GmbH v. Germany*, 23646/09, 2 June 2016.....no. 197

*K.S. and M.S. v. Germany*, 33696/11, 6 October 2016.....no. 200

*Kahn v. Germany*, 16313/10, 17 March 2016.....no. 194

*Marc Brauer v. Germany*, 24062/13, 1 September 2016.....no. 199

*Partei Die Friesen v. Germany*, 65480/10, 28 January 2016.....no. 192

*Petschulies v. Germany*, 6281/13, 2 June 2016.....no. 197

*Wenner v. Germany*, 62303/13, 1 September 2016.....no. 199

**Decisions**

*Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.)*, 6080/06, 21 June 2016.....no. 198

*Erdtmann v. Germany (dec.)*, 56328/10, 5 January 2016.....no. 192

*Findikoglu v. Germany (dec.)*, 20672/15, 7 June 2016.....no. 197

*Strack and Richter v. Germany (dec.)*, 28811/12 and 50303/12, 5 July 2016.....no. 199

**Greece****Judgments**

*B.A.C. v. Greece*, 11981/15, 13 October 2016.....no. 200

*Constantinides v. Greece*, 76438/12, 6 October 2016.....no. 200

*Fourkiotis v. Greece*, 74758/11, 16 June 2016.....no. 197

*Kanaginis v. Greece*, 27662/09, 27 October 2016.....no. 200

*Kolonja v. Greece*, 49441/12, 19 May 2016.....no. 196

*L.E. v. Greece*, 71545/12, 21 January 2016.....no. 192

*Mamatas and Others v. Greece*, 63066/14, 64297/14 and 66106/14, 21 July 2016.....no. 198

*Papaioannou v. Greece*, 18880/15, 2 June 2016.....no. 197

*Papavasilakis v. Greece*, 66899/14, 15 September 2016.....no. 199

*Sakir v. Greece*, 48475/09, 24 March 2016.....no. 194

**Hungary****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Baka v. Hungary* [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016.....no. 197

*Bélané Nagy v. Hungary* [GC], 53080/13, 13 December 2016.....no. 202

*Karácsony and Others v. Hungary* [GC], 42461/13 and 44357/13, 17 May 2016.....no. 196

*Magyar Helsinki Bizottság v. Hungary* [GC], 18030/11, 8 November 2016.....no. 201

**Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Fábián v. Hungary*, 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015 – referral).....no. 196

*Károly Nagy v. Hungary*, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015 – referral).....no. 196

### Judgments

*Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary*, 22947/13, 2 February 2016.....no. 193

*R.B. v. Hungary*, 64602/12, 12 April 2016.....no. 195

*Süveges v. Hungary*, 50255/12, 5 January 2016.....no. 192

*Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary*, 37138/14, 12 January 2016.....no. 192

*T.P. and A.T v. Hungary*, 37871/14 and 73986/14, 4 October 2016 .....no. 200

### Communicated cases

*Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary*, 17247/13.....no. 193

## Italy

---

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy [GC]*, 16483/12, 15 December 2016.....no. 202

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy*, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015 – referral).....no. 193

### Judgments

*Brambilla and Others v. Italy*, 22567/09, 23 June 2016.....no. 197

*Nasr and Ghali v. Italy*, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

*Olivieri and Others v. Italy*, 17708/12 et al., 25 February 2016 .....no. 193

*Taddeucci and McCall v. Italy*, 51362/09, 30 June 2016 .....no. 197

*Trevisanato v. Italy*, 32610/07, 15 September 2016.....no. 199

### Decisions

*Mauriello v. Italy (dec.)*, 14862/07, 13 September 2016.....no. 200

## Latvia

---

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC]*, 17502/07, 23 May 2016.....no. 196

*Jeronovičs v. Latvia [GC]*, 44898/10, 5 July 2016.....no. 198

### Judgments

*SIA AKKA/LAA v. Latvia*, 562/05, 12 July 2016.....no. 198

## Lithuania

---

### Judgments

*A.N. v. Lithuania*, 17280/08, 31 May 2016.....no. 196

*Biržietis v. Lithuania*, 49304/09, 14 June 2016 .....no. 197

*Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden*, 26126/07, 8 November 2016 .....no. 201

*Uspaskich v. Lithuania*, 14737/08, 20 December 2016 .....no. 202

**Malta****Judgments**

- Borg v. Malta*, 37537/13, 12 January 2016 .....no. 192
- Ramadan v. Malta*, 76136/12, 21 June 2016.....no. 197
- Saliba v. Malta*, 24221/13, 29 November 2016.....no. 201

**Moldova (Republic of)****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

- Buzadji v. the Republic of Moldova [GC]*, 23755/07, 5 July 2016.....no. 198
- Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]*, 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

**Judgments**

- Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova*, 25555/10, 30 August 2016.....no. 199
- Lazu v. the Republic of Moldova*, 46182/08, 5 July 2016.....no. 198

**Netherlands****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

- Murray v. the Netherlands [GC]*, 10511/10, 26 April 2016 .....no. 195

**Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

- Garib v. the Netherlands*, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016 – referral).....no. 199

**Judgments**

- A.M. v. the Netherlands*, 29094/09, 5 July 2016.....no. 198
- Garib v. the Netherlands*, 43494/09, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

**Decisions**

- Telegraaf Media Nederland Landelijke Media B.V. and van der Graaf v. the Netherlands (dec.)*, 33847/11, 30 August 2016.....no. 199

**Norway****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

- A and B v. Norway [GC]*, 24130/11 and 29758/11, 15 November 2016 .....no. 201

**Poland****Judgments**

- K.J. v. Poland*, 30813/14, 1 March 2016.....no. 194
- Rywin v. Poland*, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016.....no. 193
- Ziemiński v. Poland (no. 2)*, 1799/07, 5 July 2016.....no. 198

**Portugal****Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

- Correia de Matos v. Portugal*, 56402/12 (relinquishment).....no. 199
- Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal*, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015 – referral).....no. 196
- Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no. 2.)*, 19867/12 (relinquishment) .....no. 192

*Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral)* .....no. 200

### **Judgments**

*Pinto Coelho v. Portugal (no. 2), 48718/11, 22 March 2016* .....no. 194

*Soares de Melo v. Portugal, 72850/14, 16 February 2016*.....no. 193

*Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016*.....no. 194

## **Romania**

---

### **Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016*.....no. 201

### **Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016 – referral)* ....no. 197

### **Judgments**

*Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08, 12 January 2016* .....no. 192

*Boacă and Others v. Romania, 40355/11, 12 January 2016* .....no. 192

*Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania, 55104/13, 5 January 2016*.....no. 192

*Cazan v. Romania, 30050/12, 5 April 2016*.....no. 195

*Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania, 52924/09, 6 December 2016*.....no. 202

*Lukats v. Romania, 24199/07, 5 April 2016*.....no. 195

*M.C. and A.C. v. Romania, 12060/12, 12 April 2016*.....no. 195

*S.C. Fiercolect Impex S.R.L. v. Romania, 26429/07, 13 December 2016*.....no. 202

### **Decisions**

*Radi and Gherghina v. Romania (dec.), 34655/14, 5 January 2016* .....no. 192

## **Russia**

---

### **Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016*.....no. 194

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016*.....no. 193

### **Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015 – referral)*.....no. 194

### **Judgments**

*Bagdonavicius and Others v. Russia, 19841/06, 11 October 2016*.....no. 200

*Frumkin v. Russia, 74568/12, 5 January 2016* .....no. 192

*Gankin and Others v. Russia, 2430/06 et al., 31 May 2016*.....no. 196

*Grebneva and Alisimchik v. Russia, 8918/05, 22 November 2016* .....no. 201

*Karelin v. Russia, 926/08, 20 September 2016* .....no. 199

*Kasparov v. Russia, 53659/07, 11 October 2016*.....no. 200

*Kocherov and Sergeyeva v. Russia, 16899/13, 29 March 2016*.....no. 194

*Kolesnikovich v. Russia, 44694/13, 22 March 2016*.....no. 194

<i>Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
<i>Novikova and Others v. Russia, 25501/07 et al., 26 April 2016</i> .....	no. 195
<i>Novruk and Others v. Russia, 31039/11 et al., 15 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>Topekhin v. Russia, 78774/13, 10 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196
<i>Trapeznikov and Others v. Russia, 5623/09 et al., 5 April 2016</i> .....	no. 195
<i>Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016</i> .....	no. 200
<i>Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia, 27236/05 et al., 16 February 2016</i> .....	no. 193
<i>Zherebin v. Russia, 51445/09, 24 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194

**Decisions**

<i>Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.), 5355/15, 5 July 2016</i> .....	no. 198
<i>Kashlan v. Russia (dec.), 60189/15, 19 April 2016</i> .....	no. 196
<i>Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.), 16559/16, 18 October 2016</i> .....	no. 201

**Communicated cases**

<i>L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia, 45742/15</i> .....	no. 198
<i>O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia, 22980/16</i> .....	no. 198

**Serbia**

---

**Judgments**

<i>Mučibabić v. Serbia, 34661/07, 12 July 2016</i> .....	no. 198
--	---------

**Slovenia**

---

**Decisions**

<i>Anastasov and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 65020/13, 18 October 2016</i> .....	no. 201
---	---------

**Spain**

---

**Judgments**

<i>Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
--	---------

**Sweden**

---

**Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

<i>F.G. v. Sweden [GC], 43611/11, 23 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>J.K. and Others v. Sweden [GC], 59166/12, 23 August 2016</i> .....	no. 199

**Judgments**

<i>Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden, 26126/07, 8 November 2016</i> .....	no. 201

**Decisions**

<i>Palmén v. Sweden (dec.), 38292/15, 22 March 2016</i> .....	no. 195
<i>Salihu and Others v. Sweden (dec.), 33628/15, 10 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196

**Switzerland****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

- Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC]*, 5809/08, 21 June 2016.....no. 197
- Bédat v. Switzerland [GC]*, 56925/08, 29 March 2016 .....no. 194

**Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

- Nait-Liman v. Switzerland*, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral) .....no. 201

**Judgments**

- Di Trizio v. Switzerland*, 7186/09, 2 February 2016 .....no. 193
- Meier v. Switzerland*, 10109/14, 9 February 2016 .....no. 193
- Nait-Liman v. Switzerland*, 51357/07, 21 June 2016.....no. 197
- Vukota-Bojić v. Switzerland*, 61838/10, 18 October 2016.....no. 200

**Decisions**

- Tabbane v. Switzerland (dec.)*, 41069/12, 1 March 2016 .....no. 194

**The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia****Judgments**

- Gerovska Popčevska v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 48783/07, 7 January 2016.....no. 192
- Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 29908/11, 21 January 2016.....no. 192
- Jakšovski and Trifunovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 56381/09 and 58738/09, 7 January 2016 .....no. 192
- Kitanovska Stanojkovic and Others v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 2319/14, 13 October 2016 .....no. 200
- Mitrov v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 45959/09, 2 June 2016.....no. 197
- Mitrova and Savik v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*, 42534/09, 11 February 2016.....no. 193

**Turkey****Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

- İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC]*, 62649/10, 26 April 2016.....no. 195

**Judgments**

- Association for Solidarity with Jehovah's Witnesses and Others v. Turkey*, 36915/10 and 8606/13, 24 May 2016 .....no. 196
- Aydoğdu v. Turkey*, 40448/06, 30 August 2016.....no. 199
- Çam v. Turkey*, 51500/08, 23 February 2016.....no. 193
- Cangöz and Others v. Turkey*, 7469/06, 26 April 2016.....no. 195
- Cavit Tinarlıoğlu v. Turkey*, 3648/04, 2 February 2016.....no. 193
- Cevat Özel v. Turkey*, 19602/06, 7 June 2016.....no. 197
- Cevrioğlu v. Turkey*, 69546/12, 4 October 2016.....no. 200
- Civek v. Turkey*, 55354/11, 23 February 2016.....no. 193

<i>Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi v. Turkey</i> , 19920/13, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Dökmeci v. Turkey</i> , 74155/14, 6 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Enver Aydemir v. Turkey</i> , 26012/11, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Erdener v. Turkey</i> , 23497/05, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Görmüş and Others v. Turkey</i> , 49085/07, 19 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Gülcü v. Turkey</i> , 17526/10, 19 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Halime Kılıç v. Turkey</i> , 63034/11, 28 June 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Kaos GL v. Turkey</i> , 4982/07, 22 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey</i> , 30083/10, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey</i> , 22035/10, 15 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Kerman v. Turkey</i> , 35132/05, 22 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Kutlu and Others v. Turkey</i> , 51861/11, 13 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>M.G. v. Turkey</i> , 646/10, 22 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Öztüncü v. Turkey</i> , 14777/08, 9 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey</i> , 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Reisner v. Turkey (just satisfaction)</i> , 46815/09, 1 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Şahin Kuş v. Turkey</i> , 33160/04, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Semir Güzel v. Turkey</i> , 29483/09, 13 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Sodan v. Turkey</i> , 18650/05, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey</i> , 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016.....	no. 196

### Decisions

<i>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.)</i> , 6080/06, 21 June 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Sakkal and Fares v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 52902/15, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Zihni v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 59061/16, 29 November 2016.....	no. 202

### Communicated cases

<i>Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016.....	no. 202
---	---------

## Ukraine

---

### Judgments

<i>Chernetskiy v. Ukraine</i> , 44316/07, 8 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Ignatov v. Ukraine</i> , 40583/15, 15 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine</i> , 1870/05, 13 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Karpylenko v. Ukraine</i> , 15509/12, 11 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Korneykova and Korneykov v. Ukraine</i> , 56660/12, 24 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Mikhno v. Ukraine</i> , 32514/12, 1 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Ruban v. Ukraine</i> , 8927/11, 12 July 2016.....	no. 198

### Decisions

<i>Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.)</i> , 5355/15, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198
---	---------

**Communicated cases**

*Ioppa v. Ukraine*, 73776/14 .....no. 198  
*L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia*, 45742/15.....no. 198  
*O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia*, 22980/16.....no. 198

**United Kingdom**

---

**Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)**

*Armani Da Silva v. the United Kingdom [GC]*, 5878/08, 30 March 2016 .....no. 194  
*Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC]*, 50541/08 et al., 13 September 2016 ....no. 199

**Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)**

*Harkins v. the United Kingdom*, 71537/14 (relinquishment) .....no. 198

**Judgments**

*British Gurkha Welfare Society and Others v. the United Kingdom*, 44818/11,  
15 September 2016.....no. 199  
*Dallas v. the United Kingdom*, 38395/12, 11 February 2016.....no. 193  
*J.N. v. the United Kingdom*, 37289/12, 19 May 2016.....no. 196

**Decisions**

*C.P. v. the United Kingdom (dec.)*, 300/11, 6 September 2016 .....no. 199  
*Unite the Union v. the United Kingdom (dec.)*, 65397/13, 3 May 2016.....no. 196

**Communicated cases**

*Ireland v. the United Kingdom*, 5310/71.....no. 194



## CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT

### - A -

<i>A and B v. Norway [GC], 24130/11 and 29758/11, 15 November 2016</i> .....	no. 201
<i>A.B. and Others v. France, 11593/12, 12 July 2016</i> .....	no. 198
<i>A.M. v. France, 56324/13, 12 July 2016</i> .....	no. 198
<i>A.M. v. the Netherlands, 29094/09, 5 July 2016</i> .....	no. 198
<i>A.M. and Others v. France, 24587/12, 12 July 2016</i> .....	no. 198
<i>A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196
<i>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.), 6080/06, 21 June 2016</i> .....	no. 198
<i>Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC], 5809/08, 21 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
<i>Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
<i>Anastasov and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 65020/13, 18 October 2016</i> .....	no. 201
<i>Anchev v. Bulgaria, 38334/08 (communicated case)</i> .....	no. 202
<i>Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>Armani Da Silva v. the United Kingdom [GC], 5878/08, 30 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>Association for Solidarity with Jehovah's Witnesses and Others v. Turkey, 36915/10 and 8606/13, 24 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196
<i>Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC], 17502/07, 23 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196
<i>Aydoğdu v. Turkey, 40448/06, 30 August 2016</i> .....	no. 199

### - B -

<i>B.A.C. v. Greece, 11981/15, 13 October 2016</i> .....	no. 200
<i>Bagdonavicius and Others v. Russia, 19841/06, 11 October 2016</i> .....	no. 200
<i>Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
<i>Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016 – referral)</i> .....	no. 192 and no. 197
<i>Beausoleil v. France, 63979/11, 6 October 2016</i> .....	no. 200
<i>Bédat v. Switzerland [GC], 56925/08, 29 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>Béláné Nagy v. Hungary [GC], 53080/13, 13 December 2016</i> .....	no. 202
<i>Bergmann v. Germany, 23279/14, 7 January 2016</i> .....	no. 192
<i>Biao v. Denmark [GC], 38590/10, 24 May 2016</i> .....	no. 196
<i>Biržietis v. Lithuania, 49304/09, 14 June 2016</i> .....	no. 197
<i>Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016</i> .....	no. 194
<i>Boacă and Others v. Romania, 40355/11, 12 January 2016</i> .....	no. 192

<i>Borg v. Malta</i> , 37537/13, 12 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Brambilla and Others v. Italy</i> , 22567/09, 23 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>British Gurkha Welfare Society and Others v. the United Kingdom</i> , 44818/11, 15 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.)</i> , 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Buzadji v. the Republic of Moldova [GC]</i> , 23755/07, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198

- C -

<i>C.P. v. the United Kingdom (dec.)</i> , 300/11, 6 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Çam v. Turkey</i> , 51500/08, 23 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Cangöz and Others v. Turkey</i> , 7469/06, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania</i> , 55104/13, 5 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Cavit Tınarlıoğlu v. Turkey</i> , 3648/04, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Cazan v. Romania</i> , 30050/12, 5 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Cevat Özel v. Turkey</i> , 19602/06, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Cevrioğlu v. Turkey</i> , 69546/12, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Chernetskiy v. Ukraine</i> , 44316/07, 8 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Cindrić and Bešlić v. Croatia</i> , 72152/13, 6 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Civek v. Turkey</i> , 55354/11, 23 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Constantinides v. Greece</i> , 76438/12, 6 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Correia de Matos v. Portugal</i> , 56402/12 (relinquishment).....	no. 199
<i>Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi v. Turkey</i> , 19920/13, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195

- D -

<i>D.L. v. Bulgaria</i> , 7472/14, 19 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Dallas v. the United Kingdom</i> , 38395/12, 11 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>De Carolis and France Télévisions v. France</i> , 29313/10, 21 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Di Trizio v. Switzerland</i> , 7186/09, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Dökmeci v. Turkey</i> , 74155/14, 6 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic [GC]</i> , 28859/11 and 28473/12, 15 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Džinić v. Croatia</i> , 38359/13, 17 May 2016.....	no. 196

- E -

<i>Enver Aydemir v. Turkey</i> , 26012/11, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Erdener v. Turkey</i> , 23497/05, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Erdtmann v. Germany (dec.)</i> , 56328/10, 5 January 2016.....	no. 192

**- F -**

<i>F.G. v. Sweden [GC]</i> , 43611/11, 23 March 2016 .....	no. 194
<i>Fábián v. Hungary</i> , 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015 – referral) .....	no. 196
<i>Findikoglu v. Germany (dec.)</i> , 20672/15, 7 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Fourkiotis v. Greece</i> , 74758/11, 16 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Frumkin v. Russia</i> , 74568/12, 5 January 2016 .....	no. 192

**- G -**

<i>Gankin and Others v. Russia</i> , 2430/06 et al., 31 May 2016 .....	no. 196
<i>Garib v. the Netherlands</i> , 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016 – referral) .....	no. 193 and no. 199
<i>Geotech Kancev GmbH v. Germany</i> , 23646/09, 2 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Gerovska Popčevska v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 48783/07, 7 January 2016 .....	no. 192
<i>Görmüş and Others v. Turkey</i> , 49085/07, 19 January 2016 .....	no. 192
<i>Gouarré Patte v. Andorra</i> , 33427/10, 12 January 2016 .....	no. 192
<i>Grebneva and Alisimchik v. Russia</i> , 8918/05, 22 November 2016 .....	no. 201
<i>Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC]</i> , 76943/11, 29 November 2016 ..	no. 201
<i>Guberina v. Croatia</i> , 23682/13, 22 March 2016 .....	no. 194
<i>Gülcü v. Turkey</i> , 17526/10, 19 January 2016 .....	no. 192

**- H -**

<i>Halime Kılıç v. Turkey</i> , 63034/11, 28 June 2016 .....	no. 198
<i>Harkins v. the United Kingdom</i> , 71537/14 (relinquishment) .....	no. 198
<i>Huseynli and Others v. Azerbaijan</i> , 67360/11, 67964/11 and 69379/11, 11 February 2016 .....	no. 193

**- I -**

<i>Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC]</i> , 50541/08 et al., 13 September 2016 .....	no. 199
<i>Ignatov v. Ukraine</i> , 40583/15, 15 December 2016 .....	no. 202
<i>Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova</i> , 25555/10, 30 August 2016 .....	no. 199
<i>Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania</i> , 52924/09, 6 December 2016 .....	no. 202
<i>Ioppa v. Ukraine</i> , 73776/14 (communicated case) .....	no. 198
<i>Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine</i> , 1870/05, 13 October 2016 .....	no. 200
<i>Ireland v. the United Kingdom</i> , 5310/71 (communicated case) .....	no. 194
<i>Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria</i> , 46577/15, 21 April 2016 .....	no. 195
<i>Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 29908/11, 21 January 2016 .....	no. 192
<i>İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC]</i> , 62649/10, 26 April 2016 .....	no. 195

**- J -**

<i>J.K. and Others v. Sweden</i> [GC], 59166/12, 23 August 2016.....	no. 199
<i>J.N. v. the United Kingdom</i> , 37289/12, 19 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Jakeljić v. Croatia</i> , 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral).....	no. 201
<i>Jakšovski and Trifunovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 56381/09 and 58738/09, 7 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Jeronovičs v. Latvia</i> [GC], 44898/10, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark</i> (dec.), 30173/12, 28 June 2016.....	no. 199

**- K -**

<i>K.J. v. Poland</i> , 30813/14, 1 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>K.S. and M.S. v. Germany</i> , 33696/11, 6 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Kahn v. Germany</i> , 16313/10, 17 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Kalda v. Estonia</i> , 17429/10, 19 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Kaos GL v. Turkey</i> , 4982/07, 22 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Kanaginis v. Greece</i> , 27662/09, 27 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey</i> , 30083/10, 7 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Karácsony and Others v. Hungary</i> [GC], 42461/13 and 44357/13, 17 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Karapetyan and Others v. Armenia</i> , 59001/08, 17 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Karelin v. Russia</i> , 926/08, 20 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Károly Nagy v. Hungary</i> , 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015 – referral).....	no. 196
<i>Karpulyenko v. Ukraine</i> , 15509/12, 11 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Kashlan v. Russia</i> (dec.), 60189/15, 19 April 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Kashlev v. Estonia</i> , 22574/08, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Kasparov v. Russia</i> , 53659/07, 11 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey</i> , 22035/10, 15 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Kerman v. Turkey</i> , 35132/05, 22 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Khan v. Germany</i> [GC], 38030/12, 21 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Khlaifia and Others v. Italy</i> , 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015 – referral).....	no. 193
<i>Khlaifia and Others v. Italy</i> [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Kiril Zlatkov Nikolov v. France</i> , 70474/11 and 68038/12, 10 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Kitanovska Stanojkovic and Others v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 2319/14, 13 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Kocherov and Sergeyeva v. Russia</i> , 16899/13, 29 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Kolesnikovich v. Russia</i> , 44694/13, 22 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Kolonja v. Greece</i> , 49441/12, 19 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Korneykova and Korneykov v. Ukraine</i> , 56660/12, 24 March 2016.....	no. 194

<i>Kotilainen and Others v. Finland</i> , 62439/12 (communicated case).....	no. 192
<i>Kutlu and Others v. Turkey</i> , 51861/11, 13 December 2016.....	no. 202

- L -

<i>L.D. and P.K. v. Bulgaria</i> , 7949/11 and 45522/13, 8 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>L.E. v. Greece</i> , 71545/12, 21 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia</i> , 45742/15 (communicated case).....	no. 198
<i>Lazu v. the Republic of Moldova</i> , 46182/08, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Les Authentiks and Supras Auteuil 91 v. France</i> , 4696/11 and 4703/11, 27 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Lhermitte v. Belgium [GC]</i> , 34238/09, 29 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.)</i> , 5355/15, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal</i> , 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015 – referral).....	no. 196
<i>Lukats v. Romania</i> , 24199/07, 5 April 2016.....	no. 195

- M -

<i>M.C. and A.C. v. Romania</i> , 12060/12, 12 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>M.G. v. Turkey</i> , 646/10, 22 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Magyar Helsinki Bizottság v. Hungary [GC]</i> , 18030/11, 8 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary</i> , 22947/13, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary</i> , 17247/13 (communicated case).....	no. 193
<i>Mamatas and Others v. Greece</i> , 63066/14, 64297/14 and 66106/14, 21 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Mandet v. France</i> , 30955/12, 14 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Marc Brauer v. Germany</i> , 24062/13, 1 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Mauriello v. Italy (dec.)</i> , 14862/07, 13 September 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina</i> , 17224/11 (Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015 – referral).....	no. 194
<i>Meier v. Switzerland</i> , 10109/14, 9 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Merabishvili v. Georgia</i> , 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016 – referral).....	no. 197 and no. 200
<i>Mikhno v. Ukraine</i> , 32514/12, 1 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Mitrov v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 45959/09, 2 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Mitrova and Savik v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</i> , 42534/09, 11 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.)</i> , 19867/12 (relinquishment).....	no. 192
<i>Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC]</i> , 11138/10, 23 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Mučibabić v. Serbia</i> , 34661/07, 12 July 2016.....	no. 198

<i>Murray v. the Netherlands</i> [GC], 10511/10, 26 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Muršić v. Croatia</i> [GC], 7334/13, 20 October 2016.....	no. 200

- N -

<i>N.Ts. and Others v. Georgia</i> , 71776/12, 2 February 2016 .....	no. 193
<i>Nagmetov v. Russia</i> , 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015 – referral) .....	no. 194
<i>Naït-Liman v. Switzerland</i> , 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral).....	no. 197 and no. 201
<i>Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden</i> , 26126/07, 8 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Nasr and Ghali v. Italy</i> , 44883/09, 23 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia</i> , 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Novikova and Others v. Russia</i> , 25501/07 et al., 26 April 2016 .....	no. 195
<i>Novruk and Others v. Russia</i> , 31039/11 et al., 15 March 2016 .....	no. 194

- O -

<i>O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia</i> , 22980/16 (communicated case).....	no. 198
<i>Olivieri and Others v. Italy</i> , 17708/12 et al., 25 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Öztünç v. Turkey</i> , 14777/08, 9 February 2016.....	no. 193

- P -

<i>Paić v. Croatia</i> , 47082/12, 29 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Pajić v. Croatia</i> , 68453/13, 23 February 2016 .....	no. 193
<i>Palmén v. Sweden</i> (dec.), 38292/15, 22 March 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Papaioannou v. Greece</i> , 18880/15, 2 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Papavasilakis v. Greece</i> , 66899/14, 15 September 2016 .....	no. 199
<i>Paposhvili v. Belgium</i> [GC], 41738/10, 13 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Partei Die Friesen v. Germany</i> , 65480/10, 28 January 2016 .....	no. 192
<i>Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey</i> , 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016...no. 192	
<i>Petschulies v. Germany</i> , 6281/13, 2 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Philippou v. Cyprus</i> , 71148/10, 14 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Pilav v. Bosnia and Herzegovina</i> , 41939/07, 9 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Pinto Coelho v. Portugal</i> (no. 2), 48718/11, 22 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Pönkä v. Estonia</i> , 64160/11, 8 November 2016 .....	no. 201

- R -

<i>R.B. v. Hungary</i> , 64602/12, 12 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>R.C. and V.C. v. France</i> , 76491/14, 12 July 2016.....	no. 198

<i>R.K. and Others v. France</i> , 68264/14, 12 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>R.M. and Others v. France</i> , 33201/11, 12 July 2016 .....	no. 198
<i>Radi and Gherghina v. Romania (dec.)</i> , 34655/14, 5 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Radomilja and Others v. Croatia</i> , 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral).....	no. 201
<i>Ramadan v. Malta</i> , 76136/12, 21 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal</i> , 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral) .....	no. 200
<i>Rasul Jafarov v. Azerbaijan</i> , 69981/14, 17 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Regner v. the Czech Republic</i> , 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015 – referral).....	no. 196
<i>Reisner v. Turkey (just satisfaction)</i> , 46815/09, 1 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Ruban v. Ukraine</i> , 8927/11, 12 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Rywin v. Poland</i> , 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016 .....	no. 193

- S -

<i>S.C. Fiercolect Impex S.R.L. v. Romania</i> , 26429/07, 13 December 2016.....	no. 202
<i>Şahin Kuş v. Turkey</i> , 33160/04, 7 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.)</i> , 16559/16, 18 October 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Sakir v. Greece</i> , 48475/09, 24 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Sakkal and Fares v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 52902/15, 7 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Saliba v. Malta</i> , 24221/13, 29 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Salihu and Others v. Sweden (dec.)</i> , 33628/15, 10 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Semir Güzel v. Turkey</i> , 29483/09, 13 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>SIA AKKA/LAA v. Latvia</i> , 562/05, 12 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Simeonovi v. Bulgaria</i> , 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015 – referral) .....	no. 194
<i>Soares de Melo v. Portugal</i> , 72850/14, 16 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Société de Conception de Presse et d'Édition v. France</i> , 4683/11, 25 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Société Oxygène Plus v. France (dec.)</i> , 76959/11, 17 May 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Sodan v. Turkey</i> , 18650/05, 2 February 2016.....	no. 193
<i>Sousa Goucha v. Portugal</i> , 70434/12, 22 March 2016.....	no. 194
<i>Strack and Richter v. Germany (dec.)</i> , 28811/12 and 50303/12, 5 July 2016 .....	no. 199
<i>Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey</i> , 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Süveges v. Hungary</i> , 50255/12, 5 January 2016.....	no. 192
<i>Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary</i> , 37138/14, 12 January 2016.....	no. 192

- T -

<i>T.P. and A.T v. Hungary</i> , 37871/14 and 73986/14, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Tabbane v. Switzerland (dec.)</i> , 41069/12, 1 March 2016 .....	no. 194

<i>Taddeucci and McCall v. Italy</i> , 51362/09, 30 June 2016.....	no. 197
<i>Telegraaf Media Nederland Landelijke Media B.V. and van der Graaf v. the Netherlands (dec.)</i> , 33847/11, 30 August 2016 .....	no. 199
<i>Topekhin v. Russia</i> , 78774/13, 10 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Trapeznikov and Others v. Russia</i> , 5623/09 et al., 5 April 2016.....	no. 195
<i>Travaš v. Croatia</i> , 75581/13, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Trevisanato v. Italy</i> , 32610/07, 15 September 2016.....	no. 199

- U -

<i>Unite the Union v. the United Kingdom (dec.)</i> , 65397/13, 3 May 2016.....	no. 196
<i>Uspaskich v. Lithuania</i> , 14737/08, 20 December 2016.....	no. 202

- V -

<i>V.M. and Others v. Belgium [GC]</i> , 60125/11, 17 November 2016.....	no. 201
<i>Vardanyan and Nanushyan v. Armenia</i> , 8001/07, 27 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France</i> , 49176/11, 16 June 2016 .....	no. 197
<i>Vukota-Bojić v. Switzerland</i> , 61838/10, 18 October 2016.....	no. 200

- W -

<i>W.D v. Belgium</i> , 73548/13, 6 September 2016.....	no. 199
<i>Wenner v. Germany</i> , 62303/13, 1 September 2016.....	no. 199

- Y -

<i>Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia</i> , 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016 (communicated case).....	no. 202
<i>Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia</i> , 27236/05 et al., 16 February 2016 .....	no. 193

- Z -

<i>Žaja v. Croatia</i> , 37462/09, 4 October 2016.....	no. 200
<i>Zherebin v. Russia</i> , 51445/09, 24 March 2016 .....	no. 194
<i>Ziemiński v. Poland (no. 2)</i> , 1799/07, 5 July 2016.....	no. 198
<i>Zihni v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 59061/16, 29 November 2016.....	no. 202



## DECISIONS OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTIONS

### Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU)

---

- Aleksei Petruhhin, C-182/15, 6 September 2016*.....no. 199  
Assessment of risk of inhuman or degrading treatment where non-EU State requests extradition of EU citizen
- David L. Parris v. Trinity College Dublin e.a., C-443/15, 24 November 2016*.....no. 201  
Partner of retired employee not entitled to survivor's benefits where domestic law did not allow civil partnerships for same-sex couples at relevant time: no discrimination found
- J.N. v. Staatssecretaris van Veiligheid en Justitie, C-601/15 PPU, 15 February 2016*.....no. 193  
Detention of asylum-seeker on grounds of national security or public order
- JZ v. Prokuratura Rejonowa Łódź-Śródmieście, C-294/16 PPU, 28 July 2016*.....no. 198  
No deprivation of liberty for a nine hour overnight daily curfew monitored by means of an electronic tag
- Maria do Céu Bragança Linares Verruga and Others v. Ministre de l'Enseignement supérieur et de la Recherche, C-238/15, 14 December 2016*.....no. 202  
Eligibility of non-resident students for financial aid dependent on parent's having worked in aid-providing member State for a continuous period of at least five years
- Nabiel Peter Bogendorff von Wolffersdorff v. Standesamt der Stadt Karlsruhe and Zentraler Juristischer Dienst der Stadt Karlsruhe, C-438/14, 2 June 2016* .....no. 197  
Refusal to recognise name indicative of noble origins chosen in another Member State for personal reasons
- Pál Aranyosi and Robert Căldăraru, joined cases C-404/15 and C-659/15 PPU, 5 April 2016*.....no. 195  
Procedure for dealing with execution of European Arrest Warrant in case of actual risk of inhuman or degrading conditions of detention in issuing State
- Piotr Kossowski, C-486/14, 29 June 2016*.....no. 197  
Fresh proceedings may be brought against a suspect in a Schengen State where previous criminal proceedings in another Schengen State were terminated without a detailed investigation
- Tele2 Sverige AB v Post- och telestyrelsen and Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Tom Watson and Others, C-203/15 and C-698/15, 21 December 2016*.....no. 202  
Incompatibility with EU law of national legislation imposing general obligation on providers of electronic communications services to retain data

## Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR)

---

- Chinchilla Sandoval v. Guatemala, Series C No. 312, 29 February 2016*.....no. 201  
Right to life and personal integrity of prisoners
- Duque v. Colombia, Series C No. 310, 26 February 2016*.....no. 199  
Equality before the law and non-discrimination in the access to a pension for same-sex couples
- Flor Freire v. Ecuador, Series C No. 315, 31 August 2016*.....no. 202  
Discrimination based on perceived sexual orientation in military disciplinary proceedings
- Gonzales Lluy et al v. Ecuador, Series C No. 298, 1 September 2015*.....no. 192  
Rights to life, personal integrity, education and non-discrimination of a child living with HIV
- Case of Kaliña and Lokono Peoples v. Suriname, Series C No. 309, 23 November 2015*.....no. 198  
Protection of the environment and natural resources vis-à-vis the rights of indigenous peoples
- López Lone et al. v. Honduras, Series C No. 302, 5 October 2015*.....no. 193  
Rights of judges vis-à-vis their removal or dismissal for actions against a *coup d'état*
- Maldonado Ordoñez v. Guatemala, Series C No. 311, 3 May 2016*.....no. 200  
Fair trial guarantees in disciplinary proceedings
- Punta Piedra Garifuna Community v. Honduras, Series C No. 304, 8 October 2015*.....no. 195  
Obligation to guarantee the effective use and enjoyment of the collective territory of indigenous and tribal Peoples through title clearing
- Quispialaya Vilcapoma v. Peru, Series C No. 308, 23 November 2015*.....no. 197  
Ill-treatment during military service and ineffective investigation
- Ruano Torres et al. v. El Salvador, Series C No. 303, 5 October 2015*.....no. 194  
Presumption of innocence and defence through public legal counsel
- Velásquez Paiz et al. v. Guatemala, Series C No. 307, 19 November 2015*.....no. 196  
Duty to protect with strict due diligence in cases of violence against women