

2019

INDEX

to the Information Notes  
on the Court's case-law



Index of the Court's case-law summarised  
in the Information Notes during 2019

European Court of Human Rights

The Information Note contains legal summaries of the cases examined during the month in question which the Registry considers to be of particular interest. The summaries are drafted by lawyers under the authority of the Jurisconsult and are not binding on the Court. They are normally drafted in the language of the case concerned. The translation of the legal summaries into the other official language can be accessed directly through hyperlinks in the Note. These hyperlinks lead to the HUDOC database, which is regularly updated with new translations.

An annual index provides an overview of all the cases summarised in each calendar year. To facilitate access to materials in the Information Notes, a running cumulative index will be updated online with each new edition of the Note. The cases summarised in the Information Notes are indexed by Convention Article, keyword, applicant name and respondent State. The Index also contains a list of cases which have been referred to or relinquished in favour of the Grand Chamber, and a list of cases from other European and international jurisdictions summarised in the Information Notes.

The electronic versions of the Note (in PDF, EPUB and MOBI formats) and the index may be downloaded at [www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en](http://www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en). Legal summaries published in the Case-law Information Notes are also available in HUDOC under the filter and links "Legal Summaries".

The HUDOC database is available free-of-charge through the Court's Internet site (<http://hudoc.echr.coe.int>). It provides access to the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber, Chamber and Committee judgments and decisions, communicated cases, advisory opinions and legal summaries from the Case-Law Information Note) and of the former European Commission of Human Rights (decisions and reports), and to the resolutions of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.

European Court of Human Rights  
Council of Europe  
67075 Strasbourg Cedex  
France  
Tel: +33 (0)3 88 41 20 18 / Fax: +33 (0)3 88 41 27 30  
[publishing@echr.coe.int](mailto:publishing@echr.coe.int)  
[www.echr.coe.int](http://www.echr.coe.int)  
[https://twitter.com/ECHR\\_CEDH](https://twitter.com/ECHR_CEDH)  
RSS feeds

Photograph: Council of Europe  
Cover: interior of the Human Rights Building (Architects: Richard Rogers Partnership and Atelier Claude Bucher)

© Council of Europe / European Court of Human Rights, 2019

# Table of contents

---

## CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD

### ARTICLE 1

Responsibility of States.....	9
Jurisdiction of States .....	9

### ARTICLE 2

Life.....	9
Positive obligations (substantive aspect).....	10
Effective investigation.....	11
Positive obligations (procedural aspect).....	11

### ARTICLE 3

Inhuman or degrading treatment.....	12
Inhuman treatment.....	12
Degrading treatment.....	13
Inhuman or degrading punishment.....	13
Positive obligations (substantive aspect).....	13
Effective investigation.....	14
Positive obligations (procedural aspect).....	14
Expulsion.....	14

### ARTICLE 4

#### Article 4 § 1

Trafficking in human beings – Effective investigation .....	15
---	----

#### Article 4 § 2

Forced labour.....	15
--------------------	----

### ARTICLE 5

#### Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty.....	15
Procedure prescribed by law .....	15
Lawful arrest or detention.....	15
Positive obligations .....	16

#### Article 5 § 1 (c)

Reasonable suspicion .....	16
----------------------------	----

#### Article 5 § 1 (e)

Persons of unsound mind .....	16
-------------------------------	----

#### Article 5 § 4

Review of lawfulness of detention.....	16
Speediness of review.....	17

#### Article 5 § 5

Compensation.....	17
-------------------	----

## **ARTICLE 6**

### **Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Access to court .....	17
Oral hearing.....	18
Independent and impartial tribunal.....	18
Impartial tribunal .....	18
Tribunal established by law .....	18

### **Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing .....	18
Impartial tribunal .....	19
Tribunal established by law .....	19

### **Article 6 § 1 (administrative)**

Civil rights and obligations.....	19
Access to court .....	19
Fair hearing .....	20
Impartial tribunal .....	20

### **Article 6 § 1 (constitutional)**

Tribunal established by law .....	20
-----------------------------------	----

### **Article 6 § 1 (disciplinary)**

Criminal charge .....	20
Fair hearing .....	20

### **Article 6 § 2**

Presumption of innocence.....	20
-------------------------------	----

### **Article 6 § 3 (b)**

Preparation of defence – Adequate time – Access to relevant files.....	21
Adequate facilities.....	21

### **Article 6 § 3 (c)**

Defence through legal assistance.....	21
---------------------------------------	----

### **Article 6 § 3 (d)**

Examination of witnesses .....	21
--------------------------------	----

### **Article 6 § 3 (e)**

Free assistance of interpreter .....	22
--------------------------------------	----

## **ARTICLE 7**

Nullum crimen sine lege.....	22
Nulla poena sine lege .....	22

## **ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private and family life.....	22
Respect for private life .....	23
Respect for family life .....	26
Respect for home .....	27
Respect for correspondence .....	27
Positive obligations .....	27
Expulsion.....	28

<b>ARTICLE 9</b>		
	Freedom of conscience.....	28
	Freedom of religion.....	28
<b>ARTICLE 10</b>		
	Freedom of expression.....	28
	Freedom to receive information.....	30
	Freedom to impart information.....	30
	Positive obligations .....	30
<b>ARTICLE 11</b>		
	Freedom of peaceful assembly.....	30
	Freedom of association.....	30
<b>ARTICLE 12</b>		
	Right to marry.....	31
<b>ARTICLE 13</b>		
	Effective remedy .....	31
<b>ARTICLE 14</b>		
	Discrimination (Article 3).....	31
	Discrimination (Article 6).....	32
	Discrimination (Article 8).....	32
	Discrimination (Article 10).....	33
	Discrimination (Article 11).....	33
	Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1).....	33
<b>ARTICLE 15</b>		
	Derogation in time of emergency .....	33
	Extent strictly required by situation .....	33
<b>ARTICLE 17</b>		
	Prohibition of abuse of rights.....	34
<b>ARTICLE 18</b>		
	Restriction for unauthorised purposes .....	34
<b>ARTICLE 33</b>		
	Inter-State application.....	34
<b>ARTICLE 34</b>		
	Victim .....	34
	Locus standi.....	35
	Hinder the exercise of the right of application.....	35
<b>ARTICLE 35</b>		
<b>Article 35 § 1</b>		
	Exhaustion of domestic remedies.....	35
	Effective domestic remedy – Austria .....	36
	Effective domestic remedy – Croatia .....	36
	Effective domestic remedy – France .....	36
	Effective domestic remedy – Hungary .....	36

Effective domestic remedy – Republic of Moldova .....	36
Effective domestic remedy – Romania.....	37
Effective domestic remedy – Ukraine .....	37
Six-month period.....	37
<b>ARTICLE 37</b>	
Striking out applications.....	37
<b>ARTICLE 41</b>	
Just satisfaction .....	37
<b>ARTICLE 46</b>	
<b>Article 46 § 2</b>	
Execution of judgment – General measures.....	38
Execution of judgment – Individual measures.....	38
<b>Article 46 § 4</b>	
Infringement proceedings .....	38
<b>ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</b>	
Peaceful enjoyment of possessions .....	38
Control of the use of property.....	39
Deprivation of property – Public interest .....	39
Positive obligations .....	39
<b>ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</b>	
Right to education .....	39
Respect for parents’ religious convictions.....	40
Respect for parents’ philosophical convictions .....	40
<b>ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</b>	
Free expression of the opinion of the people.....	40
Stand for election.....	40
<b>ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 7</b>	
Procedural safeguards relating to expulsion of aliens .....	41
<b>ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7</b>	
Right not to be tried or punished twice.....	41
<b>ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12</b>	
General prohibition of discrimination.....	41
<b>PROTOCOL No. 16</b>	
Advisory opinions.....	42
<b>CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERRAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER</b>	
Referrals .....	43
Relinquishments.....	44

## CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE

Armenia.....	45
Austria.....	45
Azerbaijan.....	45
Belgium.....	45
Bosnia and Herzegovina.....	46
Bulgaria.....	46
Croatia.....	46
Cyprus.....	47
Czech Republic.....	47
Denmark.....	47
Finland.....	47
France.....	47
Georgia.....	48
Germany.....	48
Greece.....	48
Hungary.....	49
Iceland.....	49
Ireland.....	49
Italy.....	50
Latvia.....	50
Lithuania.....	50
Malta.....	50
Republic of Moldova.....	50
North Macedonia.....	50
Norway.....	51
Poland.....	51
Portugal.....	51
Romania.....	51
Russia.....	52
San Marino.....	53
Serbia.....	53
Slovakia.....	53
Slovenia.....	53
Spain.....	53
Sweden.....	54
Switzerland.....	54
Turkey.....	54
Ukraine.....	55
United Kingdom.....	56

## CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT

A.....	57
B.....	57
C.....	58
D.....	58
E.....	58
F.....	58
G.....	58
H.....	59

I.....	59
J.....	59
K.....	59
L.....	60
M.....	60
N.....	60
O.....	61
P.....	61
R.....	61
S.....	61
T.....	62
U.....	62
V.....	62
W.....	63
X.....	63
Y.....	63
Z.....	63

## **DECISIONS OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTIONS**

European Committee of Social Rights.....	64
Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU).....	64
Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR).....	68
United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC).....	68
United Nations Human Rights Committee (CCPR).....	69



## CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD

### ARTICLE 1

#### Responsibility of States

Jurisdiction as regards the death of civilians in Afghanistan following airstrike under NATO operational command: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Hanan v. Germany, 4871/16* ..... no. 232 | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

State's responsibility for alleged denial of access to court by the Court of Justice of the EFTA States: *inadmissible*

*Konkurrenten.no AS v. Norway (dec.), 47341/15, 5 November 2019* ..... no. 234 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

#### Jurisdiction of States

Jurisdiction of Turkey in respect of Article 2 procedural obligation arising following murders occurring in the Cypriot-Government controlled area of Cyprus

*Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], 36925/07, 29 January 2019* ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Belgian jurisdiction arising out of the refusal to execute a European arrest warrant, thus impeding a murder investigation in Spain

*Romeo Castaño v. Belgium, 8351/17, 9 July 2019* ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Jurisdiction in a case of alleged cross-border violations by alleged State agents operating on another State's territory

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia, 75734/12 et al., 19 November 2019* ..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Jurisdiction as regards the death of civilians in Afghanistan following airstrike under NATO operational command: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Hanan v. Germany, 4871/16* ..... no. 232 | [Legal summary](#)

### ARTICLE 2

#### Life

Suicide of a mentally ill man voluntarily admitted to State psychiatric hospital for treatment after suicide attempt: *no violation*

*Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal [GC], 78103/14, 31 January 2019* ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Sufficiency of preventive measures in light of no discernible risk of child's murder at school by father accused of domestic violence and barred from home: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Kurt v. Austria, 62903/15 (Chamber judgment of 4 July 2019)*..... [no. 234](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Death in pre-trial detention following delays in providing emergency medical care and failure to conduct adequate and timely investigation: *violation*

*Magnitskiy and Others v. Russia, 32631/09 and 53799/12, 27 August 2019*..... [no. 232](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged flaw in the legal safeguards on euthanasia: *communicated*

*Mortier v. Belgium, 78017/17*..... [no. 225](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged responsibility of Russia in the downing of a plane over eastern Ukraine and alleged lack of effective investigation: *communicated*

*Ayley and Others v. Russia, 25714/16 and 56328/18*..... [no. 228](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Suicide of a mentally ill man voluntarily admitted to State psychiatric hospital for treatment after suicide attempt: *no violation*

*Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal [GC], 78103/14, 31 January 2019*..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Sufficiency of preventive measures in light of no discernible risk of child's murder at school by father accused of domestic violence and barred from home: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Kurt v. Austria, 62903/15 (Chamber judgment of 4 July 2019)*.. [no. 234](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Sufficiency of preventive measures in light of no discernible risk of child's murder at school by father accused of domestic violence and barred from home: *no violation*

*Kurt v. Austria, 62903/15, 4 July 2019*..... [no. 231](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Death in pre-trial detention following delays in providing emergency medical care and failure to conduct adequate and timely investigation: *violation*

*Magnitskiy and Others v. Russia, 32631/09 and 53799/12, 27 August 2019*..... [no. 232](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Inadequate response of domestic authorities in a case of kidnapping and prolonged abduction: *violation*

*Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland, 20147/15, 5 September 2019*..... [no. 232](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged flaw in the legal safeguards on euthanasia: *communicated*

*Mortier v. Belgium, 78017/17*..... [no. 225](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Effective investigation

Cyprus' refusal to waive its criminal jurisdiction in favour of the "TRNC" courts: *no violation*

Failure of Turkey to cooperate with Cyprus in murder investigation: *violation*

*Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], 36925/07,*

*29 January 2019*..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into road-traffic accident in which an individual sustained unintentional life-threatening injuries: *Article 2 applicable; no violation*

*Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC], 41720/13,*

*25 June 2019*..... [no. 230](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Refusal to execute a European arrest warrant, thus impeding a murder investigation in Spain, on the grounds of an insufficiently substantiated risk of poor conditions of detention: *violation*

*Romeo Castaño v. Belgium, 8351/17, 9 July 2019*..... [no. 231](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Manifest disproportion between seriousness of act committed by State agents and punishment imposed: *violation*

*Vazagashvili and Shanava v. Georgia, 50375/07,*

*18 July 2019*..... [no. 231](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Death in pre-trial detention following delays in providing emergency medical care and failure to conduct adequate and timely investigation: *violation*

*Magnitskiy and Others v. Russia, 32631/09 and 53799/12,*

*27 August 2019*..... [no. 232](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Circumstances of kidnapping and death unclear seventeen years after events: *violation*

*Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland, 20147/15,*

*5 September 2019*..... [no. 232](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged flaw in the legal safeguards on euthanasia: *communicated*

*Mortier v. Belgium, 78017/17*..... [no. 225](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged responsibility of Russia in the downing of a plane over eastern Ukraine and alleged lack of effective investigation: *communicated*

*Ayley and Others v. Russia, 25714/16 and 56328/18*..... [no. 228](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Cyprus' refusal to waive its criminal jurisdiction in favour of the "TRNC" courts: *no violation*

Failure of Turkey to cooperate with Cyprus in murder investigation: *violation*

*Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], 36925/07,*

*29 January 2019*..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 3

### Inhuman or degrading treatment

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into road-traffic accident in which an individual sustained unintentional life-threatening injuries: *Article 3 not applicable*

*Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC], 41720/13, 25 June 2019* ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Presidential clemency only possibility for mitigating life sentences and shortage of tuberculosis medication: *violations*

*Petukhov v. Ukraine (no. 2), 41216/13, 12 March 2019* ..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conditions of transport of prisoners: *violation*

*Tomov and Others v. Russia, 18255/10 et al., 9 April 2019* ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Injuries sustained by protesters as a result of action to remove them from construction site without use of riot-control equipment: *no violation*

*Chernega and Others v. Ukraine, 74768/10, 18 June 2019* ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Forcible catheterisation to obtain evidence of traffic offence: *violation*

*R.S. v. Hungary, 65290/14, 2 July 2019* ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure of authorities to take adequate measures to protect victim of domestic violence: *violation*

*Volodina v. Russia, 41261/17, 9 July 2019* ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Nine-year-old child subjected to witnessing violent arrest of her father who put up no resistance: *violation*

*A v. Russia, 37735/09, 12 November 2019* ..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Search of grounds around the home of a pregnant women, allegedly causing a premature birth: *inadmissible*

*Rashkovi v. Bulgaria (dec.), 52257/09, 11 December 2018* ..... no. 225 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged failure of State to address bullying at school of child with mental disorder: *communicated*

*M.C. and Others v. Romania, 44654/18* ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Use of surgical symphysiotomy in Irish maternity hospitals: *communicated*

*L.F. v. Ireland, 62007/17* ..... no. 228 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Informal prisoner hierarchy allegedly tolerated by prison management: *communicated*

*A.S. and Others v. Russia, 45049/17* ..... no. 230 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Inhuman treatment

Detainee's injury due to inadequate conditions of transportation: *violation*

*Ilgiz Khalikov v. Russia, 48724/15, 15 January 2019* ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Degrading treatment

Obligation of means in overcoming a linguistic obstacle to treatment of the mental disorders suffered by an individual in compulsory confinement: *violation; no violation*

*Rooman v. Belgium [GC], 18052/11, 31 January 2019*..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conditions of confinement in transit zone: *no violation*

*Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC], 47287/15,*

*21 November 2019*..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conditions in which asylum-seekers were held in airport transit zone: *violation*

*Z.A. and Others v. Russia [GC], 61411/15 et al.,*

*21 November 2019*..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Precarious living conditions of unaccompanied foreign minor in a shantytown and failure to execute judicial placement order: *violation*

*Khan v. France, 12267/16, 28 February 2019* ..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of a minimum service to ensure that prisoners' basic needs were met during a strike by prison wardens: *violation*

*Clasens v. Belgium, 26564/16, 28 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Inhuman or degrading punishment

Presidential clemency only possibility for mitigating life sentences and shortage of tuberculosis medication: *violations*

*Petukhov v. Ukraine (no. 2), 41216/13, 12 March 2019*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Reducibility of a whole-life prison sentence imposed for leadership of a Mafia organisation depended on cooperation with the police: *violation*

*Marcello Viola v. Italy (no. 2), 77633/16, 13 June 2019*..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage found not to be corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria, 22457/16 (Chamber judgment of*

*17 January 2019)* ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage not corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *no violation*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria, 22457/16, 17 January 2019*..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Nine-year-old child subjected to witnessing violent arrest of her father who put up no resistance: *violation*

*A v. Russia, 37735/09, 12 November 2019* ..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Effective investigation

Lack of an investigation into allegations of ill-treatment by the police during the questioning of a person in a state of shock: *violation*

*Knox v. Italy*, 76577/13, 24 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Insufficient investigation into credible allegations of police ill-treatment: *violation*

*A v. Russia*, 37735/09, 12 November 2019..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Search of grounds around the home of a pregnant women, allegedly causing a premature birth: *inadmissible*

*Rashkovi v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 52257/09, 11 December 2018..... no. 225 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage found not to be corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16 (Chamber judgment of 17 January 2019)..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Authorities not relieved from duty to investigate inter-prisoner violence despite absence of criminal complaint: *violation*

*Gjini v. Serbia*, 1128/16, 15 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage not corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *no violation*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16, 17 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure of authorities to take adequate measures to protect victim of domestic violence: *violation*

*Volodina v. Russia*, 41261/17, 9 July 2019..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Respondent States' failure to investigate allegations of cross-border abduction and ill-treatment involving State agents: *violation*

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia*, 75734/12 *et al.*, 19 November 2019..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Expulsion

Respondent State's failure to assess the risk of denial of access to asylum proceedings in a presumed safe third country, including *refoulement*: *violation*

*Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC]*, 47287/15, 21 November 2019 ..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Proposed deportation of person suffering from serious mental illness without assurances from his State of origin as to the availability of supervision to accompany intensive outpatient therapy: *expulsion would constitute a violation*

*Savran v. Denmark*, 57467/15, 1 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 4

### Article 4 § 1

#### Trafficking in human beings – Effective investigation

Failure by the authorities, among other things, to conduct an effective investigation into the issuing of visas by public officials, which allegedly enabled human trafficking: *violation*  
*T.I. and Others v. Greece*, 40311/10, 18 July 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Article 4 § 2

#### Forced labour

Penalty of community work for administrative offence: *communicated*  
*Tiunov v. Russia*, 29442/18..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 5

### Article 5 § 1

#### Deprivation of liberty

*De facto* confinement lasting twenty-three days in land border transit zone: *inadmissible*  
*Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary* [GC], 47287/15,  
21 November 2019 ..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Asylum-seekers held for lengthy periods in airport transit zone: *violation*  
*Z.A. and Others v. Russia* [GC], 61411/15 *et al.*,  
21 November 2019..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Eight-year-old child alone left for over twenty-four hours in a police station without being reported to the child welfare authorities: *Article 5 § 1 applicable; violation*  
*Tarak and Depe v. Turkey*, 70472/12, 9 April 2019..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

#### Procedure prescribed by law

Pre-trial detention of a judge without prior lifting of immunity, on the basis of an unreasonable extension of the concept of *in flagrante delicto*: *violation*  
*Alparslan Altan v. Turkey*, 12778/17, 16 April 2019 ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

#### Lawful arrest or detention

Alteration of anticipated release date by procedure found to be in breach of Article 6: *no violation*  
*Kereselidze v. Georgia*, 39718/09, 28 March 2019..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

No criminal-process reasons for house arrest: *violation*  
*Navalnyy v. Russia (no. 2)*, 43734/14, 9 April 2019 ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Pre-trial detention of a judge without prior lifting of immunity, on the basis of an unreasonable extension of the concept of *in flagrante delicto*: *violation*

*Alparslan Altan v. Turkey*, 12778/17, 16 April 2019 ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Pre-trial detention in absence of court order: *violation*

*Mityanin and Leonov v. Russia*, 11436/06 and 22912/06,  
7 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Extra-legal transfer of persons to their State of origin, circumventing domestic and international law: *violation*

*Ozdil and Others v. the Republic of Moldova*, 42305/18,  
11 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure to obtain external expert report when reviewing necessity of continuing safe custody in deadlock situation: *violation*

*Tim Henrik Bruun Hansen v. Denmark*, 51072/15, 9 July 2019.....no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations

Respondent States' failure to investigate allegations of cross-border abduction and ill-treatment involving State agents: *violation*

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia*,  
75734/12 *et al.*, 19 November 2019..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 5 § 1 (c)

### Reasonable suspicion

Detention based on mere suspicion of membership of an illegal organisation, without any specific incriminating evidence: *violation*

*Alparslan Altan v. Turkey*, 12778/17, 16 April 2019 ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Suspicion of attempting to overthrow the public powers based on the mere exercise of Convention rights or normal activism on the part of a human-rights defender: *violation*

*Kavala v. Turkey*, 28749/18, 10 December 2019..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 5 § 1 (e)

### Persons of unsound mind

Obligation of means in overcoming a linguistic obstacle to treatment of the mental disorders suffered by an individual in compulsory confinement: *violation; no violation*

*Rooman v. Belgium [GC]*, 18052/11, 31 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 5 § 4

### Review of lawfulness of detention

Review mechanism wholly ineffective in a case of unlawful detention, in the immigration context, of a mother and her minor children: *violation*

*G.B. and Others v. Turkey*, 4633/15, 17 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)



## Speediness of review

Automatic review of immigration detention not held within seven working days as required by domestic law: *no violation*

*Aboya Boa Jean v. Malta*, 62676/16, 2 April 2019..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Review mechanism wholly ineffective in a case of unlawful detention, in the immigration context, of a mother and her minor children: *violation*

*G.B. and Others v. Turkey*, 4633/15, 17 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Long period that could not be adequately justified by the Constitutional Court's exceptional workload following the state of emergency: *violation*

*Kavala v. Turkey*, 28749/18, 10 December 2019..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 5 § 5

### Compensation

Pre-trial detention in inappropriate premises compensated for by way of reduced sentence: *inadmissible*

*Porchet v. Switzerland (dec.)*, 36391/16, 8 October 2019 ..... no. 234 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 6

### Article 6 § 1 (civil)

#### Access to court

Jurisdiction of Moldovan and Russian Governments in relation to person detained within Immunity from jurisdiction of a foreign State in a labour dispute, under a strict interpretation of the notions of waiver and residence: *no violation*

*Ndayegamiye-Mporamazina v. Switzerland*, 16874/12,  
5 February 2019 ..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of direct access to a court for person deprived of legal capacity with no corresponding safeguards: *violation*

*Nikolyan v. Armenia*, 74438/14, 3 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Retroactive reimbursement denied to taxpayers who had not challenged a social contribution before it was declared unconstitutional: *inadmissible*

*Frantzeskaki and Others v. Greece (dec.)*, 57275/17 et al.,  
12 February 2019..... no. 227 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of genuine and serious dispute over establishment of statutory grounds for disbarment mandatory under domestic law and not amenable to appeal: *Article 6 not applicable; inadmissible*

*Yankov v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 44768/10, 18 June 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Oral hearing

Proceedings brought by prison authorities, requesting presence of official during prisoner's consultations with lawyer, held without oral hearing or seeking submissions: *violation*

*Altay v. Turkey (no. 2), 11236/09, 9 April 2019*..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Independent and impartial tribunal

Alleged bias of judges at three levels of jurisdiction in dispute regarding ownership of a television station: *no violation*

*Rustavi 2 Broadcasting Company Ltd and Others v. Georgia, 16812/17, 18 July 2019*..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Impartial tribunal

Court considering bankruptcy proceedings housed in debtor's former building: *violation*

*Cosmos Maritime Trading and Shipping Agency v. Ukraine, 53427/09, 27 June 2019*..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Social network "friendship" between member of child-welfare administrative authority and opposing party in decision-making process: *communicated*

*Chaves Fernandes Figueiredo v. Switzerland, 55603/18*.... no. 232 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Tribunal established by law

Alleged unlawfulness of decision of President of the Court of Trusts to refer case to panel of two judges: *no violation*

*Pasquini v. San Marino, 50956/16, 2 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

### Fair hearing

Alleged shortcomings in review of fine imposed in absentia on defence counsel by trial court: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Gestur Jónsson and Ragnar Halldór Hall v. Iceland, 68273/14 and 68271/14 (Chamber judgment of 30 October 2018)*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Adequate safeguards in respect of hearsay evidence in competition law proceedings: *no violation*

*SA-Capital Oy v. Finland, 5556/10, 14 February 2019*..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alteration of anticipated release date by procedure found to be in breach of Article 6: *no violation*

*Kereselidze v. Georgia, 39718/09, 28 March 2019*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of procedure in administrative offence cases for detainees to request to be brought to hearings: *violation*

*Chernega and Others v. Ukraine, 74768/10, 18 June 2019*..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Acquittal overturned by Supreme Court without rehearing oral testimony it had disregarded as unreliable: *violation*

*Júlíus Þór Sigurbórsson v. Iceland, 38797/17, 16 July 2019*..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conviction by substitute judge based on transcripts of oral evidence without hearing witnesses in person: *violation*

*Svanidze v. Georgia, 37809/08, 25 July 2019*..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Posthumous conviction for tax fraud: *violation*

*Magnitskiy and Others v. Russia, 32631/09 and 53799/12, 27 August 2019*..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conviction based to a decisive degree on statements by accomplice arising from plea-bargaining arrangement, without adequate scrutiny thereof: *violation*

*Adamčo v. Slovakia, 45084/14, 12 November 2019*..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Co-defendant admitted as witness against the accused after conviction in disjoined plea-bargaining procedure without prior adversarial scrutiny: *violation*

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia, 75734/12 et al., 19 November 2019*..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Impartial tribunal

Alleged lack of impartiality by judge at third instance due to marriage to first-instance judge: *no violation*

*Pastörs v. Germany, 55225/14, 3 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Tribunal established by law

Appointment of judges in flagrant breach of domestic law, as a result of undue discretion exercised by the executive: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland, 26374/18 (Chamber judgment of 12 March 2019)*..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Appointment of judges in flagrant breach of domestic law, as a result of undue discretion exercised by the executive: *violation*

*Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland, 26374/18, 12 March 2019*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 6 § 1 (administrative)

### Civil rights and obligations

Contradictory court judgments on applications seeking the closure of a rival commercial structure: *Article 6 applicable; violation*

*Sine Tsaggarakis A.E.E. v. Greece, 17257/13, 23 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Access to court

Retroactive reimbursement denied to taxpayers who had not challenged a social contribution before it was declared unconstitutional: *inadmissible*

*Frantzeskaki and Others v. Greece (dec.), 57275/17 et al., 12 February 2019*..... no. 227 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Locus standi* denied to applicant by the Court of Justice of the EFTA States: *inadmissible*

*Konkurrenten.no AS v. Norway (dec.), 47341/15, 5 November 2019*..... no. 234 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Law empowering Ministry of Justice to dismiss court presidents before expiry of their term of office, unconditionally and without proper reasoning or any right of appeal: *communicated*

*Broda and Bojara v. Poland, 26691/18 and 27367/18... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary*

## Fair hearing

Contradictory court judgments on applications seeking the closure of a rival commercial structure: *Article 6 applicable; violation*

*Sine Tsaggarakis A.E.E. v. Greece, 17257/13, 23 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary*

## Impartial tribunal

Social network "friendship" between member of child-welfare administrative authority and opposing party in decision-making process: *communicated*

*Chaves Fernandes Figueiredo v. Switzerland, 55603/18.... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary*

## Article 6 § 1 (constitutional)

### Tribunal established by law

Constitutional Court bench including judge allegedly elected unlawfully: *communicated*

*Xero Flor w Polsce sp. z o.o. v. Poland, 4907/18..... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary*

## Article 6 § 1 (disciplinary)

### Criminal charge

Civil fine imposed on the surviving company in respect of an infringement committed by its merged subsidiary, in the context of business continued by the parent: *inadmissible*

*Carrefour France v. France (dec.), 37858/14, 1 October 2019.... no. 233 | Decision | Legal summary*

### Fair hearing

Civil fine imposed on the surviving company in respect of an infringement committed by its merged subsidiary, in the context of business continued by the parent: *inadmissible*

*Carrefour France v. France (dec.), 37858/14, 1 October 2019.... no. 233 | Decision | Legal summary*

## Article 6 § 2

### Presumption of innocence

Finding of guilt for repeat offence while appeal against original offence still pending: *violation*

*Kangers v. Latvia, 35726/10, 14 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary*

Effective civil remedy in domestic law for violation of presumption of innocence: *inadmissible*

*Januškevičienė v. Lithuania, 69717/14, 3 September 2019..... no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary*

Applicability of Article 6 § 2 in the absence of "criminal charge" in circumstances where authorities had disseminated a manipulated audio recording before arrest: *Article 6 applicable; violation*

*Batiashvili v. Georgia, 8284/07, 10 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary*

-000-

Compensation claims under legislation for victims of terrorism refused on the basis that deceased had been members of ETA: *inadmissible*

*Larrañaga Arando and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 73911/16 and 79503/16,  
25 June 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)  
*Martínez Agirre and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 75529/16 et al.,  
25 June 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Civil fine imposed on the surviving company in respect of an infringement committed by its merged subsidiary, in the context of business continued by the parent: *inadmissible*

*Carrefour France v. France (dec.)*, 37858/14, 1 October 2019.... no. 233 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 6 § 3 (b)

### Preparation of defence – Adequate time – Access to relevant files

Defence afforded sufficient time to acquaint itself with mass of telecommunication-surveillance data and electronic files: *no violation*

*Rook v. Germany*, 1586/15, 25 July 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Adequate facilities

Defence denied access to mass of data and involvement in its electronic sifting by prosecution when gathering relevant information for investigation: *no violation*

*Sigurður Einarsson and Others v. Iceland*, 39757/15,  
4 June 2019 ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Unnecessary confinement of accused in glass cabin at court hearings that lasted a number of months: *violation*

Applicant's ineffective participation in his trial due to excessively intensive court hearing schedule coupled with lengthy prison transfers: *violation*

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia*,  
75734/12 et al., 19 November 2019 ..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 6 § 3 (c)

### Defence through legal assistance

Use in evidence of a malicious accusation, made to the police by a person in a state of shock, without access to a lawyer: *violation*

*Knox v. Italy*, 76577/13, 24 January 2019 ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Police interviews held without physical presence of lawyer, counterbalanced by important safeguards at trial: *no violation*

*Doyle v. Ireland*, 51979/17, 23 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 6 § 3 (d)

### Examination of witnesses

Inability to cross-examine witnesses during re-trial: *inadmissible*

*Famulyak v. Ukraine (dec.)*, 30180/11, 2 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Article 6 § 3 (e)

### Free assistance of interpreter

Interpreter having acted as a mediator and with a motherly attitude during the questioning of a person in a state of shock: *violation*

*Knox v. Italy*, 76577/13, 24 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 7

### *Nullum crimen sine lege*

Alleged unforeseeability of fine imposed by trial court on “defence counsel” and its amount: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Gestur Jónsson and Ragnar Halldór Hall v. Iceland*, 68273/14 and 68271/14 (Chamber judgment of 30 October 2018) ..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Conviction for 1950s genocide of Lithuanian partisans following Supreme Court clarification of domestic case-law: *no violation*

*Drėlingas v. Lithuania*, 28859/16, 12 March 2019 ..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Expansive judicial interpretation inconsistent with domestic case-law and essence of offence as defined by law: *violation*

*Parmak and Bakır v. Turkey*, 22429/07 and 25195/07, 3 December 2019..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### *Nulla poena sine lege*

Alleged unforeseeability of fine imposed by trial court on “defence counsel” and its amount: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Gestur Jónsson and Ragnar Halldór Hall v. Iceland*, 68273/14 and 68271/14 (Chamber judgment of 30 October 2018) ..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Revocation of licence to act in bankruptcy proceedings resulting from criminal conviction for violent behaviour: *no violation*

*Rola v. Slovenia*, 12096/14 and 39335/16, 4 June 2019 ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 8

### Respect for private and family life

Compulsory vaccinations of children and consequences of non-vaccination: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Vavříčka and Others v. the Czech Republic*, 47621/13 et al..... no. 235 | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Extra-legal transfer of persons to their State of origin, circumventing domestic and international law: *violation*

*Ozdil and Others v. the Republic of Moldova*, 42305/18,  
11 June 2019..... [no. 230](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to change surname on the sole grounds that the new name requested is not Turkish: *violation*

*Aktaş and Aslaniskender v. Turkey*, 18684/07 and 21101/07,  
25 June 2019..... [no. 230](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Refusal to allow a deceased man's sperm to be exported at the request of a parent wishing to become a grandparent or continue the family line: *inadmissible*

*Petithory Lanzmann v. France (dec.)*, 23038/19,  
12 November 2019..... [no. 235](#) | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

A person euthanised without her children being informed: *communicated*

*Mortier v. Belgium*, 78017/17..... [no. 225](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Female to male transsexual registered under former female forename and as child's mother in birth register: *communicated*

*O.H. and G.H. v. Germany*, 53568/18 and 54741/18..... [no. 226](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to issue birth certificate indicating both child's parents as her mothers in case of adoption by biological mother's partner in same-sex couple: *communicated*

*S.W. and Others v. Austria*, 1928/19..... [no. 226](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal by the authorities to authorise transfer abroad of gametes from the applicant's partner for *post mortem* insemination: *communicated*

*Dalleau v. France*, 57307/18..... [no. 230](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Intended mother legally prevented from adopting or obtaining visiting rights *vis-à-vis* child born through a gestational surrogacy arrangement abroad: *communicated*

*A.M. v. Norway*, 30254/18..... [no. 232](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged lack of investigations into online harassment against a woman, including dissemination of intimate photographs: *communicated*

*Volodina v. Russia*, 40419/19..... [no. 233](#) | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Respect for private life

Advisory opinion concerning the recognition in domestic law of a legal parent-child relationship between a child born through a gestational surrogacy arrangement abroad and the intended mother

*Advisory opinion requested by the French Court of Cassation [GC]*,  
P16-2018-001, 10 April 2019..... [no. 228](#) | [Opinion](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into road-traffic accident in which an individual sustained unintentional life-threatening injuries: *Article 8 not applicable*

*Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC]*, 41720/13,  
25 June 2019..... [no. 230](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Covert video-surveillance of supermarket cashiers and sales assistants by employer: *no violation*  
*López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC], 1874/13 and 8567/13,*  
17 October 2019 ..... [no. 233](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Convention compliance of secret surveillance regime including the bulk interception of external communications: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom, 58170/13 et al.*  
(*Chamber judgment of 13 September 2018*) ..... [no. 226](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage found not to be corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*X and Others v. Bulgaria, 22457/16 (Chamber judgment of*  
17 January 2019) ..... [no. 230](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Failure to effectively investigate serious interferences into well-known journalist's private life: *violations*  
*Khadija Ismayilova v. Azerbaijan, 65286/13 and 57270/14,*  
10 January 2019 ..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage not corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *no violation*  
*X and Others v. Bulgaria, 22457/16, 17 January 2019* ..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Retention of peaceful campaigner's data on police database: *violation*  
*Catt v. the United Kingdom, 43514/15, 24 January 2019* ..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of reaction to air pollution by a steelworks, to the detriment of the surrounding population's health: *violation*  
*Cordella and Others v. Italy, 54414/13 and 54264/15,*  
24 January 2019 ..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Order to provide genetic sample in context of paternity proceedings: *no violation*  
*Mifsud v. Malta, 62257/15, 29 January 2019* ..... [no. 225](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Power of border control officials to stop and question without suspicion or access to lawyer: *violation*  
*Beghal v. the United Kingdom, 4755/16, 28 February 2019* .... [no. 226](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Internet news portal found not liable for sexist remarks posted on its site by anonymous third parties: *no violation*  
*Høiness v. Norway, 43624/14, 19 March 2019* ..... [no. 227](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Official present during consultations between prisoner and his lawyer: *violation*  
*Altay v. Turkey (no. 2), 11236/09, 9 April 2019* ..... [no. 228](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Newspaper article disseminating photograph of suspect along with statement accusing him of criminal conduct: *no violation*  
*Mityanin and Leonov v. Russia, 11436/06 and 22912/06,*  
7 May 2019 ..... [no. 229](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)



Refusal to register a change in a candidate's self-declared ethnicity in a period of election, with no foreseeable legal basis: *violation*

*Tasev v. North Macedonia, 9825/13, 16 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to appoint a teacher to a post abroad because his wife wore a headscarf: *violation*

*Yilmaz v. Turkey, 36607/06, 4 June 2019* ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Domestic law lacking safeguards against abuse with respect to permanent video surveillance of detainees in their cells: *violation*

*Gorlov and Others v. Russia, 27057/06 et al., 2 July 2019* ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Domestic courts' failure to conduct comprehensive assessment in defamation claim: *violation*

*Lewit v. Austria, 4782/18, 10 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

No possibility of tailor-made response in deprivation of legal capacity proceedings: *violation*

*Nikolyan v. Armenia, 74438/14, 3 October 2019* ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Excessively broad scope and restrictive character of "cleansing" measures affecting civil servants of the Yanukovych regime (2010-14) and the Communist regime: *Article 8 applicable; violation*

*Polyakh and Others v. Ukraine, 58812/15 et al., 17 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Inability for opioid addicts to obtain methadone or buprenorphine replacement therapy: *no violation*

*Abdyusheva and Others v. Russia, 58502/11 et al., 26 November 2019*..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Exclusion for eight years of long-term migrant following criminal conviction for serious crime: *no violation*

*Zakharchuk v. Russia, 2967/12, 17 December 2019*..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Dam construction threatening important archaeological site: *inadmissible*

*Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 6080/06, 29 January 2019*..... no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged failures of public authorities in respect of applicants' homes water-supply contamination caused by their private developers: *inadmissible*

*Tolić and Others v. Croatia (dec.), 13482/15 et al., 4 June 2019*...no. 230 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of access to a private cinema for a disabled person wishing to see a film not being shown in cinemas with disabled access: *Article 8 not applicable; inadmissible*

*Glaisen v. Switzerland (dec.), 40477/13, 25 June 2019*..... no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Photograph published in lifestyle magazine with erroneous caption, identifying applicant as someone else: *Article 8 inapplicable; inadmissible*

*Vučina v. Croatia (dec.), 58955/13, 31 October 2019* ..... no. 233 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

LGBT rights film screening interrupted by group shouting homophobic abuse: *communicated*

*Association ACCEPT and Others v. Romania, 19237/16*... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Interview with minor broadcast without prior parental consent: *communicated*

*I.V.Ț. v. Romania, 35582/15*. ..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Disclosure of the private email correspondence of two civil servants following management checks concerning the applicant's correspondent: *communicated*

*Kılıçoğlu v. Turkey, 38861/09*..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Use of surgical symphysiotomy in Irish maternity hospitals: *communicated*

*L.F. v. Ireland, 62007/17*, ..... no. 228 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged lack of legal basis for the withdrawal of the right to drive motor vehicles: *communicated*

*S.R. v. Norway, 43927/17*..... no. 228 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to allow a homosexual prisoner to have conjugal visits: *communicated*

*Duță v. Romania, 8783/15* ..... no. 231 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Respect for family life

Shortcomings in decision-making process resulting in adoption of vulnerable child by foster parents: *violation*

*Strand Lobben and Others v. Norway [GC], 37283/13, 10 September 2019*..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Denial of family reunion to beneficiary of temporary protection: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*M.A. v. Denmark, 6697/18*..... no. 234 | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Temporary placement in children's home due to parents' refusal to send children to school: *no violation*

*Wunderlich v. Germany, 18925/15, 10 January 2019*..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Applicant excluded from his granddaughter's life after her adoption: *violation*

*Bogonosovy v. Russia, 38201/16, 5 March 2019*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Transfer of child back to biological parents after nine years in care of foster mother: *no violation*

Foster mother and children denied access to child following his transfer to biological parents after nine years in foster care: *violation*

*V.D. and Others v. Russia, 72931/10, 9 April 2019*..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to allow a prisoner convicted of terrorist offences to leave prison under escort to pay her respects to her late father: *no violation*

*Guimon v. France, 48798/14, 11 April 2019*..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Restrictions on the length and conditions of family visits to a person held in detention in a remand prison: *violation*

*Chaldayev v. Russia, 33172/16, 28 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Pre-adoption foster placement of child despite father's acquittal for domestic violence and his regained custody of the child's elder brothers: *violation*

*Haddad v. Spain, 16572/17, 18 June 2019*..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Widow denied access to her children by relatives-in-law in defiance of court orders and later arbitrarily deprived of parental authority: *violation*

*Zelikha Magomadova v. Russia, 58724/14, 8 October 2019*... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Respect for home

Inspection by planning officials of partially furnished residential premises, without prior consent from the occupier or judicial authorisation: *violation*

*Halabi v. France*, 66554/14, 16 May 2019..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged failures of public authorities in respect of applicants' homes water-supply contamination caused by their private developers: *inadmissible*

*Tolić and Others v. Croatia (dec.)*, 13482/15 *et al.*, 4 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Respect for correspondence

Proportionality and safeguards of Swedish legislation on signals intelligence: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Centrum för rättvisa v. Sweden*, 35252/08 (*Chamber judgment of 19 June 2018*)..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Disclosure of the private email correspondence of two civil servants following management checks concerning the applicant's correspondent: *communicated*

*Kılıçoğlu v. Turkey*, 38861/09..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage found not to be corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16 (*Chamber judgment of 17 January 2019*)..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Covert video-surveillance of supermarket cashiers and sales assistants by employer: *no violation*

*López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC]*, 1874/13 and 8567/13, 17 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Failure to effectively investigate serious interferences into well-known journalist's private life: *violations*

*Khadija Ismayilova v. Azerbaijan*, 65286/13 and 57270/14, 10 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage not corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *no violation*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16, 17 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Pre-adoption foster placement of child despite father's acquittal for domestic violence and his regained custody of the child's elder brothers: *violation*

*Haddad v. Spain*, 16572/17, 18 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to change surname on the sole grounds that the new name requested is not Turkish: *violation*

*Aktaş and Aslaniskender v. Turkey*, 18684/07 and 21101/07, 25 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Domestic courts' failure to conduct comprehensive assessment in defamation claim: *violation*  
*Lewit v. Austria, 4782/18, 10 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Widow denied access to her children by relatives-in-law in defiance of court orders and later arbitrarily deprived of parental authority: *violation*  
*Zelikha Magomadova v. Russia, 58724/14, 8 October 2019* ... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged failures of public authorities in respect of applicants' homes water-supply contamination caused by their private developers: *inadmissible*  
*Tolić and Others v. Croatia (dec.), 13482/15 et al., 4 June 2019*..... no. 230 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged lack of investigations into online harassment against a woman, including dissemination of intimate photographs: *communicated*  
*Volodina v. Russia, 40419/19*..... no. 233 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Expulsion

Review of proportionality overly superficial in the expulsion of a convicted person who had become an invalid dependent on his children: *expulsion would constitute a violation*  
*I.M. v. Switzerland, 23887/16, 9 April 2019*..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Exclusion for eight years of long-term migrant following criminal conviction for serious crime: *no violation*  
*Zakharchuk v. Russia, 2967/12, 17 December 2019*..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Deprivation of citizenship and expulsion of dual national convicted of having joined Islamic State's ranks with terrorist objectives: *communicated*  
*Johansen v. Denmark, 27801/19*..... no. 234 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 9

### Freedom of conscience

Compulsory vaccinations of children and consequences of non-vaccination: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*  
*Vavříčka and Others v. the Czech Republic, 47621/13 et al.*..... no. 235 | [Legal summary](#)

### Freedom of religion

Criminal conviction for subjecting children to purportedly excessive religious practices: *communicated*  
*Cupiał v. Poland, 67414/11*..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 10

### Freedom of expression

Defamation for referring to commercial dispute of candidate in parliamentary elections: *no violation*  
*Prunea v. Romania, 47881/11, 8 January 2019* ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Prolonging of numerous sets of criminal proceedings against a newspaper proprietor, subsequently acquitted, for publishing statements by terrorist organisations: *violation*  
*Ali Gürbüz v. Turkey, 52497/08 et al., 12 March 2019*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Ban on access to means of communication during house arrest without connection to requirements of criminal investigation: *violation*  
*Navalnyy v. Russia (no. 2), 43734/14, 9 April 2019* ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Criminal conviction of member of parliament for statements made in Parliament found to constitute Holocaust denial: *inadmissible*  
*Pastörs v. Germany, 55225/14, 3 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failures in examination of civil defamation case brought by administrative entity in reaction to criticism about works on historical monument: *violation*  
*Margulev v. Russia, 15449/09, 8 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Journalist denied access to conduct interviews about living conditions in reception centre for asylum-seekers: *violation*  
*Szurovecz v. Hungary, 15428/16, 8 October 2019* ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Criminal conviction for publishing an article criticising Islam: *violation*  
*Tagiyev and Huseynov v. Azerbaijan, 13274/08, 5 December 2019*..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Football player's conviction of minor offence for provocative chanting of an official greeting of a fascist movement and totalitarian regime: *inadmissible*  
*Šimunić v. Croatia (dec.), 20373/17, 22 January 2019*..... no. 225 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Finding by authorities of omission which upset requisite balance in information presented by television programme, and suggested means of restoring balance: *inadmissible*  
*Schweizerische Radio- und Fernsehgesellschaft and Others v. Switzerland (dec.), 68995/13, 12 November 2019*..... no. 235 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Lifting of immunity of an MP allegedly on the basis of her political opinions: *communicated*  
*Kerestecioğlu Demir v. Turkey, 68136/16*..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conviction for glorifying crime in slogans printed on a T-shirt worn by a three-year old at nursery school: *communicated*  
*Z.B. v. France, 46883/15*..... no. 230 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Television station fined for broadcasting Hungarian programme without being translated into or subtitled in Slovak in breach of domestic law: *communicated*  
*Július Pereszlényi-Servis TV-Video v. Slovakia, 25175/15*..... no. 231 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Dismissal of an Education Ministry employee for posting "likes" on offensive contents in an online social network: *communicated*  
*Melike v. Turkey, 35786/19*..... no. 235 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Freedom to receive information

Alleged shortcomings in public information about environmental hazards and related judicial scrutiny: *communicated*

*Association Burestop 55 and Others v. France*,  
56176/18 *et al.*..... no. 235 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Freedom to impart information

Criminal proceedings against the management of a newspaper for having published statements by the leader of a terrorist organisation containing an implied threat of a resumption of violence: *no violation*

*Gürbüz and Bayar v. Turkey*, 8860/13, 23 July 2019..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Journalist denied access to conduct interviews about living conditions in reception centre for asylum-seekers: *violation*

*Szurovecz v. Hungary*, 15428/16, 8 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations

Failure to protect journalist's freedom of expression: *violation*

*Khadija Ismayilova v. Azerbaijan*, 65286/13 and 57270/14,  
10 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

# ARTICLE 11

## Freedom of peaceful assembly

Courts' failure to take into account confusion engendered by involvement of private security agents when convicting protesters of disobeying police orders: *violation*

State's failure to ensure peaceful nature of protests through lack of clear rules on division of responsibility between police and private security guards: *violation*

*Chernega and Others v. Ukraine*, 74768/10, 18 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Criminal conviction for participation in a demonstration denied by accused constituted interference: *violation*

*Zülküf Murat Kahraman v. Turkey*, 65808/10, 16 July 2019... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Conviction for organising "mass disorder" following clashes during demonstration, without sufficient scrutiny of event organiser's own acts and intentions: *violation*

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia*,  
75734/12 *et al.*, 19 November 2019..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-ooo-

Suspension at the request of minority MPs of the convening of a regional parliament sitting in order to announce the results of an unconstitutional referendum: *inadmissible*

*Forcadell i Lluís and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 75147/17,  
7 May 2019..... no. 229 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Freedom of association

Dissolution of an insolvent foundation unable to fulfil its registered aims: *no violation*

*MİHR Foundation v. Turkey*, 10814/07, 7 May 2019..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to register LGBT associations: *violation*

*Zhdanov and Others v. Russia, 12200/08 et al., 16 July 2019*.....no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Regulation of conflicts arising in case of multiple collective agreements applicable in one company: *communicated*

*Angert and Others v. Germany, 12693/18*

*Ratih v. Germany, 14883/18*..... no. 225 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 12

### Right to marry

Tardy annulment of marriage between a former brother-in-law and sister-in-law: *violation*

*Theodorou and Tsotsorou v. Greece, 57854/15,*

*5 September 2019*..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 13

### Effective remedy

Alleged ineffectiveness of a complaints procedure before a legislative assembly to deal with irregularities in the election of its own members: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Mugemangango v. Belgium, 310/15* ..... no. 230 | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Absence of effective remedy for allegations of inhuman conditions of transport of prisoners: *violation*

*Tomov and Others v. Russia, 18255/10 et al., 9 April 2019*..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Structural shortcoming which rendered ineffective an order to ensure that prisoners' basic needs were met during a strike in prisons: *violation*

*Clasens v. Belgium, 26564/16, 28 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Effective preventive and compensatory remedies for inadequate conditions of detention: *inadmissible*

*Ulemek v. Croatia, 21613/16, 31 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Informal prisoner hierarchy allegedly tolerated by prison management: *communicated*

*A.S. and Others v. Russia, 45049/17* ..... no. 230 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 14

### Discrimination (Article 3)

Absence of legislation defining domestic violence and dealing with it at systemic level: *violation*

*Volodina v. Russia, 41261/17, 9 July 2019*..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Alleged failure of State to address bullying at school of child with mental disorder: *communicated*  
*M.C. and Others v. Romania, 44654/18* ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Informal prisoner hierarchy allegedly tolerated by prison management: *communicated*  
*A.S. and Others v. Russia, 45049/17* ..... no. 230 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Discrimination (Article 6)

Retroactive reimbursement denied to taxpayers who had not challenged a social contribution before it was declared unconstitutional: *inadmissible*  
*Frantzeskaki and Others v. Greece (dec.), 57275/17 et al., 12 February 2019*..... no. 227 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Discrimination (Article 8)

Beneficiaries of temporary protection required to wait longer than refugees or international protection beneficiaries to become eligible for family reunion: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*  
*M.A. v. Denmark, 6697/18*..... no. 234 | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Blanket ban on prison leave for male prisoners in closed prisons: *violation*  
*Ēcis v. Latvia, 12879/09, 10 January 2019*..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Difference of severity in regulations on visits to detainees between prisons and remand prisons: *violation*  
*Chaldayev v. Russia, 33172/16, 28 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Failure to provide abortion free of charge: *communicated*  
*A and B v. the United Kingdom, 80046/17*..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

LGBT rights film screening interrupted by group shouting homophobic abuse: *communicated*  
*Association ACCEPT and Others v. Romania, 19237/16* no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Female to male transsexual registered under former female forename and as child's mother in birth register: *communicated*  
*O.H. and G.H. v. Germany, 53568/18 and 54741/18* ..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to issue birth certificate indicating both child's parents as her mothers in case of adoption by biological mother's partner in same-sex couple: *communicated*  
*S.W. and Others v. Austria, 1928/19*..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to include child of same-sex couple in register of civil status: *communicated*  
*A.D.-K. and Others v. Poland, 30806/15* ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged discrimination in refusal to grant custody to child's mother on grounds of her sexual orientation: *communicated*  
*A.S. v. Poland, 58012/10* ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to grant Polish nationality to children of same-sex couple born through surrogacy in USA: *communicated*  
*S.-H. v. Poland, 56846/15 and 56849/15*..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)



Alleged discrimination in removal of children from mother's custody on grounds of her sexual orientation: *communicated*

*X. v. Poland, 20741/10*..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Social-security benefit refused to a foreign child who had entered the country legally, albeit by a procedure other than family reunification: *communicated*

*Shiozaki v. France, 69802/17*..... no. 230 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to exempt mentally ill alien seeking naturalisation from language and citizenship tests: *communicated*

*Aziz Thamer Al-Ebrah v. Denmark, 32834/18*..... no. 231 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to allow a homosexual prisoner to have conjugal visits: *communicated*

*Duță v. Romania, 8783/15* ..... no. 231 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Discrimination (Article 10)

Television station fined for broadcasting Hungarian programme without being translated into or subtitled in Slovak in breach of domestic law: *communicated*

*Július Pereszlényi-Servis TV-Video v. Slovakia, 25175/15*.....no. 231 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Discrimination (Article 11)

Refusal to register LGBT associations: *violation*

*Zhdanov and Others v. Russia, 12200/08 et al., 16 July 2019*.....no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

No distinction made in favour of certain categories of vulnerable social housing tenants in the application of amended housing benefit scheme: *no violation; violation*

*J.D. and A v. United Kingdom, 32949/17 and 34614/17, 24 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-ooo-

Alleged discrimination in provision of disability benefits to civilian as opposed military beneficiaries: *communicated*

*Popović and Others v. Serbia, 26944/13 et al.* ..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

# ARTICLE 15

## Derogation in time of emergency

Detention based on mere suspicion of membership of an illegal organisation, without any specific incriminating evidence: *not "strictly required"*

*Alparslan Altan v. Turkey, 12778/17, 16 April 2019* ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Extent strictly required by situation

State of emergency could not remove the "reasonableness" requirement for suspicions-based detention (Article 5 § 1 (c))

Lack of speediness of Constitutional Court's review of pre-trial detention (Article 5 § 4) both under and after the state of emergency, regarding offences prior to the state of emergency

*Kavala v. Turkey, 28749/18, 10 December 2019*..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 17

### Prohibition of abuse of rights

Criminal conviction of member of parliament for statements made in Parliament found to constitute Holocaust denial: *inadmissible*

*Pastörs v. Germany, 55225/14, 3 October 2019*..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 18

### Restriction for unauthorised purposes

Member of parliament prevented from discharging his duties as a result of his prolonged pre-trial detention, for the alleged purpose of stifling pluralism: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Selahattin Demirtaş v. Turkey (no. 2), 14305/17 (Chamber judgment of 20 November 2018)*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-ooo-

Political activist's house arrest with restrictions on communication, correspondence and use of Internet, aimed at suppressing pluralism: *violation*

*Navalnyy v. Russia (no. 2), 43734/14, 9 April 2019* ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged politically motivated deprivation of liberty: *no violation*

*Korban v. Ukraine, 26744/16, 4 July 2019*..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Extended detention of a human-rights defender with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence: *violation*

*Kavala v. Turkey, 28749/18, 10 December 2019*..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 33

### Inter-State application

Quantification and identification of victims eligible for compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage in an inter-State case

*Georgia v. Russia (just satisfaction) [GC], 13255/07, 31 January 2019*..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 34

### Victim

Impact on shareholders of legislation putting banks under central supervising authorities: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Albert and Others v. Hungary, 5294/14 (Chamber judgment of 29 January 2019)*..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-ooo-

Three months of suspended prison sentence declared as served following acknowledgment that criminal proceedings had been excessively long: *loss of victim status*

*Chiarello v. Germany*, 497/17, 20 June 2019 ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Author of impugned statements in published interview admitted as third party, albeit without own claim, to civil defamation proceedings against newspaper: *victim status upheld*

*Margulev v. Russia*, 15449/09, 8 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Life prisoners not directly affected by statutory restrictions on family visits in absence of genuine attempt to maintain contact or in case of less frequent visits than permitted: *inadmissible*

*Chernenko and Others v. Russia (dec.)*, 4246/14, 5 February 2019 ..... no. 227 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Locus standi**

Application from a group of MPs from a regional parliament acting to defend their own personal rights: *locus standi granted*

*Forcadell i Lluís and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 75147/17, 7 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Hinder the exercise of the right of application**

Proceeding with examination of complaint about failure to comply with interim measure would amount to circumventing exhaustion rule

*Tunç and Yerbasan v. Turkey (dec.)*, 4133/16 and 31542/16, 29 January 2019 ..... no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## **ARTICLE 35**

### **Article 35 § 1**

#### **Exhaustion of domestic remedies**

Effectiveness of a suspensive remedy, in respect of an asylum request submitted after the application had been lodged with the Court: *admissible*

*A.M. v. France*, 12148/18, 29 April 2019 ..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure to exhaust preventive remedies counterbalanced by Constitutional Court's overall ruling on the merits in compensatory proceedings: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Ulemek v. Croatia*, 21613/16, 31 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

No exemption from requirement to apply to Constitutional Court: *inadmissible*

*Elçi v. Turkey (dec.)*, 63129/15, 29 January 2019 ..... no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

No special circumstances for exemption from requirement to apply to Constitutional Court: *inadmissible*

*Tunç and Yerbasan v. Turkey (dec.)*, 4133/16 and 31542/16, 29 January 2019 ..... no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Effectiveness of new remedy for physical conditions of detention: *inadmissible*  
*Draniceru v. the Republic of Moldova (dec.)*, 31975/15,  
12 February 2019.....no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Effectiveness of constitutional complaint to challenge either application of legislation in court proceedings or court rulings, both allegedly contrary to the Fundamental Law: *inadmissible*  
*Szalontay v. Hungary (dec.)*, 71327/13, 12 March 2019.....no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure to use a new remedy, applicable to pending cases, to obtain reimbursement of national taxes in breach of EU law: *inadmissible*  
*Pop and Others v. Romania (dec.)*, 54494/11 *et al.*, 2 April 2019.....no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Effectiveness of an action for damages against the State in order to challenge the non-enforcement of a judgment ordering urgent rehousing: *inadmissible*  
*Bouhamla v. France (dec.)*, 31798/16, 25 June 2019.....no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure to make use of cassation appeal review by a person detained pending deportation: *inadmissible*  
*Pantsulai v. Russia (dec.)*, 34275/19, 8 October 2019.....no. 234 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Effective domestic remedy – Austria**

Effectiveness of remedy which did not allow for a claim of non-pecuniary damage to be made in defamation proceedings: *admissible*  
*Lewit v. Austria*, 4782/18, 10 October 2019.....no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Effective domestic remedy – Croatia**

Application duly lodged with the Court after obtaining the decision of the Constitutional Court in compensatory proceedings: *preliminary objection dismissed*  
*Ulemek v. Croatia*, 21613/16, 31 October 2019.....no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Effective domestic remedy – France**

Effectiveness of a suspensive remedy, in respect of an asylum request submitted after the application had been lodged with the Court: *admissible*  
*A.M. v. France*, 12148/18, 29 April 2019.....no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Effectiveness of an action for damages against the State in order to challenge the non-enforcement of a judgment ordering urgent rehousing: *inadmissible*  
*Bouhamla v. France (dec.)*, 31798/16, 25 June 2019.....no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Effective domestic remedy – Hungary**

Effectiveness of constitutional complaint to challenge either application of legislation in court proceedings or court rulings, both allegedly contrary to the Fundamental Law: *inadmissible*  
*Szalontay v. Hungary (dec.)*, 71327/13, 12 March 2019.....no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### **Effective domestic remedy – Republic of Moldova**

Effectiveness of new remedy for physical conditions of detention: *inadmissible*  
*Draniceru v. the Republic of Moldova (dec.)*, 31975/15,  
12 February 2019.....no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Effective domestic remedy – Romania

Failure to use a new remedy, applicable to pending cases, to obtain reimbursement of national taxes in breach of EU law: *inadmissible*

*Pop and Others v. Romania (dec.)*, 54494/11 *et al.*, 2 April 2019..... no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Effective domestic remedy – Ukraine

Delays rendering Constitutional Court remedy ineffective in post-Yanukoviych lustration cases but not triggering six-month time-limit, failing perceptible inactivity: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Polyakh and Others v. Ukraine*, 58812/15 *et al.*,  
17 October 2019.....no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Six-month period

Starting point for the six-month period depending on whether the complaint concerns a refusal to authorise a family visit to prison or the conditions of such visit

*Chaldayev v. Russia*, 33172/16, 28 May 2019..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Failure to exercise due diligence in making enquiries as to status of proceedings where domestic law provided for automatic service of court decision: *inadmissible*

*Akif Hasanov v. Azerbaijan*, 7268/10, 19 September 2019 ..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Delays rendering Constitutional Court remedy ineffective in post-Yanukoviych lustration cases but not triggering six-month time-limit, failing perceptible inactivity: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Polyakh and Others v. Ukraine*, 58812/15 *et al.*,  
17 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Application duly lodged with the Court after obtaining the decision of the Constitutional Court in compensatory proceedings: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Ulemek v. Croatia*, 21613/16, 31 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 37

### Striking out applications

Unilateral declarations containing no undertaking to reopen investigation in cases where such reopening was de jure or de facto impossible: *struck out*

*Taşdemir v. Turkey (dec.)*, 52538/09, 12 March 2019.....no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Kutlu and Others v. Turkey (dec.)*, 18357/11, 12 March 2019....no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Karaca v. Turkey (dec.)*, 5809/13, 12 March 2019 .....no. 228 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 41

### Just satisfaction

Quantification and identification of victims eligible for compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage in an inter-State case

*Georgia v. Russia (just satisfaction) [GC]*, 13255/07,  
31 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Domestic law enabling appropriate reparation after the Court has found a violation of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1: *strike out*

*Kaynar and Others v. Turkey, 21104/06 et al., 7 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary*

## ARTICLE 46

### Article 46 § 2

#### Execution of judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to take general measures in the face of continued air pollution from factory emissions, affecting the health of persons living in the neighbouring municipalities

*Cordella and Others v. Italy, 54414/13 and 54264/15, 24 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary*

Systemic problem calling for reform of the system of review of whole-life sentences

*Petukhov v. Ukraine (no. 2), 41216/13, 12 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary*

Respondent State required to take general measures to resolve structural problem of inhuman conditions of transport of prisoners and the absence of effective remedies

*Tomov and Others v. Russia, 18255/10 et al., 9 April 2019..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary*

Respondent State required to amend electoral legislation to enable the holding of local elections

*Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 30100/18, 29 October 2019.....no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary*

#### Execution of judgment – Individual measures

Respondent State required to secure full repossession of land by internally displaced persons, including removal of a church

*Orlović and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 16332/18, 1 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary*

### Article 46 § 4

#### Infringement proceedings

Infringement proceedings against Azerbaijan for failure to abide by final judgment of the European Court: *violation*

*Ilgar Mammadov v. Azerbaijan, 15172/13, 29 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary*

## ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

### Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Impact on shareholders of legislation putting banks under central supervising authorities: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Albert and Others v. Hungary, 5294/14 (Chamber judgment of 29 January 2019) ..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary*

-000-

Pensions halved following the transfer to the ordinary insurance scheme of contributors to an insolvent pension fund: *no violation*

*Yavaş and Others v. Turkey*, 36366/06, 5 March 2019 ..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Non-enforcement of final decision ordering full repossession of land by internally displaced persons, including plot on which church had been built: *violation*

*Orlović and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 16332/18, 1 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Control of the use of property

Preventive attachment of assets belonging to managers or relatives of executives of an insolvent bank, even after they were not found personally implicated: *violation*

*Uzan and Others v. Turkey*, 19620/05 *et al.*, 5 March 2019 .... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Deprivation of property – Public interest

Lack of compensation for private garage located on public land and demolished for commercial housing development: *violation*

*Svitlana Ilchenko v. Ukraine*, 47166/09, 4 July 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Positive obligations

Non-enforcement of final decision ordering full repossession of land by internally displaced persons, including plot on which church had been built: *violation*

*Orlović and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 16332/18, 1 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

# ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

## Right to education

Inability for prisoners to use a computer or to access the Internet for their higher-education studies: *violation*

*Mehmet Reşit Arslan and Orhan Bingöl v. Turkey*, 47121/06 *et al.*, 18 June 2019 ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-ooo-

Request for an autistic child to attend a mainstream school rejected in favour of placement in a specialised institution: *inadmissible*

*Dupin v. France (dec.)*, 2282/17, 18 December 2018 ..... no. 225 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

University admission system attaching greater weight to a student's previous field of study: *inadmissible*

*Kılıç v. Turkey (dec.)*, 29601/05, 5 March 2019 ..... no. 227 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-ooo-

Alleged failure of State to address bullying at school of child with mental disorder: *communicated*

*M.C. and Others v. Romania*, 44654/18 ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Delay in issuing military ID resulting in inability to sit university entrance examination: *communicated*

*Musayev v. Azerbaijan*, 54567/13 ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Respect for parents' religious convictions

Parents obliged to submit solemn declaration, with teacher's countersignature, as to non-Orthodox Christian status of children for exemption from religious education course: *violation*  
*Papageorgiou and Others v. Greece, 4762/18 and 6140/18,*  
31 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Criminal conviction for subjecting children to purportedly excessive religious practices: *communicated*  
*Cupiał v. Poland, 67414/11*..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Respect for parents' philosophical convictions

Compulsory vaccinations of children and consequences of non-vaccination: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*  
*Vavříčka and Others v. the Czech Republic, 47621/13 et al.*..... no. 235 | [Legal summary](#)

# ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

## Free expression of the opinion of the people

Member of parliament prevented from discharging his duties as a result of his prolonged pre-trial detention, for the alleged purpose of stifling pluralism: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Selahattin Demirtaş v. Turkey (no. 2), 14305/17 (Chamber judgment of 20 November 2018)*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged ineffectiveness of a complaints procedure before a legislative assembly to deal with irregularities in the election of its own members: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*  
*Mugemangango v. Belgium, 310/15*..... no. 230 | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Regional parliament prevented from announcing the results of a referendum on self-determination organised in breach of a Constitutional Court decision: *inadmissible*  
*Forcadell i Lluís and Others v. Spain (dec.), 75147/17,*  
7 May 2019..... no. 229 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Stand for election

Member of parliament prevented from discharging his duties as a result of his prolonged pre-trial detention, for the alleged purpose of stifling pluralism: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*  
*Selahattin Demirtaş v. Turkey (no. 2), 14305/17 (Chamber judgment of 20 November 2018)*..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Failings in the decision-making process for accepting the resignation of a member of parliament, allegedly made under duress: *violation*  
*G.K. v. Belgium, 58302/10, 21 May 2019*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Lack of time for campaigning due to late registration of candidates in parliamentary elections following initial arbitrary refusals to register them and delays in proceedings: *violation*  
*Abdalov and Others v. Azerbaijan, 28508/11 et al.,*  
11 July 2019..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)



Applicant's disqualification from parliamentary elections for early campaigning and vote buying, resulting from deficient procedure and inadequate assessment of evidence: *violation*

*Abil v. Azerbaijan (no. 2), 8513/11, 5 December 2019* ..... no. 235 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Lists of candidates rejected *en bloc* for failure to comply with the minimum quota for each gender: *inadmissible*

Electoral coalition deprived of free access to national radio and television for failure to present candidates across the entire country following the rejection of its lists in certain constituencies: *inadmissible*

*Zevnik and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 54893/18,*

*12 November 2019* ..... no. 235 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

### Procedural safeguards relating to expulsion of aliens

Removal decided by court on the basis of classified documents concerning national security that were not disclosed to the applicants: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Muhammad and Muhammad v. Romania, 80982/12* ..... no. 226 | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

### Right not to be tried or punished twice

Reopening by a higher authority of its own motion, without any new facts or fundamental defects requiring correction, of criminal proceedings that had been replaced by an administrative fine: *violation*

*Mihalache v. Romania [GC], 54012/10, 8 July 2019* ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12

### General prohibition of discrimination

Inability of resident of a city to vote and stand in local elections for a prolonged period of time: *violation*

*Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 30100/18,*

*29 October 2019* ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

-000-

Inability to vote and stand in local election due to legal void in legislation: *communicated*

*Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 30100/18* ..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Alleged discrimination in final high school exams of pupils belonging to national minorities who studied in their native tongue: *communicated*

*Ádám and Others v. Romania, 81114/17* ..... no. 227 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

**Advisory opinions**

Advisory opinion concerning the recognition in domestic law of a legal parent-child relationship between a child born through a gestational surrogacy arrangement abroad and the intended mother

*Advisory opinion requested by the French Court of Cassation [GC],*

*P16-2018-001, 10 April 2019*.....no. 228 | [Opinion](#) | [Legal summary](#)

# CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERRAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER

## REFERRALS

*Albert and Others v. Hungary, 5294/14 (Chamber judgment of 29 January 2019)*..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 34: VICTIM

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1: PEACEFUL ENJOYMENT OF POSSESSIONS

Impact on shareholders of legislation putting banks under central supervising authorities:  
*case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom, 58170/13 et al. (Chamber judgment of 13 September 2018)*..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Convention compliance of secret surveillance regime including the bulk interception of external communications: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Centrum för rättvisa v. Sweden, 35252/08 (Chamber judgment of 19 June 2018)*..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR CORRESPONDENCE

Proportionality and safeguards of Swedish legislation on signals intelligence: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Gestur Jónsson and Ragnar Halldór Hall v. Iceland, 68273/14 and 68271/14 (Chamber judgment of 30 October 2018)*..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CRIMINAL): FAIR HEARING

Alleged shortcomings in review of fine imposed in absentia on defence counsel by trial court: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

ARTICLE 7: *NULLUM CRIMEN SINE LEGE – NULLA POENA SINE LEGE*

Alleged unforeseeability of fine imposed by trial court on “defence counsel” and its amount: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland, 26374/18 (Chamber judgment of 12 March 2019)* ..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CRIMINAL): TRIBUNAL ESTABLISHED BY LAW

Appointment of judges in flagrant breach of domestic law, as a result of undue discretion exercised by the executive: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Kurt v. Austria, 62903/15 (Chamber judgment of 4 July 2019)*..... no. 234 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 2: LIFE – POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (SUBSTANTIVE ASPECT)

Sufficiency of preventive measures in light of no discernible risk of child’s murder at school by father accused of domestic violence and barred from home: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Selahattin Demirtaş v. Turkey (no. 2), 14305/17 (Chamber judgment of 20 November 2018)*..... [no. 227](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 18: RESTRICTION FOR UNAUTHORISED PURPOSES

ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1: FREE EXPRESSION OF THE OPINION OF THE PEOPLE – STAND FOR ELECTION

Member of parliament prevented from discharging his duties as a result of his prolonged pre-trial detention, for the alleged purpose of stifling pluralism: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*X and Others v. Bulgaria, 22457/16 (Chamber judgment of 17 January 2019)*..... [no. 230](#) | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 3: POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (SUBSTANTIVE AND PROCEDURAL ASPECTS)

ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE – POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS

Allegations of sexual abuse in an orphanage found not to be corroborated by the investigation file or the preventive measures implemented there: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

## RELINQUISHMENTS

*Hanan v. Germany, 4871/16*..... [no. 232](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 1: RESPONSIBILITY OF STATES – JURISDICTION OF STATES

Jurisdiction as regards the death of civilians in Afghanistan following airstrike under NATO operational command: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*M.A. v. Denmark, 6697/18*..... [no. 234](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR FAMILY LIFE

Denial of family reunion to beneficiary of temporary protection: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

ARTICLE 14: DISCRIMINATION (ARTICLE 8)

Beneficiaries of temporary protection required to wait longer than refugees or international protection beneficiaries to become eligible for family reunion: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Mugemangango v. Belgium, 310/15*..... [no. 230](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 13: EFFECTIVE REMEDY

ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1: FREE EXPRESSION OF THE OPINION OF THE PEOPLE

Alleged ineffectiveness of a complaints procedure before a legislative assembly to deal with irregularities in the election of its own members: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Muhammad and Muhammad v. Romania, 80982/12*..... [no. 226](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL NO. 7: PROCEDURAL SAFEGUARDS RELATING TO EXPULSION OF ALIENS

Removal decided by court on the basis of classified documents concerning national security that were not disclosed to the applicants: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

*Vavříčka and Others v. the Czech Republic, 47621/13 et al.*..... [no. 235](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR PRIVATE AND FAMILY LIFE

ARTICLE 9 : FREEDOM OF CONSCIENCE

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1: RESPECT FOR PARENTS' PHILOSOPHICAL CONVICTIONS

Compulsory vaccinations of children and consequences of non-vaccination: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

## CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE

### ARMENIA

#### Judgments

*Nikolyan v. Armenia*, 74438/14, 3 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

### AUSTRIA

#### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Kurt v. Austria*, 62903/15 (Chamber judgment of 4 July 2019 – referral)..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

#### Judgments

*Kurt v. Austria*, 62903/15, 4 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Lewit v. Austria*, 4782/18, 10 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

#### Communicated cases

*S.W. and Others v. Austria*, 1928/19..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary

### AZERBAIJAN

#### Judgments

*Abdalov and Others v. Azerbaijan*, 28508/11 et al., 11 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Abil v. Azerbaijan (no. 2)*, 8513/11, 5 December 2019..... no. 235 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Akif Hasanov v. Azerbaijan*, 7268/10, 19 September 2019..... no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Ilgar Mammadov v. Azerbaijan*, 15172/13, 29 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Khadija Ismayilova v. Azerbaijan*, 65286/13 and 57270/14, 10 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Tagiyev and Huseynov v. Azerbaijan*, 13274/08, 5 December 2019..... no. 235 | Judgment | Legal summary

#### Communicated cases

*Musayev v. Azerbaijan*, 54567/13..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

### BELGIUM

#### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Rooman v. Belgium [GC]*, 18052/11, 31 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Mugemangango v. Belgium*, 310/15 (relinquishment) ..... no. 230 | [Legal summary](#)

## Judgments

*Clasens v. Belgium*, 26564/16, 28 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*G.K. v. Belgium*, 58302/10, 21 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Romeo Castaño v. Belgium*, 8351/17, 9 July 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## Communicated cases

*Mortier v. Belgium*, 78017/17 ..... no. 225 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA

### Judgments

*Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 30100/18, 29 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Orlović and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 16332/18,  
1 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Communicated cases

*Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 30100/18 ..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## BULGARIA

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16 (Chamber judgment of  
17 January 2019 – referral) ..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Judgments

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16, 17 January 2019 ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Decisions

*Rashkovi v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 52257/09, 11 December 2018 ..... no. 225 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Yankov v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 44768/10, 18 June 2019 ..... no. 231 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## CROATIA

### Judgments

*Ulemek v. Croatia*, 21613/16, 31 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Decisions

*Šimunić v. Croatia (dec.)*, 20373/17, 22 January 2019 ..... no. 225 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Tolić and Others v. Croatia (dec.), 13482/15 et al., 4 June 2019*..... no. 230 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Vučina v. Croatia (dec.), 58955/13, 31 October 2019* ..... no. 233 | Decision | Legal summary

## CYPRUS

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], 36925/07, 29 January 2019*..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## CZECH REPUBLIC

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Vavříčka and Others v. the Czech Republic, 47621/13 et al. (relinquishment)* ..... no. 235 | Legal summary

## DENMARK

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*M.A. v. Denmark, 6697/18 (relinquishment)*..... no. 234 | Legal summary

### Judgments

*Tim Henrik Bruun Hansen v. Denmark, 51072/15, 9 July 2019*..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Savran v. Denmark, 57467/15, 1 October 2019*..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*Aziz Thamer Al-Ebrah v. Denmark, 32834/18*..... no. 231 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Johansen v. Denmark, 27801/19* ..... no. 234 | Communication | Legal summary

## FINLAND

### Judgments

*SA-Capital Oy v. Finland, 5556/10, 14 February 2019*..... no. 226 | Judgment | Legal summary

## FRANCE

### Judgments

*A.M. v. France, 12148/18, 29 April 2019*..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Guimon v. France, 48798/14, 11 April 2019*..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Halabi v. France, 66554/14, 16 May 2019*..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Khan v. France, 12267/16, 28 February 2019*..... no. 226 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Decisions

*Bouhamla v. France (dec.)*, 31798/16, 25 June 2019..... no. 231 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Carrefour France v. France (dec.)*, 37858/14, 1 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Dupin v. France (dec.)*, 2282/17, 18 December 2018 ..... no. 225 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Petithory Lanzmann v. France (dec.)*, 23038/19, 12 November 2019 ..... no. 235 | Decision | Legal summary

## Communicated cases

*Association Burestop 55 and Others v. France*, 56176/18 *et al.* ..... no. 235 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Dalleau v. France*, 57307/18..... no. 230 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Shiozaki v. France*, 69802/17 ..... no. 230 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Z.B. v. France*, 46883/15..... no. 230 | Communication | Legal summary

## GEORGIA

### Judgments

*Batiashvili v. Georgia*, 8284/07, 10 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Kereselidze v. Georgia*, 39718/09, 28 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rustavi 2 Broadcasting Company Ltd and Others v. Georgia*, 16812/17,  
18 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Svanidze v. Georgia*, 37809/08, 25 July 2019 ..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Vazagashvili and Shanava v. Georgia*, 50375/07, 18 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

## GERMANY

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Hanan v. Germany*, 4871/16 (relinquishment)..... no. 232 | Legal summary

### Judgments

*Chiarello v. Germany*, 497/17, 20 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Pastörs v. Germany*, 55225/14, 3 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rook v. Germany*, 1586/15, 25 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Wunderlich v. Germany*, 18925/15, 10 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Communicated cases

*Angert and Others v. Germany*, 12693/18..... no. 225 | Communication | Legal summary  
*O.H. and G.H. v. Germany*, 53568/18 and 54741/18..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Ratih v. Germany*, 14883/18 ..... no. 225 | Communication | Legal summary

## GREECE

### Judgments

*Papageorgiou and Others v. Greece*, 4762/18 and 6140/18,  
31 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary



*Sine Tsagarakis A.E.E. v. Greece*, 17257/13, 23 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*T.I. and Others v. Greece*, 40311/10, 18 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Theodorou and Tsotsorou v. Greece*, 57854/15, 5 September 2019 ..... no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Decisions

*Frantzeskaki and Others v. Greece (dec.)*, 57275/17 et al., 12 February 2019.... no. 227 | Decision | Legal summary

## HUNGARY

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC]*, 47287/15, 21 November 2019 ..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Albert and Others v. Hungary*, 5294/14 (Chamber judgment of 29 January 2019 – referral)..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Judgments

*R.S. v. Hungary*, 65290/14, 2 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Szurovecz v. Hungary*, 15428/16, 8 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Decisions

*Szalontay v. Hungary (dec.)*, 71327/13, 12 March 2019 ..... no. 228 | Decision | Legal summary

## ICELAND

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Gestur Jónsson and Ragnar Halldór Hall v. Iceland*, 68273/14 and 68271/14 (Chamber judgment of 30 October 2018 – referral)..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland*, 26374/18 (Chamber judgment of 12 March 2019 – referral) ..... no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Judgments

*Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland*, 26374/18, 12 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Júlíus Þór Sigurþórsson v. Iceland*, 38797/17, 16 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Sigurður Einarsson and Others v. Iceland*, 39757/15, 4 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

## IRELAND

### Judgments

*Doyle v. Ireland*, 51979/17, 23 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*L.F. v. Ireland*, 62007/17..... no. 228 | Communication | Legal summary

## ITALY

### Judgments

*Cordella and Others v. Italy*, 54414/13 and 54264/15, 24 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)  
*Knox v. Italy*, 76577/13, 24 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)  
*Marcello Viola v. Italy (no. 2)*, 77633/16, 13 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## LATVIA

### Judgments

*Ēcis v. Latvia*, 12879/09, 10 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)  
*Kangers v. Latvia*, 35726/10, 14 March 2019..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## LITHUANIA

### Judgments

*Drėlingas v. Lithuania*, 28859/16, 12 March 2019..... no. 227 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)  
*Januškevičienė v. Lithuania*, 69717/14, 3 September 2019..... no. 232 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## MALTA

### Judgments

*Aboya Boa Jean v. Malta*, 62676/16, 2 April 2019..... no. 228 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)  
*Mifsud v. Malta*, 62257/15, 29 January 2019..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA

### Judgments

*Ozdil and Others v. the Republic of Moldova*, 42305/18, 11 June 2019..... no. 230 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Decisions

*Draniceru v. the Republic of Moldova (dec.)*, 31975/15, 12 February 2019..... no. 226 | [Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## NORTH MACEDONIA

### Judgments

*Tasev v. North Macedonia*, 9825/13, 16 May 2019..... no. 229 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

## NORWAY

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Strand Lobben and Others v. Norway* [GC], 37283/13, 10 September 2019.....no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Judgments

*Høiness v. Norway*, 43624/14, 19 March 2019.....no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Decisions

*Konkurrenten.no AS v. Norway (dec.)*, 47341/15, 5 November 2019.....no. 234 | Decision | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*A.M. v. Norway*, 30254/18..... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary

*S.R. v. Norway*, 43927/17..... no. 228 | Communication | Legal summary

## POLAND

### Judgments

*Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland*, 20147/15, 5 September 2019.....no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*A.D.-K. and Others v. Poland*, 30806/15..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*A.S. v. Poland*, 58012/10..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*Broda and Bojara v. Poland*, 26691/18 and 27367/18..... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary

*Cupiał v. Poland*, 67414/11 ..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*S.-H. v. Poland*, 56846/15 and 56849/15 ..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*X. v. Poland*, 20741/10..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*Xero Flor w Polsce sp. z o.o. v. Poland*, 4907/18 ..... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary

## PORTUGAL

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal* [GC], 78103/14, 31 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## ROMANIA

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Mihalache v. Romania* [GC], 54012/10, 8 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania* [GC], 41720/13, 25 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Muhammad and Muhammad v. Romania*, 80982/12 (relinquishment) ..... no. 226 | Legal summary

## Judgments

*Prunea v. Romania*, 47881/11, 8 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Decisions

*Pop and Others v. Romania (dec.)*, 54494/11 et al., 2 April 2019..... no. 228 | Decision | Legal summary

## Communicated cases

*Ádám and Others v. Romania*, 81114/17..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*Association ACCEPT and Others v. Romania*, 19237/16..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary

*Duță v. Romania*, 8783/15..... no. 231 | Communication | Legal summary

*M.C. and Others v. Romania*, 44654/18..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*I.V.Ț. v. Romania*, 35582/15..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary

# RUSSIA

## Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Georgia v. Russia (just satisfaction) [GC]*, 13255/07, 31 January 2019... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Z.A. and Others v. Russia [GC]*, 61411/15 et al., 21 November 2019..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Judgments

*A v. Russia*, 37735/09, 12 November 2019..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Abdyusheva and Others v. Russia*, 58502/11 et al., 26 November 2019..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Bogonosov v. Russia*, 38201/16, 5 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Chaldayev v. Russia*, 33172/16, 28 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Gorlov and Others v. Russia*, 27057/06 et al., 2 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Ilgiz Khalikov v. Russia*, 48724/15, 15 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Magnitskiy and Others v. Russia*, 32631/09 and 53799/12,  
27 August 2019..... no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Margulev v. Russia*, 15449/09, 8 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Mityanin and Leonov v. Russia*, 11436/06 and 22912/06, 7 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Navalnyy v. Russia (no. 2)*, 43734/14, 9 April 2019..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia*, 75734/12 et al.,  
19 November 2019..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Tomov and Others v. Russia*, 18255/10 et al., 9 April 2019..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary

*V.D. and Others v. Russia*, 72931/10, 9 April 2019..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Volodina v. Russia*, 41261/17, 9 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Zakharchuk v. Russia*, 2967/12, 17 December 2019..... no. 235 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Zelikha Magomadova v. Russia*, 58724/14, 8 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Zhdanov and Others v. Russia*, 12200/08 et al., 16 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Decisions

*Chernenko and Others v. Russia (dec.)*, 4246/14, 5 February 2019..... no. 227 | Decision | Legal summary

*Pantsulai v. Russia (dec.)*, 34275/19, 8 October 2019..... no. 234 | Decision | Legal summary

## Communicated cases

*A.S. and Others v. Russia*, 45049/17..... no. 230 | Communication | Legal summary

*Aley and Others v. Russia, 25714/16 and 56328/18*..... no. 228 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Tiunov v. Russia, 29442/18*..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Volodina v. Russia, 40419/19*..... no. 233 | Communication | Legal summary

## SAN MARINO

### Judgments

*Pasquini v. San Marino, 50956/16, 2 May 2019*..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary

## SERBIA

### Judgments

*Gjini v. Serbia, 1128/16, 15 January 2019*..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*Popović and Others v. Serbia, 26944/13 et al.*..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary

## SLOVAKIA

### Judgments

*Adamčo v. Slovakia, 45084/14, 12 November 2019*..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*Július Pereszlényi-Servis TV-Video v. Slovakia, 25175/15*..... no. 231 | Communication | Legal summary

## SLOVENIA

### Judgments

*Rola v. Slovenia, 12096/14 and 39335/16, 4 June 2019*..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Decisions

*Zevnik and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 54893/18, 12 November 2019*..... no. 235 | Decision | Legal summary

## SPAIN

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC], 1874/13 and 8567/13,  
17 October 2019* ..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Judgments

*Haddad v. Spain*, 16572/17, 18 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Decisions

*Forcadell i Lluís and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 75147/17, 7 May 2019 ..... no. 229 | Decision | Legal summary

*Larrañaga Arando and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 73911/16 and 79503/16,

25 June 2019..... no. 231 | Decision | Legal summary

*Martínez Aguirre and Others v. Spain (dec.)*, 75529/16 et al., 25 June 2019..... no. 231 | Decision | Legal summary

## SWEDEN

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Centrum för rättvisa v. Sweden*, 35252/08 (Chamber judgment of

19 June 2018 – referral)..... no. 226 | Judgment | Legal summary

## SWITZERLAND

### Judgments

*I.M. v. Switzerland*, 23887/16, 9 April 2019 ..... no. 228 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Ndayegamiye-Mporamazina v. Switzerland*, 16874/12, 5 February 2019..... no. 226 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Decisions

*Glaisen v. Switzerland (dec.)*, 40477/13, 25 June 2019..... no. 231 | Decision | Legal summary

*Porchet v. Switzerland (dec.)*, 36391/16, 8 October 2019 ..... no. 234 | Decision | Legal summary

*Schweizerische Radio- und Fernsehgesellschaft and Others v. Switzerland (dec.)*,

68995/13, 12 November 2019 ..... no. 235 | Decision | Legal summary

### Communicated cases

*Chaves Fernandes Figueiredo v. Switzerland*, 55603/18..... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary

## TURKEY

### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

*Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC]*, 36925/07,

29 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Selahattin Demirtaş v. Turkey (no. 2)*, 14305/17 (Chamber judgment

of 20 November 2018 – referral)..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary

### Judgments

*Aktaş and Aslaniskender v. Turkey*, 18684/07 and 21101/07, 25 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Ali Gürbüz v. Turkey*, 52497/08 et al., 12 March 2019 ..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary

<i>Alparslan Altan v. Turkey</i> , 12778/17, 16 April 2019 .....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Altay v. Turkey (no. 2)</i> , 11236/09, 9 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>G.B. and Others v. Turkey</i> , 4633/15, 17 October 2019 .....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Gürbüz and Bayar v. Turkey</i> , 8860/13, 23 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kavala v. Turkey</i> , 28749/18, 10 December 2019 .....	no. 235	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kaynar and Others v. Turkey</i> , 21104/06 et al., 7 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Mehmet Reşit Arslan and Orhan Bingöl v. Turkey</i> , 47121/06 et al., 18 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>MİHR Foundation v. Turkey</i> , 10814/07, 7 May 2019.....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Parmak and Bakır v. Turkey</i> , 22429/07 and 25195/07, 3 December 2019.....	no. 235	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Tarak and Depe v. Turkey</i> , 70472/12, 9 April 2019 .....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Uzan and Others v. Turkey</i> , 19620/05 et al., 5 March 2019.....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Yavaş and Others v. Turkey</i> , 36366/06, 5 March 2019.....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Yılmaz v. Turkey</i> , 36607/06, 4 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Zülküf Murat Kahraman v. Turkey</i> , 65808/10, 16 July 2019 .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary

## Decisions

<i>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 6080/06, 29 January 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Elçi v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 63129/15, 29 January 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Karaca v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 5809/13, 12 March 2019 .....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Kılıç v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 29601/05, 5 March 2019.....	no. 227	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Kutlu and Others v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 18357/11, 12 March 2019.....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Taşdemir v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 52538/09, 12 March 2019 .....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Tunç and Yerbasan v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 4133/16 and 31542/16, 29 January 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary

## Communicated cases

<i>Kerestecioğlu Demir v. Turkey</i> , 68136/16.....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Kılıçoğlu v. Turkey</i> , 38861/09.....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Melike v. Turkey</i> , 35786/19.....	no. 235	Communication	Legal summary

## UKRAINE

### Judgments

<i>Chernega and Others v. Ukraine</i> , 74768/10, 18 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Cosmos Maritime Trading and Shipping Agency v. Ukraine</i> , 53427/09, 27 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Korban v. Ukraine</i> , 26744/16, 4 July 2019 .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Petukhov v. Ukraine (no. 2)</i> , 41216/13, 12 March 2019.....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Polyakh and Others v. Ukraine</i> , 58812/15 et al., 17 October 2019.....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia</i> , 75734/12 et al., 19 November 2019 .....	no. 234	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Svitlana Ilchenko v. Ukraine</i> , 47166/09, 4 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary

### Decisions

<i>Famulyak v. Ukraine (dec.)</i> , 30180/11, 2 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Decision	Legal summary
--	---------	----------	---------------

## UNITED KINGDOM

### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

*Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom, 58170/13 et al.*

(Chamber judgment of 13 September 2018 – referral)..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Judgments

*Beghal v. the United Kingdom, 4755/16, 28 February 2019*..... no. 226 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*Catt v. the United Kingdom, 43514/15, 24 January 2019* ..... no. 225 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

*J.D. and A v. United Kingdom, 32949/17 and 34614/17,*

24 October 2019..... no. 233 | [Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

### Communicated cases

*A and B v. the United Kingdom, 80046/17* ..... no. 226 | [Communication](#) | [Legal summary](#)



## CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT

### A

<i>A v. Russia</i> , 37735/09, 12 November 2019.....	no. 234	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>A and B v. the United Kingdom</i> , 80046/17.....	no. 226	Communication	Legal summary
<i>A.D.-K. and Others v. Poland</i> , 30806/15.....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>A.M. v. France</i> , 12148/18, 29 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>A.M. v. Norway</i> , 30254/18.....	no. 232	Communication	Legal summary
<i>A.S. v. Poland</i> , 58012/10.....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>A.S. and Others v. Russia</i> , 45049/17.....	no. 230	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Abdalov and Others v. Azerbaijan</i> , 28508/11 et al., 11 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Abdyusheva and Others v. Russia</i> , 58502/11 et al., 26 November 2019.....	no. 234	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Abil v. Azerbaijan (no. 2)</i> , 8513/11, 5 December 2019.....	no. 235	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Aboya Boa Jean v. Malta</i> , 62676/16, 2 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Adamčo v. Slovakia</i> , 45084/14, 12 November 2019.....	no. 234	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Ádám and Others v. Romania</i> , 81114/17.....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Advisory opinion requested by the French Court of Cassation</i> , <i>P16-2018-001</i> , 10 April 2019.....	no. 228	Opinion	Legal summary
<i>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 6080/06, 29 January 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Akif Hasanov v. Azerbaijan</i> , 7268/10, 19 September 2019.....	no. 232	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Aktaş and Aslaniskender v. Turkey</i> , 18684/07 and 21101/07, 25 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Albert and Others v. Hungary</i> , 5294/14 ( <i>Chamber judgment of</i> <i>29 January 2019 – referral</i> ).....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Ali Gürbüz v. Turkey</i> , 52497/08 et al., 12 March 2019.....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Alparslan Altan v. Turkey</i> , 12778/17, 16 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Altay v. Turkey (no. 2)</i> , 11236/09, 9 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Angert and Others v. Germany</i> , 12693/18.....	no. 225	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Association ACCEPT and Others v. Romania</i> , 19237/16.....	no. 226	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Association Burestop 55 and Others v. France</i> , 56176/18 et al.....	no. 235	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Ayley and Others v. Russia</i> , 25714/16 and 56328/18.....	no. 228	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Aziz Thamer Al-Ebrah v. Denmark</i> , 32834/18.....	no. 231	Communication	Legal summary

### B

<i>Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina</i> , 30100/18.....	no. 226	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Baralija v. Bosnia and Herzegovina</i> , 30100/18, 29 October 2019.....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Batiashvili v. Georgia</i> , 8284/07, 10 October 2019.....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Beghal v. the United Kingdom</i> , 4755/16, 28 February 2019.....	no. 226	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom</i> , 58170/13 et al. ( <i>Chamber judgment of 13 September 2018 – referral</i> ).....	no. 226	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Bogonosovy v. Russia</i> , 38201/16, 5 March 2019.....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Bouhamla v. France (dec.)</i> , 31798/16, 25 June 2019.....	no. 231	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Broda and Bojara v. Poland</i> , 26691/18 and 27367/18.....	no. 232	Communication	Legal summary

**C**

<i>Carrefour France v. France (dec.)</i> , 37858/14, 1 October 2019 .....	no. 233	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Catt v. the United Kingdom</i> , 43514/15, 24 January 2019 .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Centrum för rättvisa v. Sweden</i> , 35252/08 (Chamber judgment of 19 June 2018 – referral).....	no. 226	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Chaldeyev v. Russia</i> , 33172/16, 28 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Chaves Fernandes Figueiredo v. Switzerland</i> , 55603/18.....	no. 232	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Chernega and Others v. Ukraine</i> , 74768/10, 18 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Chernenko and Others v. Russia (dec.)</i> , 4246/14, 5 February 2019 .....	no. 227	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Chiarello v. Germany</i> , 497/17, 20 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Clasens v. Belgium</i> , 26564/16, 28 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Cordella and Others v. Italy</i> , 54414/13 and 54264/15, 24 January 2019.....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Cosmos Maritime Trading and Shipping Agency v. Ukraine</i> , 53427/09, 27 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Cupiał v. Poland</i> , 67414/11 .....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary

**D**

<i>Dalleau v. France</i> , 57307/18.....	no. 230	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Doyle v. Ireland</i> , 51979/17, 23 May 2019.....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Draniceru v. the Republic of Moldova (dec.)</i> , 31975/15, 12 February 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Drėlingas v. Lithuania</i> , 28859/16, 12 March 2019 .....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Dupin v. France (dec.)</i> , 2282/17, 18 December 2018 .....	no. 225	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Duță v. Romania</i> , 8783/15 .....	no. 231	Communication	Legal summary

**E**

<i>Ēcis v. Latvia</i> , 12879/09, 10 January 2019 .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Elçi v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 63129/15, 29 January 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary

**F**

<i>Famulyak v. Ukraine (dec.)</i> , 30180/11, 2 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal [GC]</i> , 78103/14, 31 January 2019.....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Forcadell i Lluís and Others v. Spain (dec.)</i> , 75147/17, 7 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Frantzeskaki and Others v. Greece (dec.)</i> , 57275/17 et al., 12 February 2019.....	no. 227	Decision	Legal summary

**G**

<i>G.B. and Others v. Turkey</i> , 4633/15, 17 October 2019 .....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>G.K. v. Belgium</i> , 58302/10, 21 May 2019.....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Georgia v. Russia (just satisfaction) [GC]</i> , 13255/07, 31 January 2019...	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary

<i>Gestur Jónsson and Ragnar Halldór Hall v. Iceland, 68273/14 and 68271/14</i> (Chamber judgment of 30 October 2018 – referral) .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Gjini v. Serbia, 1128/16, 15 January 2019</i> .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Glaisen v. Switzerland (dec.), 40477/13, 25 June 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Gorlov and Others v. Russia, 27057/06 et al., 2 July 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland, 26374/18, 12 March 2019</i> .....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Guðmundur Andri Ástráðsson v. Iceland, 26374/18 (Chamber judgment</i> <i>of 12 March 2019 – referral)</i> .....	no. 232	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Guimon v. France, 48798/14, 11 April 2019</i> .....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Gürbüz and Bayar v. Turkey, 8860/13, 23 July 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], 36925/07,</i> <i>29 January 2019</i> .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary

## H

<i>Haddad v. Spain, 16572/17, 18 June 2019</i> .....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Halabi v. France, 66554/14, 16 May 2019</i> .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Hanan v. Germany, 4871/16 (relinquishment)</i> .....	no. 232	Legal summary	
<i>Høiness v. Norway, 43624/14, 19 March 2019</i> .....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary

## I

<i>I.M. v. Switzerland, 23887/16, 9 April 2019</i> .....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Ilgar Mammadov v. Azerbaijan, 15172/13, 29 May 2019</i> .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Ilgiz Khalikov v. Russia, 48724/15, 15 January 2019</i> .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC], 47287/15, 21 November 2019</i> .....	no. 234	Judgment	Legal summary

## J

<i>J.D. and A v. United Kingdom, 32949/17 and 34614/17,</i> <i>24 October 2019</i> .....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Januškevičienė v. Lithuania, 69717/14, 3 September 2019</i> .....	no. 232	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Johansen v. Denmark, 27801/19</i> .....	no. 234	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Július Pereszlényi-Servis TV-Video v. Slovakia, 25175/15</i> .....	no. 231	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Júlíus Þór Sigurpórsson v. Iceland, 38797/17, 16 July 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary

## K

<i>Kangers v. Latvia, 35726/10, 14 March 2019</i> .....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Karaca v. Turkey (dec.), 5809/13, 12 March 2019</i> .....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Kavala v. Turkey, 28749/18, 10 December 2019</i> .....	no. 235	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kaynar and Others v. Turkey, 21104/06 et al., 7 May 2019</i> .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kereselidze v. Georgia, 39718/09, 28 March 2019</i> .....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kerestecioğlu Demir v. Turkey, 68136/16</i> .....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary

<i>Khadija Ismayilova v. Azerbaijan, 65286/13 and 57270/14, 10 January 2019</i> .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Khan v. France, 12267/16, 28 February 2019</i> .....	no. 226	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kılıç v. Turkey (dec.), 29601/05, 5 March 2019</i> .....	no. 227	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Kılıçoğlu v. Turkey, 38861/09</i> .....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Knox v. Italy, 76577/13, 24 January 2019</i> .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Konkurrenten.no AS v. Norway, 47341/15, 5 November 2019</i> .....	no. 234	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Korban v. Ukraine, 26744/16, 4 July 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kurt v. Austria, 62903/15, 4 July 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Kurt v. Austria, 62903/15 (referral)</i> .....	no. 234	Legal summary	
<i>Kutlu and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 18357/11, 12 March 2019</i> .....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary

## L

<i>L.F. v. Ireland, 62007/17</i> .....	no. 228	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Larrañaga Arando and Others v. Spain (dec.), 73911/16 and 79503/16, 25 June 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Lewit v. Austria, 4782/18, 10 October 2019</i> .....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC], 1874/13 and 8567/13, 17 October 2019</i> .....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary

## M

<i>M.A. v. Denmark, 6697/18 (relinquishment)</i> .....	no. 234	Legal summary	
<i>M.C. and Others v. Romania, 44654/18</i> .....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Magnitskiy and Others v. Russia, 32631/09 and 53799/12, 27 August 2019</i> .....	no. 232	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Marcello Viola v. Italy (no. 2), 77633/16, 13 June 2019</i> .....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Margulev v. Russia, 15449/09, 8 October 2019</i> .....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Martínez Agirre and Others v. Spain (dec.), 75529/16 et al., 25 June 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Mehmet Reşit Arslan and Orhan Bingöl v. Turkey, 47121/06 et al., 18 June 2019</i> .....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Melike v. Turkey, 35786/19</i> .....	no. 235	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Mifsud v. Malta, 62257/15, 29 January 2019</i> .....	no. 225	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Mihalache v. Romania [GC], 54012/10, 8 July 2019</i> .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>MİHR Foundation v. Turkey, 10814/07, 7 May 2019</i> .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Mityanin and Leonov v. Russia, 11436/06 and 22912/06, 7 May 2019</i> .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Mortier v. Belgium, 78017/17</i> .....	no. 225	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Mugemangango v. Belgium, 310/15 (relinquishment)</i> .....	no. 230	Legal summary	
<i>Muhammad and Muhammad v. Romania, 80982/12 (relinquishment)</i> .....	no. 226	Legal summary	
<i>Musayev v. Azerbaijan, 54567/13</i> .....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary

## N

<i>Navalnyy v. Russia (no. 2), 43734/14, 9 April 2019</i> .....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Ndayegamiye-Mporamazina v. Switzerland, 16874/12, 5 February 2019</i> .....	no. 226	Judgment	Legal summary

*Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania* [GC], 41720/13, 25 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Nikolyan v. Armenia*, 74438/14, 3 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

## O

*O.H. and G.H. v. Germany*, 53568/18 and 54741/18..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland*, 20147/15,  
5 September 2019..... no. 232 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Orlović and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 16332/18,  
1 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Ozdil and Others v. the Republic of Moldova*, 42305/18, 11 June 2019. no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

## P

*Pantsulai v. Russia (dec.)*, 34275/19, 8 October 2019..... no. 234 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Papageorgiou and Others v. Greece*, 4762/18 and 6140/18,  
31 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Parmak and Bakır v. Turkey*, 22429/07 and 25195/07, 3 December 2019..... no. 235 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Pasquini v. San Marino*, 50956/16, 2 May 2019..... no. 229 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Pastörs v. Germany*, 55225/14, 3 October 2019 ..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Petithory Lanzmann v. France (dec.)*, 23038/19, 12 November 2019 ..... no. 235 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Petukhov v. Ukraine (no. 2)*, 41216/13, 12 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Polyakh and Others v. Ukraine*, 58812/15 et al., 17 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Pop and Others v. Romania (dec.)*, 54494/11 et al., 2 April 2019..... no. 228 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Popović and Others v. Serbia*, 26944/13 et al..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Porchet v. Switzerland (dec.)*, 36391/16, 8 October 2019..... no. 234 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Prunea v. Romania*, 47881/11, 8 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## R

*R.S. v. Hungary*, 65290/14, 2 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rashkovi v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 52257/09, 11 December 2018..... no. 225 | Decision | Legal summary  
*Ratih v. Germany*, 14883/18 ..... no. 225 | Communication | Legal summary  
*Razvozhayev v. Russia and Ukraine and Udaltsov v. Russia*,  
75734/12 et al., 19 November 2019 ..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rola v. Slovenia*, 12096/14 and 39335/16, 4 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Romeo Castaño v. Belgium*, 8351/17, 9 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rook v. Germany*, 1586/15, 25 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rooman v. Belgium* [GC], 18052/11, 31 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary  
*Rustavi 2 Broadcasting Company Ltd and Others v. Georgia*, 16812/17,  
18 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

## S

*S.R. v. Norway*, 43927/17..... no. 228 | Communication | Legal summary  
*S.W. and Others v. Austria*, 1928/19..... no. 226 | Communication | Legal summary

<i>SA-Capital Oy v. Finland</i> , 5556/10, 14 February 2019.....	no. 226	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Savran v. Denmark</i> , 57467/15, 1 October 2019.....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Schweizerische Radio- und Fernsehgesellschaft and Others v. Switzerland (dec.)</i> , 68995/13, 12 November 2019 .....	no. 235	Decision	Legal summary
<i>S.-H. v. Poland</i> , 56846/15 and 56849/15.....	no. 227	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Selahattin Demirtaş v. Turkey (no. 2)</i> , 14305/17 (Chamber judgment of 20 November 2018 – referral).....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Shiozaki v. France</i> , 69802/17.....	no. 230	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Sigurður Einarsson and Others v. Iceland</i> , 39757/15, 4 June 2019.....	no. 230	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Šimunić v. Croatia (dec.)</i> , 20373/17, 22 January 2019 .....	no. 225	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Sine Tsagarakis A.E.E. v. Greece</i> , 17257/13, 23 May 2019.....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Strand Lobben and Others v. Norway [GC]</i> , 37283/13, 10 September 2019 .....	no. 232	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Svanidze v. Georgia</i> , 37809/08, 25 July 2019 .....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Svitlana Ilchenko v. Ukraine</i> , 47166/09, 4 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Szalontay v. Hungary (dec.)</i> , 71327/13, 12 March 2019 .....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Szurovecz v. Hungary</i> , 15428/16, 8 October 2019.....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary

## T

<i>T.I. and Others v. Greece</i> , 40311/10, 18 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Tagiyev and Huseynov v. Azerbaijan</i> , 13274/08, 5 December 2019.....	no. 235	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Tarak and Depe v. Turkey</i> , 70472/12, 9 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Taşdemir v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 52538/09, 12 March 2019.....	no. 228	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Tasev v. North Macedonia</i> , 9825/13, 16 May 2019 .....	no. 229	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Theodorou and Tsotsorou v. Greece</i> , 57854/15, 5 September 2019 .....	no. 232	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Tim Henrik Bruun Hansen v. Denmark</i> , 51072/15, 9 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Tiunov v. Russia</i> , 29442/18.....	no. 226	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Tolić and Others v. Croatia (dec.)</i> , 13482/15 et al., 4 June 2019.....	no. 230	Decision	Legal summary
<i>Tomov and Others v. Russia</i> , 18255/10 et al., 9 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Tunç and Yerbasan v. Turkey (dec.)</i> , 4133/16 and 31542/16, 29 January 2019.....	no. 226	Decision	Legal summary
<i>I.V.Ț. v. Romania</i> , 35582/15.....	no. 226	Communication	Legal summary

## U

<i>Ulemek v. Croatia</i> , 21613/16, 31 October 2019.....	no. 233	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Uzan and Others v. Turkey</i> , 19620/05 et al., 5 March 2019.....	no. 227	Judgment	Legal summary

## V

<i>V.D. and Others v. Russia</i> , 72931/10, 9 April 2019.....	no. 228	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Vavříčka and Others v. the Czech Republic</i> , 47621/13 et al. (relinquishment) .....	no. 235	Legal summary	
<i>Vazagashvili and Shanava v. Georgia</i> , 50375/07, 18 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Volodina v. Russia</i> , 41261/17, 9 July 2019.....	no. 231	Judgment	Legal summary
<i>Volodina v. Russia</i> , 40419/19.....	no. 233	Communication	Legal summary
<i>Vučina v. Croatia (dec.)</i> , 58955/13, 31 October 2019 .....	no. 233	Decision	Legal summary

## W

*Wunderlich v. Germany*, 18925/15, 10 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

## X

*X. v. Poland*, 20741/10..... no. 227 | Communication | Legal summary

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16, 17 January 2019..... no. 225 | Judgment | Legal summary

*X and Others v. Bulgaria*, 22457/16 (Chamber judgment of  
17 January 2019 – referral)..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Xero Flor w Polsce sp. z o.o. v. Poland*, 4907/18..... no. 232 | Communication | Legal summary

## Y

*Yankov v. Bulgaria (dec.)*, 44768/10, 18 June 2019..... no. 231 | Decision | Legal summary

*Yavaş and Others v. Turkey*, 36366/06, 5 March 2019..... no. 227 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Yılmaz v. Turkey*, 36607/06, 4 June 2019..... no. 230 | Judgment | Legal summary

## Z

*Z.A. and Others v. Russia [GC]*, 61411/15 et al., 21 November 2019..... no. 234 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Z.B. v. France*, 46883/15..... no. 230 | Communication | Legal summary

*Zakharchuk v. Russia*, 2967/12, 17 December 2019..... no. 235 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Zelikha Magomadova v. Russia*, 58724/14, 8 October 2019..... no. 233 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Zevnik and Others v. Slovenia (dec.)*, 54893/18, 12 November 2019..... no. 235 | Decision | Legal summary

*Zhdanov and Others v. Russia*, 12200/08 et al., 16 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

*Zülküf Murat Kahraman v. Turkey*, 65808/10, 16 July 2019..... no. 231 | Judgment | Legal summary

## DECISIONS OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTIONS

### EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS

*European Committee for Home-Based Priority Action for the Child and the Family (EUROCEF) v. France, 114/2015, decision on the merits 24 January 2018, made public 15.6.2018* ..... no. 226

Lack of appropriate legal, social and economic protection for unaccompanied foreign minors

*Transgender Europe and ILGA-Europe v. the Czech Republic, 117/2014, decision on admissibility and the merits 15 May 2018, made public 1 October 2018* ..... no. 226

Compulsory sex-change operation with sterilisation for transgender persons in order to obtain legal recognition of their gender identity

### COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION (CJEU)

*A.K. v. Krajowa Rada Sądownictwa and CP and DO v. Sąd Najwyższy, C-585/18, C-624/18 and C-625/18, 19 November 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 234

Need to verify independence of Polish Supreme Court's new chamber with jurisdiction to send judges into retirement

*Abubacarr Jawo v. Bundesrepublik Deutschland, C-163/17, 19 March 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 227

Transfer to another member State of an asylum-seeker under the Dublin III Regulation is inhuman and degrading if it exposes him or her to a situation of extreme material poverty

*Austria v. Germany, C-591/17, 18 June 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 230

The German vignette for the use by passenger vehicles of federal roads is discriminatory since the economic burden of the charge falls, *de facto*, solely on the owners and drivers of vehicles registered in other member States

*Baltic Media Alliance Ltd v. Lietuvos radijo ir televizijos komisija, C-622/17, 4 July 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 231

A member State may, for reasons of public policy such as combating incitement to hatred, impose a temporary obligation to broadcast or retransmit a television channel from another member State only in pay-to-view packages

*Bashar Ibrahim and Others v. Bundesrepublik Deutschland, C-297/17, C-318/17, C-319/17, and Bundesrepublik Deutschland v. Taus Magamadov (C-438/17), 19 March 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 227

The lack of subsistence allowances in a member State which had granted subsidiary protection does not in itself demonstrate that the rejection of an asylum application by another member State would expose the person concerned to inhuman or degrading living conditions

*Blaise and Others, C-616/17, 1 October 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 233

Environment and protection of human health – Placing of plant protection products on the market – Precautionary principle



- Cresco Investigation GmbH v. Markus Achatzi, C-193/17, 22 January 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 225  
The grant of a paid public holiday on Good Friday only to employees members of certain churches constituted discrimination on grounds of religion
- DK, C-653/19 PPU, 28 November 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 235  
Inapplicability of EU law, including the Charter of Fundamental Rights, to national legislation governing burden of proof in proceedings the sole purpose of which was the continuation of the detention on remand of an accused pending trial
- Deutsche Umwelthilfe eV v. Freistaat Bayern, C-752/18, 19 December 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 235  
Conditions for coercive detention in respect of senior political representatives or senior officials refusing to comply with judicial order enforcing EU law
- European Commission v. Italy, C-621/16 P, 26 March 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 227  
In the selection procedure for European Union staff, differences of treatment based on language must be justified by the real needs of the service and be foreseeable through clear criteria
- European Commission v. Poland, C-619/18, 24 June 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 230  
The lowering of the retirement age of judges of the Supreme Court and the discretionary power of the President of the Republic to extend the performance of their duties are contrary to EU law
- Fashion ID GmbH & Co. KG v. Verbraucherzentrale NRW eV, C-40/17, 29 July 2019 (CJEU)* ..... no. 231  
The operator of a website that features a Facebook "Like" button can be a controller jointly with Facebook in respect of the collection and transmission to Facebook of the personal data of visitors to its website
- GC and Others v. Commission nationale de l'informatique et des libertés (CNIL), C-136/17, 24 September 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)* ..... no. 232  
Internet search engines – Balancing concurring interests at stake in requests for de-referencing
- Google LLC (successor in law to Google Inc. v. Commission nationale de l'informatique et des libertés (CNIL), C-507/17, 24 September 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 232  
Internet search engines – Territorial scope of the right to de-referencing
- JR and YC, C-566/19 PPU and C-626/19 PPU, 12 December 2019 (CJEU)* ..... no. 235  
Requisite guarantee of independence on the part of judges, particularly with regard to the executive, in order to be empowered to issue a European arrest warrant for the purposes of criminal proceedings
- M v. Ministerstvo vnitra and X v. Commissaire général aux réfugiés et aux apatrides, C-391/16, C-77/17 and C-78/17, 14 May 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 229  
Validity of the provisions of the Refugee Directive relating to the revocation of and refusal to grant refugee status on grounds connected with the protection of the security or the community of the host Member State

- OG and PI v. Public Prosecutor's Office In Lübeck and in Zwickau, C-508/18 and C-82/19 PPU, 27 May 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*
- PF v. Prosecutor General of Lithuania, C-509/18, 27 May 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 229  
Need for the judicial authority issuing a European arrest warrant to be independent from the executive
- Oriol Junqueras Vies, C-502/19, 19 December 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 235  
Fields of application of immunities protecting citizens elected to European Parliament while in pre-trial detention
- Österreichischer Gewerkschaftsbund, Gewerkschaft Öffentlicher Dienst v. Republik Österreich, C-24/17, and Martin Leitner v. Landespolizeidirektion Tirol, C-396/17, 8 May 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 229  
System of remuneration and advancement of State officials and contractual public servants amounts to discrimination on grounds of age on the date of their recruitment
- RE v. Praxair MRC SAS, C-486/18, 8 May 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 229  
Calculation of compensation payments for dismissal and redeployment of an employee who is on part-time parental leave must be carried out on the basis of the full-time salary
- RH, C-8/19 PPU, 12 February 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 227  
Incompatibility with European Union law of national legislation prohibiting the pre-trial detention judge from staying proceedings pending a reply from the CJEU  
Possibility for the pre-trial detention judge to reply to the detainee's defence counsel, comparing the incriminating and exculpatory evidence, without infringing the presumption of innocence
- Sergejs Buivids v. Datu valsts inspekcija, C-345/17, 14 February 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 227  
The recording and publication on a website of a video of police officers unwittingly filmed in a police station constitute personal data processing  
In order to come under the specific rules on balancing journalistic purposes with the protection of private life, such a video must have the sole object of disclosing information, opinions or ideas to the public
- SM v. Entry Clearance Officer, UK Visa Section, C-129/18, 26 March 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 227  
The Algerian *kafala* system does not create a direct parent-child relationship between a minor and his guardian, an EU citizen, but it is an important factor in terms of family reunification
- Spain v. European Parliament, C-377/16, 26 March 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)*..... no. 227  
In the selection procedure for European Union staff, differences of treatment based on language must be justified by the real needs of the service and be foreseeable through clear criteria
- Staatssecretaris van Veiligheid en Justitie v. Y.Z. and Others, C-557/17, 14 March 2019 (CJEU)*..... no. 227  
Necessity of individual examination of situations in cases of withdrawal of residence permits obtained in the context of family reunification based on falsified documents  
Ignorance on the part of the beneficiary of a residence permit concerning the fraudulent nature of the documents produced for family reunification does not preclude its withdrawal

<i>TC, C-492/18 PPU, 12 February 2019 (CJEU)</i> .....	no. 227
Possibility of maintaining the enforcement of a European arrest warrant beyond the 90-day limit set out in the Framework Decision where there is a very serious and unavoidable risk of the person absconding	
Necessity to harmonise lengths of detention in the various jurisprudential cases of suspension of the period of enforcement of a European warrant (request to the CJEU for a preliminary ruling or conditions of detention in the issuing State)	
<i>Tjebbes and Others v. Minister van Buitenlandse Zaken, C-221/17, 12 March 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)</i> .....	no. 227
Possible loss of nationality of a member State and of EU citizenship in the event of a lengthy interruption of the genuine link between the individual and that member State	
<i>TopFit eV and Daniele Biffi v. Deutscher Leichtathletikverband eV, C-22/18, 13 June 2019 (CJEU)</i> ....	no. 230
The exclusion, in part, of nationals of other member States from the German senior amateur athletics championships may be contrary to EU law	
<i>Violeta Villar Láiz v. Instituto Nacional de la Seguridad Social (INSS) and Tesorería General de la Seguridad Social (TGSS), C-161/18, 8 May 2019 (CJEU)</i> .....	no. 229
The legislation on the calculation of retirement pensions for part-time workers, particularly disadvantageous to female workers, is contrary to EU law	
<i>X v. Belgische Staat, C-706/18, 20 November 2019 (CJEU)</i> .....	no. 235
Incompatibility with EU law of automatic issuance of residence permits to family members of third-country national after expiry of time-limit set for examination of application for family reunification	
<i>XD, C-625/19 PPU, 12 December 2019 (CJEU)</i> .....	no. 235
Necessity of judicial review of the conditions for issue and the proportionality of a European arrest warrant issued by the prosecution for the purposes of criminal proceedings	
<i>WA v. Instituto Nacional de la Seguridad Social (INSS), C-450/18, 12 December 2019 (CJEU)</i> .....	no. 235
Discriminatory nature of legislation excluding men from the right to a pension supplement granted to women in receipt of a contributory permanent incapacity pension who have had at least two children	
<i>ZB, C-627/19 PPU, 12 December 2019 (CJEU)</i> .....	no. 235
No need for a separate judicial appeal against a prosecution decision to issue a European arrest warrant for the purposes of enforcing a sentence	
<i>Zubair Haqbin v. Federaal Agentschap voor de opvang van asielzoekers, C-233/18, 12 November 2019 (CJEU, Grand Chamber)</i> .....	no. 234
Applicants for international protection – Violence or breaches of the rules of the accommodation centres – Limits to applicable sanctions – Housing, food or clothing – Minors	

## INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS (IACtHR)

- Alvarado Espinoza et al. v. Mexico, Series C No. 370, 28 November 2018*..... no. 228  
State obligations regarding forced disappearances and participation of armed forces in public security tasks
- Álvarez Ramos v. Venezuela, Series C No. 380, 30 August 2019*..... no. 233  
Criminal proceedings and conviction due to publication of op-ed denouncing alleged mismanagement of funds in the Legislative Assembly of Venezuela
- Arrom Suhurt and Others v. Paraguay, Series C No. 377, 13 May 2019*..... no. 232  
Establishing State responsibility for forced disappearance and torture
- Colindres Schonenberg v. El Salvador, Series C No. 373, 4 February 2019*..... no. 229  
Right to a fair trial and right to judicial protection in the removal of judges
- Gorigoitía v. Argentina, Series C No. 382, 2 September 2019*..... no. 235  
State obligations with respect to the right to appeal a judgment to a higher court and the general obligation of the State to guarantee compliance with the American Convention on Human Rights at domestic level
- López Soto et al. v. Venezuela, Series C No. 362, 26 September 2018*..... no. 225  
Reinforced duty of due diligence for victims of torture and sexual slavery
- Martínez Coronado v. Guatemala, Series C No. 376, 10 May 2019*..... no. 232  
Application of death penalty in violation of right to life and principle of legality, and violation of right to a fair trial
- Members of the Village of Chichupac and neighboring communities of the Municipality of Rabinal, Case of Molina Theissen and 12 other Guatemalan Cases v. Guatemala, provisional measures and monitoring compliance with judgment, 12 March 2019*..... no. 230  
Right to access to justice affected by a bill seeking to grant amnesty for all the gross violations committed during the internal armed conflict in Guatemala
- Muelle Flores v. Peru, Series C No. 375, 6 March 2019*..... no. 231  
Violation of right to social security due to the denial of a pension
- Villamizar Durán et al. v. Colombia, Series C No. 364, 20 November 2018*..... no. 226  
Killings (also known as *falsos positivos* – “false positives”) carried out by members of the armed forces as part of attacks on civilians in various parts of Colombia
- Women Victims of Sexual Torture in Atenco v. Mexico, Series C No. 371, 28 November 2018*..... no. 227  
State obligations in cases of sexual torture by State security forces

## UNITED NATIONS COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD (CRC)

- Y.B. and N.S. v. Belgium, communication 12/2007, views 5 November 2018*..... no. 226  
Denial of visa to child taken in under *kafalah*

## UNITED NATIONS HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE (CCPR)

*Klemetti Kakkalajarvi and Others v. Finland, communication 2950/2017, views 1 February 2019* ..... [no. 226](#)

Right to vote in elections to the Sami parliament granted by Supreme Administrative Court to individuals who had been found ineligible to vote by the Sami parliament

*Tiina Sanila-Aikio v. Finland, communication 2668/2015, views 1 February 2019*..... [no. 226](#)

Right to vote in elections to the Sami parliament granted by Supreme Administrative Court to individuals who had been found ineligible to vote by the Sami parliament