2022

January-September

INDEX

to the Information Notes on the Court's case-law



Index of the Court's case-law summarised in the Information Notes during 2022

European Court of Human Rights





The Information Note contains legal summaries of the cases examined during the month in question which the Registry considers to be of particular interest. The summaries are drafted by lawyers under the authority of the Jurisconsult and are not binding on the Court. They are normally drafted in the language of the case concerned. The translation of the legal summaries into the other official language can be accessed directly through hyperlinks in the Note. These hyperlinks lead to the HUDOC database, which is regularly updated with new translations.

An annual index provides an overview of all the judgments and decisions summarised in each calendar year, filtered by Convention Articles and relevant keywords. To facilitate access to materials in the Information Notes, a running cumulative index will be updated online with each new edition of the Note.

The electronic versions of the Note and the index may be downloaded at www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en. Legal summaries published in the Case-law Information Notes are also available in HUDOC under the filter and links "Legal Summaries".

The HUDOC database is available free-of-charge through the Court's Internet site (http://hudoc.echr.coe.int). It provides access to the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber, Chamber and Committee judgments and decisions, communicated cases, advisory opinions and legal summaries from the Case-Law Information Note) and of the former European Commission of Human Rights (decisions and reports), and to the resolutions of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.

European Court of Human Rights Council of Europe 67075 Strasbourg Cedex France Tel: +33 (0)3 88 41 20 18 publishing@echr.coe.int www.echr.coe.int twitter.com/ECHR_CEDH RSS feeds

Photograph: Council of Europe

Cover: interior of the Human Rights Building (Architects: Richard Rogers Partnership and Atelier Claude Bucher)

© Council of Europe / European Court of Human Rights, 2022

The Court's Knowledge Sharing platform (ECHR-KS) will be available to the public as of 18 October 2022.

Having regard to the content of ECHR-KS which will be updated weekly, the monthly compilation of Legal Summaries (the Case-Law Information Note or "CLIN") and its index will no longer be published by the Court.

The individual Legal Summaries will remain accessible as before on HUDOC and will also be referenced on ECHR-KS.

Table of contents

ARTICLE 1		
	Jurisdiction of States	8
ARTICLE 2		
	Life	8
	Use of force	
	Positive obligations (substantive aspect)	8
	Effective investigation	9
	Positive obligations (procedural aspect)	9
ARTICLE 3		
	Inhuman or degrading treatment	g
	Degrading treatment	
	Positive obligations (substantive aspect)	10
	Effective investigation	10
	Extradition	10
ARTICLE 5		
Article 5 § 1		
711 (1010 3 3 1	Lawful arrest or detention	10
Article 5 § 1 (e)		
7 d. c. c	Persons of unsound mind	11
Article 5 § 3		
	Reasonableness of pre-trial detention	11
ARTICLE 6		
Article 6 § 1 (civ		
	Civil rights and obligations	11
	Access to court	
	Fair hearing	
	Reasonable time	
	Independent and impartial tribunal Tribunal established by law	
Article 6 § 1 (cr	iminal)	
	Access to court	12
	Fair hearing	12
Article 6 § 1 (ad	·	
	Access to court Adversarial trial	13
Article 6 § 1 (co		
	Access to court	

Article 6 § 2	Presumption of innocence	13
Article 6 § 3 (a)		
,	Information on nature and cause of accusation	13
Article 6 § 3 (c)		
	Defence through legal assistance	
	Legal assistance of own choosing	14
Article 6 § 3 (d)		
	Examination of witnesses	14
ARTICLE 7		
ARTICLE 7	Nullum crimen sine lege Nulla poena sine lege	14
	Retroactivity	
ARTICLE 8		
	Respect for private and family life	
	Respect for private life	
	Respect for family life	
	Respect for homeRespect for correspondence	
	Positive obligations	
ARTICLE 9		
	Manifest religion or belief	17
ADTICLE 40		
ARTICLE 10	Freedom of expression	17
	Freedom to impart information	
	Treedom to impare information	13
ARTICLE 11		
	Freedom of peaceful assembly	19
	Freedom of association	
	Form and join trade unions	20
ARTICLE 13		
ARTICLE 13	Effective remedy	20
	Literature remedy	20
ARTICLE 14		
	Discrimination (Article 2)	20
	Discrimination (Article 3)	
	Discrimination (Article 5)	
	Discrimination (Article 8)	
	Discrimination (Article 9)	
	Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)	21

ARTICLE 34		
	Victim Hinder the exercise of the right of application	
ARTICLE 35		
Article 35 § 1		
	Exhaustion of domestic remedies Effective domestic remedy – Russia	
ARTICLE 37		
	Striking out applications	22
ARTICLE 46		
	Execution of judgment	
	Execution of judgment – Individual measures	
	Execution of judgment – General and individual measures	23
Article 46 § 4		
	Infringement proceedings	23
ARTICLE 1 OF	PROTOCOL No. 1	
	Peaceful enjoyment of possessions	
	Deprivation of property	
	Control of the use of property Positive obligations	
ARTICLE 3 OF	PROTOCOL No. 1	
ARTICLE 5 OF	Free expression of the opinion of the people Vote	24
	Stand for election	
ARTICLE 2 OF	PROTOCOL No. 4	
Article 2 § 2		
Article 2 § 2	Freedom to leave a country	24
ARTICLE 3 OF	PROTOCOL No. 4	
Article 3 § 2		
7111010 3 3 2	Enter own country	25
ARTICLE 4 OF	PROTOCOL No. 4	
	Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens	25
ARTICLE 4 OF	PROTOCOL No. 7	
	Right not to be tried or punished twice	25

ARTICLE 1 OF PF	ROTOCOL No. 12	
	General prohibition of discrimination	25
PROTOCOL No.	16	
	Advisory opinions	25

Cases listed by Convention Article and keyword

ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of States

Death of Spanish soldier, killed during UN peace-keeping mission by Israeli artillery in Lebanon: outside jurisdiction; inadmissible

Refusal to repatriate nationals held in Kurd-run camps after the fall of "Islamic State": *outside jurisdiction* as to alleged ill-treatment; within jurisdiction as to the right to enter own State

H.F. and Others v. France [GC], 24384/19 and 44234/20, 14.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 2

Life

Specific omissions and delays by the national authorities in conducting and organising operation to rescue refugees whose boat had sunk, causing several deaths: *violation*

Safi and Others v. Greece, 5418/15, 7.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Use of force

Use of lethal force during police operation against individual, wrongly identified as dangerous fugitive, not absolutely necessary: *violation*

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Failure to prevent gender-based violence by a police officer: violation

A and B v. Georgia, 73975/16, 10.2.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Immediate and appropriate action by the authorities to trace a missing 18-year-old woman with schizophrenia and suicidal tendencies: *no violation*

Gonçalves Monteiro v. Portugal, 65666/16, 15.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Authorities' failure to protect life of woman murdered by her husband, despite her several complaints about domestic violence over 9-month period: *violation*

Y and Others v. Bulgaria, 9077/18, 22.3.2022.....Judgment | Legal summary

No measures to protect life of conscript who committed suicide, against backdrop of harassment, monetary disputes and discouragement of reporting misconduct in his military unit: *violation*

Nana Muradyan v. Armenia, 69517/11, 5.4.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Authorities' failure to take preventive action against recurrent domestic violence leading to the applicant's attempted murder by her partner and their son's actual murder: *violation*

Landi v. Italy, 10929/19, 7.4.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Absence of real and immediate risk to life of well-known writer, subject of a religious fatwa with no subsequent threats or intimidation, fatally stabbed by unknown person: *violation*

Effective investigation

Thorough and sufficient scope of legacy inquest into fatal shooting by soldiers in Northern Ireland, despite certain identified weaknesses: *inadmissible*

Failure to investigate the law-enforcement authorities' passive response following gender-based violence by a police officer: *violation*

Lack of promptness and effectiveness of the investigation into the disappearance of a young woman with schizophrenia and suicidal tendencies: *violation*

Gonçalves Monteiro v. Portugal, 65666/16, 15.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Lack of effective investigation into the sinking of a boat carrying refugees, some of whom died: violation

Safi and Others v. Greece, 5418/15, 7.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Ineffective investigation following the use of lethal force during police operation against individual, wrongly identified as dangerous fugitive, not absolutely necessary: *violation*

Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Death of participant in clinical trial of new medicine, failure to effectively implement regulatory framework and ensure informed consent: *violation*

Traskunova v. Russia, 21648/11, 30.8.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman or degrading treatment

Detention for two years in an ordinary prison of a person suffering from bipolar disorder, in poor conditions and without any overall therapeutic strategy to treat his condition: *violation*

Fourteen days' administrative detention pending removal of an eight-year-old foreign national accompanied by his parents, in an unsuitable centre: *violation*

N.B. and Others v. France, 49775/20, 31.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Applicability to "feminising" medical procedures carried out on an intersex person during childhood, without the person's knowledge or consent: question left open

Placement of minor in adult reception centre in inadequate conditions for more than four months and subjected to age-assessment procedure breaching Article 8: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, 5797/17, 21.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Sterilisation without consent not reaching requisite severity threshold, given unexpected and urgent context and lack of bad faith on doctors' part: *inadmissible*

Y.P. v. Russia, 43399/13, 20.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Degrading treatment

Body searches of refugees arriving on a Greek island after their boat had sunk, who were ordered by the security forces to undress at the same time and in the same place, in front of at least thirteen people: *violation*

Safi and Others v. Greece, 5418/15, 7.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Adequate and proportionate measures during Covid-19 pandemic protecting health of detained applicant, lacking a kidney, and limiting spread of virus in the prison: *no violation*

Fenech v. Malta, 19090/20, 1.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Failure to protect LGBT bar owner and activist from homophobic arson, physical and verbal attacks and to carry out effective investigation: *violation*

Oganezova v. Armenia, 71367/12 and/et 72961/12, 17.5.2022.................Judgment | Legal summary

Effective investigation

Failure to protect LGBT bar owner and activist from homophobic arson, physical and verbal attacks and to carry out effective investigation: *violation*

Oganezova v. Armenia, 71367/12 and/et 72961/12, 17.5.2022...................Judgment | Legal summary

Failure to effectively investigate alleged death threats against vulnerable rape victim by her abuser and father, in breach of domestic law: violation

Extradition

No real individual risk of ill-treatment in case of extradition of ethnic Uzbeks to Kyrgyzstan: extradition would not constitute a violation

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Lawful arrest or detention

Lawful pre-trial detention of high-ranking official relating to parallel pending criminal cases, no evidence of procedural manipulation: *inadmissible*

Akhalaia v. Georgia (dec.), 30464/13 and 19068/14, 7.6.2022...... Decision | Legal summary

Several months' detention in the extraditing State lawful, despite 30-day period indicated in the detention order of the receiving State and counted from the date of extradition: *no violation*

Gilanov v. the Republic of Moldova, 44719/10, 13.9.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Article 5 § 1 (e)

Persons of unsound mind

Continued detention in an ordinary prison of a person suffering from bipolar disorder, despite the domestic court order for his transfer to an appropriate institution, for lack of available places: *violation*

Compulsory confinement for about 3 years warranted by applicant's persisting mental disorder verified on the basis of objective medical expertise: *no violation*

Article 5 § 3

Reasonableness of pre-trial detention

Relevant and sufficient reasons for lengthy pre-trial detention (nearly two years) of high-ranking official relating to four criminal cases, with authorities exercising special diligence: *inadmissible*

Akhalaia v. Georgia (dec.), 30464/13 and 19068/14, 7.6.2022...... Decision | Legal summary

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

Civil rights and obligations

Lack of judicial review of premature termination ex lege, after legislative reform, of a serving judge's mandate as member of the National Council of the Judiciary: *violation*

Access to court

Cancellation without judicial review of the suspensive effect of fathers' appeals, thereby enabling their children to leave the country with their mothers and removing the jurisdiction of the domestic courts: *violations*

Plazzi v. Switzerland, 44101/18, 8.2.2022......Judgment | Legal summary Roth v. Switzerland, 69444/17, 8.2.2022.....Judgment | Legal summary

Lack of judicial review of premature termination ex lege, after legislative reform, of a serving judge's mandate as member of the National Council of the Judiciary: *violation*

State immunity legislation preventing applicants from bringing employment claims after dismissal from foreign embassies within the United Kingdom: *violations*

Benkharbouche and Janah v. the United Kingdom, 19059/18 and 19725/18,

5.4.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Overly formalistic decision finding a legal challenge barred for failure to e-file, practical hurdles notwithstanding: *violation*

Xavier Lucas v. France, 15567/20, 9.6.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Fair hearing

Fair balance between parties in, and adversarial nature of, civil proceedings not upset by participation of a prosecutor, independent officer with no special powers under domestic law: no violation

No sufficiently compelling reason justifying a retrospective law determining the substance of pensions disputes in pending proceedings: *violation*

Reasonable time

Unreasonable length of proceedings, lasting six years and ongoing, for grandparent requesting foster care of grandchildren without parental care, not justified by Covid-19 related measures: *violation*

Independent and impartial tribunal

Insufficient procedural guarantees in appointment of lay members of disciplinary court and in their protection from outside pressure: *violation*

Grosam v. the Czech Republic, 19750/13, 23.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Tribunal established by law

Manifest breaches, following legislative reform, in appointment to Supreme Court's Civil Chamber of judges who examined applicant company's civil appeal: *violation*

Advance Pharma sp. z o.o v. Poland, 1469/20, 3.2.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

Access to court

Limitation period invoked in response to a criminal complaint by an intersex person concerning feminising medical procedures carried out during childhood, where other remedies were still available: *inadmissible*

Fair hearing

Use at trial of initial confession by terrorist suspect held incommunicado and denied, without individualised reasons, access to lawyer of own choice and legal-aid lawyer: *violation*

Atristain Gorosabel v. Spain, 15508/15, 18.1.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Conviction based on written statements of absent witnesses, who were examined by the courts of their places of residence, absent reasonable efforts by the trial court to secure their attendance: *violation*

Faysal Pamuk v. Turkey, 430/13, 18.1.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Applicant's conviction based on his statements and those of co-accused, having been given at initial stage of investigation without access to a lawyer, pursuant to the applicable law: *violation*

Tonkov v. Belgium, 41115/14, 8.3.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Trial fairness undermined through failure to inform of charges and provide legal assistance to applicant questioned as a witness, while being already under investigation and suspected: *violation*

Bjarki H. Diego v. Iceland, 30965/17, 15.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Pre-trial judge proceedings confirming indictment decision not weakening applicant's position so as to render subsequent criminal trial against him unfair *ab initio*: *no violation*

Alexandru-Radu Luca v. Romania, 20837/18, 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Applicant convicted of resistance to police on sole basis of statements by officers including those who had subjected him to degrading treatment as acknowledged by Government: *violation*

Sufficiently reasoned dismissal of criminal appeal, consequent on a tie vote, based on applicant's failure to discharge his burden of proof as required by domestic law: *no violation*

Loizides v. Cyprus, 31029/15, 5.7.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 1 (administrative)

Access to court | Adversarial trial

Bank unable to properly seek judicial review of licence withdrawal, or to state its case and protect its interests in insolvency and winding-up proceedings: *violations*

Korporativna Targovska Banka AD v. Bulgaria, 46564/15 and 68140/16,
30.8.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 1 (constitutional)

Access to court

Disproportionate refusal to award costs for complaint before Constitutional Court concerning applicant's divestment of legal capacity: *violation*

Dragan Kovačević v. Croatia, 49281/15, 12.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 2

Presumption of innocence

Criminal acquittal issued after court of appeal judgment establishing civil liability for the same conduct and relied upon before cassation court to contest that liability: Article 6 § 2 applicable

Diamantopoulos v. Greece (dec.), 68144/13, 8.3.2022 Decision | Legal summary

Article 6 § 3 (a)

Information on nature and cause of accusation

Trial fairness undermined through failure to inform of charges and provide legal assistance to applicant questioned as a witness, while being already under investigation and suspected: *violation*

Bjarki H. Diego v. Iceland, 30965/17, 15.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 3 (c)

Defence through legal assistance

Use at trial of initial confession by terrorist suspect held incommunicado and denied, without individualised reasons, access to lawyer of own choice and legal-aid lawyer: *violation*

Atristain Gorosabel v. Spain, 15508/15, 18.1.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Applicant's conviction based on his statements and those of co-accused, having been given at initial stage of investigation without access to a lawyer, pursuant to the applicable law: *violation*

Trial fairness undermined through failure to inform of charges and provide legal assistance to applicant questioned as a witness, while being already under investigation and suspected: *violation*

Bjarki H. Diego v. Iceland, 30965/17, 15.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Pre-trial judge proceedings confirming indictment decision not weakening applicant's position so as to render subsequent criminal trial against him unfair *ab initio*: *no violation*

Alexandru-Radu Luca v. Romania, 20837/18, 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Legal assistance of own choosing

Use at trial of initial confession by terrorist suspect held incommunicado and denied, without individualised reasons, access to lawyer of own choice and legal-aid lawyer: *violation*

Atristain Gorosabel v. Spain, 15508/15, 18.1.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 3 (d)

Examination of witnesses

Conviction based on written statements of absent witnesses, who were examined by the courts of their places of residence, absent reasonable efforts by the trial court to secure their attendance: *violation*

Faysal Pamuk v. Turkey, 430/13, 18.1.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 7

Nullum crimen sine lege | Nulla poena sine lege

Advisory opinion on the applicability of statutes of limitation to the prosecution, conviction and punishment in respect of an offence constituting, in substance, an act of torture

Retroactivity

Retroactive application of criminal law for deliberate false registration of immigrants at applicant's property: *violation*

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Transgender person unable to obtain a full birth certificate without gender reassignment reference, while its short extract and new ID documents indicate only reassigned gender: no violation

Inability to obtain recognition of a legal relationship between a child and the biological mother's ex-partner: *no violation*

C.E. and Others v. France, 29775/18 and 29693/19, 24.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Respect for private life

Inadequate legal safeguards against arbitrariness and abuse for secret surveillance, retention and access of communications data: *violations*

Ekimdzhiev v. Bulgaria, 70078/12, 11.1.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Unjustified dismissal of appeal against failure to comply with statutory requirement to obtain written consent for one of three related surgical operations: *violation*

Reyes Jimenez v. Spain, 57020/18, 8.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Lawful and proportionate disclosure of intercepted conversation by Prime Minister on public interest matter, despite reputational impact: *no violation*

Algirdas Butkevičius v. Lithuania, 70489/17, 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Practically unfettered power exercised by the national intelligence service implementing surveillance operation, without adequate safeguards or protection to those randomly affected: *violation*

Haščák v. Slovakia, 58359/12 et al., 23.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Police report on judges who signed a manifesto on the Catalan people's "right to decide" and insufficient inquiry into data leak to press: *violation*

General and indiscriminate ban on prisoner possession of pornographic material not permitting proportionality assessment in an individual case: *violation*

Chocholáč v. Slovakia, 81292/17, 7.7.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Unaccompanied minor asylum-seeker placed in adult reception centre, not provided minimum procedural guarantees in age-assessment procedure: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, 5797/17, 21.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Significant flaws in criminal investigation concerning alleged sexual harassment at the workplace: violation

Authorities' failure to adequately protect confidentiality of applicant's health data and to investigate its disclosure through a database being sold in a market: *violation*

Applicant's conviction and fine for manufacturing cannabis for personal treatment of chronic pain, without prescription, within State's wide margin of appreciation: *no violation*

Collection of data on sexual behaviour of potential blood donor based on speculation, and excessive length of data retention by public body: violation Drelon v. France, 3153/16 and 27758/18, 8.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary No legal basis for disciplinary sanctions leading to imposition of stricter prison regime and repeated prison transfers: violation Stanislav Lutsenko v. Ukraine (no. 2), 483/10, 15.9.2022.......Judgment | Legal summary Refusal of a civil claim by the applicants, accused of criminal conduct in respect of their missing daughter by a former police officer who had been responsible for the extensively publicised investigation, which was discontinued for lack of evidence: no violation McCann and Healy v. Portugal, 57195/17, 20.9.2022......Judgment | Legal summary Sterilisation without consent in breach of domestic law, failure of domestic courts to establish responsibility and provide redress: violation Respect for family life Court's refusal to hear young children without parental care represented by social services, and not by special guardian, in foster care proceedings brought by applicant grandparents: no violation Respect for home Entry of police into home, without legal basis or consent of alien who let them in, in connection with removal decision: violation Sabani v. Belgium, 53069/15, 8.3.2022......Judgment | Legal summary Domestic court proceedings and orders requiring members of Traveller community to vacate a site being illegally occupied: inadmissible Faulkner and McDonagh v. Ireland (dec.), 30391/18 and 30416/18, 8.3.2022 Decision | Legal summary Respect for correspondence Inadequate legal safeguards against arbitrariness and abuse for secret surveillance, retention and access of communications data: violations Lawful and proportionate disclosure of intercepted conversation by Prime Minister on public interest matter, despite reputational impact: no violation Algirdas Butkevičius v. Lithuania, 70489/17, 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary **Positive obligations** Unjustified dismissal of appeal against failure to comply with statutory requirement to obtain written consent for one of three related surgical operations: violation

Reyes Jimenez v. Spain, 57020/18, 8.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Inability to obtain recognition of a legal relationship between a child and the biological mother's ex-partner: no violation

C.E. and Others v. France, 29775/18 and 29693/19, 24.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Police report on judges who signed a manifesto on the Catalan people's "right to decide" and insufficient inquiry into data leak to press: violation

Unaccompanied minor asylum-seeker placed in adult reception centre, not provided minimum procedural guarantees in age-assessment procedure: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, 5797/17, 21.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Significant flaws in criminal investigation concerning alleged sexual harassment at the workplace: violation

C. v. Romania, 47358/20, 30.8.2022Judgment | Legal summary

All available procedural avenues ineffective for applicant claiming medical negligence after breast removal surgery performed on basis of oncologist's mistaken cancer diagnosis: *violation*

Tusă v. Romania, 21854/18, 30.8.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Authorities' failure to adequately protect confidentiality of applicant's health data and to investigate its disclosure through a database being sold in a market: *violation*

Y.G. v. Russia, 8647/12, 30.8.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Failure to protect applicant against new owner who unlawfully and forcibly entered his home preventing further access to it; interference through unlawful eviction by bailiff: *violation*

Jansons v. Latvia, 1434/14, 8.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Refusal of a civil claim by the applicants, accused of criminal conduct in respect of their missing daughter by a former police officer who had been responsible for the extensively publicised investigation, which was discontinued for lack of evidence: *no violation*

McCann and Healy v. Portugal, 57195/17, 20.9.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 9

Manifest religion or belief

Unjustified refusal to allocate room in high-security prison to Muslim prisoner for congregational Friday prayers: *violation*

Abdullah Yalçın v. Turkey (no. 2), 34417/10, 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 10

Freedom of expression

Journalist's unjustified and disproportionate conviction and sanctioning for statements on well-known legal entities at public Parliamentary Commission hearing: *violation*

Freitas Rangel v. Portugal, 78873/13, 11.1.2022Judgment | Legal summary

14 EUR fine on counter-demonstrator for displaying, amid the crowd of his opponents, provocative banner distorting the event's message and likely to cause unrest: *no violation*

No legitimate aim for civil defamation proceedings against a media outlet, seeking to protect "reputation" of a public authority as such and unrelated to any economic activity: violation

Justified revocation of broadcasting licence of a TV channel after repeated and serious breach of the statutory requirement to ensure political balance and pluralism in news bulletins: no violation

NIT S.R.L. v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], 28470/12, 5.4.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Prosecution for administrative offences for calling on voters not to vote for a party or to abstain from voting in elections: violation Teslenko and Others v. Russia, 49588/12 et al, 5.4.2022Judgment | Legal summary Justified and proportionate conviction and suspended prison sentence imposed on proeuthanasia physician for assistance and advice to specific persons on how to commit suicide: no violation Lings v. Denmark, 15136/20, 12.4.2022......Judgment | Legal summary Newspaper prohibited from publishing image with "convicted neo-Nazi" caption, 20 years after plaintiff's conviction, since expunged, given his loss of notoriety and no further criminal conduct: no violation Mediengruppe Österreich GmbH v. Austria, 37713/18, 26.4.2022Judgment | Legal summary Activist fined for a short and peaceful gathering, without prior notice, with three other persons, who handcuffed themselves to a government car park barrier, in protest against a mining project: violation Bumbeş v. Romania, 18079/15, 4.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary Justified civil defamation award, after former President's statement that an advocate needed psychiatric treatment for implicating him in a criminal complaint: no violation Criminal fine for defamation of an elected representative, imposed on a political opponent for publishing political cartoons on his blog targeting the members of the local council as a whole: violation Patrício Monteiro Telo de Abreu v. Portugal, 42713/15, 7.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary Disproportionate prison sentence imposed on former terrorist for praising perpetrators of 2015 Paris attacks, after comments on radio and Internet made a few months after event: violation Rouillan v. France, 28000/19, 23.6.2022......Judgment | Legal summary No reprisals against judges for signing manifesto on the Catalan people's "right to decide" or chilling effect: inadmissible Insufficient reasons for awarding seemingly disproportionate compensation in respect of defamatory articles published by a newspaper: violation Azadliq and Zayidov v. Azerbaijan, 20755/08, 30.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary Insufficient reasons and disproportionate damages award in defamation action against journalist for newspaper article on high-ranking attorney in the Law Office of the State: violation Drousiotis v. Cyprus, 42315/15, 5.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary Criminal liability for deliberate false registration of immigrants at applicant's property, in protest against residence registration system for migrants: Article 10 inapplicable Unjustified search of journalist's home and seizure of his electronic devices without procedural safeguards protecting confidentiality of journalist sources: violation Sorokin v. Russia, 52808/09, 30.8.2022Judgment | Legal summary Applicant convicted of propagandising for a terrorist organisation for cutting and handing out slices of cake in celebration of PKK leader's birthday: *violation*

No relevant and sufficient reasons provided by domestic authorities for removing election observer from polling station: *violation*

Timur Sharipov v. Russia, 15758/13, 13.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Lack of sufficient reasons for conviction and fine for offending religious feelings of others through publicly insulting the Bible: *violation*

Rabczewska v. Poland, 8257/13, 15.9.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Freedom to impart information

Denial of access, on national security grounds, to classified records relating to a sensitive part of country's recent history, accompanied by adequate procedural safeguards and proportionate: no violation

Šeks v. Croatia, 39325/20, 3.2.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 11

Freedom of peaceful assembly

Disproportionately lengthy pre-trial detention and prison sentences for involvement in non-violent, albeit disruptive, courthouse protest: *violation*

Ekrem Can and Others v. Turkey, 10613/10, 8.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Blanket ban on public meetings for two and a half months at the start of the COVID-19 pandemic, with associated criminal sanctions and no judicial review of proportionality: *violation*

Communauté genevoise d'action syndicale (CGAS) v. Switzerland,

Freedom of association

Dismissal of employees on account of their involvement in a strike organised outside a tradeunion context: *Article 11 not applicable; inadmissible*

Barış and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 66828/16 et al., 14.12.2021...... Decision | Legal summary

Criminal conviction of trade union representative, for refusing to admit would-be members to join, not necessary in a democratic society: *violation*

Vlahov v. Croatia, 31163/13, 5.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Refusal to authorise a political party to hold a congress in various towns, on the grounds that it had insufficient local branches, as a precondition for being able to put up candidates in parliamentary elections: *no violation*

Yeşiller ve Sol Gelecek Partisi v. Turkey, 41955/14, 10.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Domestic court failure to apply convention standards and acceptably assess employee sanctions, in response to a complaint by a trade union, imposed on its representative: *violation*

Straume v. Latvia, 59402/14, 2.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Application of Foreign Agents Act to non-governmental organisations and their directors neither prescribed by law nor necessary in a democratic society: *violation*

Ecodefence and Others v. Russia, 9988/13 et al., 14.6.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Form and join trade unions

Legislation, rendering conflicting collective agreements concluded by minority trade unions inapplicable, within the respondent State's margin of appreciation: *no violation*

Association of Civil Servants and Union for Collective Bargaining and Others
v. Germany, 815/18 et al., 5.7.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 13

Effective remedy

Ineffective domestic judicial remedies for complaints as to inadequate conditions of detention: *violation*

Volodya Avetisyan v. Armenia, 39087/15, 3.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 2)

Failure to prevent gender-based violence by a police officer and to investigate the lawenforcement authorities' passive response: *violations*

A and B v. Georgia, 73975/16, 10.2.2022Judgment | Legal summary

No evidence that failure to protect life of murdered woman was due to gender-based discrimination in general or in specific case circumstances: no *violation*

Y and Others v. Bulgaria, 9077/18, 22.3.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

No systemic defect pointing to general passivity *vis-à-vis* victims of domestic violence, and no discriminatory attitude towards the applicant: *inadmissible*

Homophobic motives underlying a murder not constituting a statutory aggravating factor and having no measurable effect on sentencing: *violation*

Stoyanova v. Bulgaria, 56070/18, 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Discrimination (Article 3)

Failure to protect LGBT bar owner and activist from homophobic arson, physical and verbal attacks and to carry out effective investigation: *violation*

Oganezova v. Armenia, 71367/12 and/et 72961/12, 17.5.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Discrimination (Article 5)

Applicant resisting police not in a relevantly similar situation with an individual who has hit a private person: *inadmissible*

P.W. v. Austria, 10425/19, 21.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Discrimination (Article 8)

Revocable and reviewable order prohibiting a Jehovah's Witness from actively involving his young child, brought up in Catholicism, in his religious practice: *no violation*

T.C. v. Italy, 54032/18, 19.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

No discrimination against wheelchair user unable to access two local public buildings, given other considerable measures to improve accessibility: *no violation*

Arnar Helgi Lárusson v. Iceland, 23077/19, 31.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Father of child born out of wedlock unable to exercise parental responsibility without mother's consent, in spite of parentage established by DNA test: *violation*

Paparrigopoulos v. Greece, 61657/16, 30.6.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Exclusion of non-members of Orthodox Jewish Community from social housing owned by a charity catering for that community, within State's wide margin of appreciation: *inadmissible*

L.F. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 19839/21, 24.5.2022...... Decision | Legal summary

Discrimination (Article 9)

No tax exemption for buildings used for the public practice of a non-recognised religion, the rules on such recognition being devoid of the minimum guarantees of fairness and objectivity: *violation*

Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

No tax exemption for buildings used for the public practice of a non-recognised religion, the rules on such recognition being devoid of the minimum guarantees of fairness and objectivity: *violation*

Anderlecht Christian Assembly of Jehovah's Witnesses and Others v. Belgium, 20165/20, 5.4.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Very weighty reasons for exclusion of employment periods accrued in other former USSR states in state pension calculation for permanently resident non-citizens, in contrast to Latvian citizens: *no violation*

Savickis and Others v. Latvia [GC], 49270/11, 9.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Application by the courts of the statute of a 16th-century private foundation, reserving income to the founder's male descendants, to the detriment of a woman and her heirs: *violation*

Dimici v. Türkiye, 70133/16, 5.7.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Advisory opinion on the difference in treatment between landowners' associations "having a recognised existence on the date of the creation of an approved municipal hunters' association" and those set up after that date

Advisory opinion requested by the French *Conseil d'État* [GC], P16-2021-002, 13.7.2022 Opinion | Legal summary

No discrimination against convicted prisoner statutorily disqualified from old-age pension payments while incarcerated: *no violation*

P.C. v. Ireland, 26922/19, 1.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 34

Victim

Unjustified failure over a seven-day period to implement the interim measure aimed at ending the administrative detention pending removal of an underage foreign national: *violation*

N.B. and Others v. France, 49775/20, 31.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Hinder the exercise of the right of application

35-day delay in enforcing the Court's interim measure requesting the placement of a bipolar patient in a specialist centre excessively long: *violation*

Unjustified failure over a seven-day period to implement the interim measure aimed at ending the administrative detention pending removal of an underage foreign national: *violation*

N.B. and Others v. France, 49775/20, 31.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Failure to comply with interim measure through enforcement of dissolution order against a non-governmental organisation: *violation*

Ecodefence and Others v. Russia, 9988/13 et al., 14.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 1

Exhaustion of domestic remedies | Effective domestic remedy - Russia

New effective compensatory remedy to be used as of 1 January 2020 by *bona fide* purchasers of dwellings returned to the State without any award of compensation, including prior to that date

Six-month period

Application lodged within legitimate three-month extension of six-month time-limit during critical spring 2020 period of Covid-19 global pandemic: *preliminary objection dismissed*

Saakashvili v. Georgia (dec.), 6232/20 and 22394/20, 1.3.2022...... Decision | Legal summary

ARTICLE 37

Striking out applications

Government concession as to Convention breaches but inadequate offer of redress: request to strike out dismissed

Benkharbouche and Janah v. the United Kingdom, 19059/18 and 19725/18, 5.4.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 46

Execution of judgment

Striking-out decision not falling within ambit of Article 46, which concerns only final judgments of the Court: *inadmissible*

Boutaffala v. Belgium, 20762/19, 28.6.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Execution of judgment – Individual measures

Respondent state required to take desegregation measures in an elementary school attended almost exclusively by Roma and Egyptian children

X and Others v. Albania, 73548/17 and 45521/19, 31.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Execution of judgment – General and individual measures

Reopening of judicial review proceedings required, but not necessarily leading to reversal of reviewed decision's effects, rather than damages; need for general measures

Korporativna Targovska Banka AD v. Bulgaria, 46564/15 and 68140/16, 30.8.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Article 46 § 4

Infringement proceedings

Infringement proceedings against Türkiye for failure to abide by Court's final judgment explicitly indicating applicant's immediate release: violation

Kavala v. Türkiye [GC], 28749/18, 11.7.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Unjustified refusal to enforce final and binding international arbitration award against National Property Fund after rescission of purchase agreement for State property being privatised: *violation*

BTS Holding a.s. v. Slovakia, 55617/17, 30.6.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

No safeguards against arbitrariness surrounding decision to withdraw a bank's licence: *violation* Korporativna Targovska Banka AD v. Bulgaria, 46564/15 and 68140/16,

Unreasoned dismissal of copyright infringement claim against a private party, who published a digital version of the applicant's book online, without authorisation or paying royalties: violation

Deprivation of property

Refusal to award compensation in respect of the financial burdens arising from the disability of a child, born disabled as a result of a fault during the prenatal diagnosis, through retrospective application of the law: *violation*

N.M. and Others v. France, 66328/14, 3.2.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Return to the State of an unclaimed apartment without any award of compensation to the bona fide purchaser, who could not make use of a new compensatory remedy: violation

Control of the use of property

Attachment of shares held by the applicants, with a total freeze on all related rights for four years and eight months, without sufficient justification: *violation*

Sebeleva and Others v. Russia, 42416/18, 1.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Lack of procedural safeguards for lengthy freezing of all applicant's property in Malta at legal assistance request of Kazakh authorities, likely tainted by political persecution motives: *violation*

Shorazova v. Malta, 51853/19, 3.3.2022Judgment | Legal summary

Positive obligations

Unreasoned dismissal of copyright infringement claim against a private party, who published a digital version of the applicant's book online, without authorisation or paying royalties: *violation*

ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Free expression of the opinion of the people | Vote

Disproportionate automatic disenfranchisement of applicant due to partial guardianship order based on his mental disability with no individualised judicial review of voting capacity: *violation*

Anatoliy Marinov v. Bulgaria, 26081/17, 15.2.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Stand for election

Advisory opinion on the assessment of the proportionality of a general prohibition on standing for election after removal from office in impeachment proceedings

Advisory opinion requested by the Lithuanian Supreme Administrative

Court [GC], P16-2020-002, 8.4.2022Opinion | Legal summary

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

Article 2 § 2

Freedom to leave a country

Formalistic, non-individualised refusal to re-issue alien's passport to long-term resident of Chechen origin, ex-beneficiary of subsidiary protection and afraid to contact Russian authorities: *violation*

ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

Article 3 § 2

Enter own country

Lack of review with safeguards against arbitrariness for refusal to repatriate nationals held with their young children in Kurdish-run camps after the fall of "Islamic State": violation

H.F. and Others v. France [GC], 24384/19 and 44234/20, 14.9.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

Lack of individual removal decisions for migrants, arriving in large groups and circumventing genuine and effective legal entry procedures without cogent reasons: *no violation*

A.A. and Others v. North Macedonia, 55798/16 et al., 6.4.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

Right not to be tried or punished twice

Criminal proceedings duplicating administrative fine for unlawful construction, but not the annual fine for its preservation: *violation*, *no violation*

Goulandris and Vardinogianni v. Greece, 1735/13, 16.6.2022Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12

General prohibition of discrimination

Discriminatory denial to blind chess players of financial awards granted to sighted players as national sporting recognition for winning similar international accolades: *violation*

Negovanović and Others v. Serbia, 29907/16 et al., 25.1.2022......Judgment | Legal summary

Failure to implement swift and comprehensive desegregation measures in an elementary school attended almost exclusively by Roma and Egyptian children: *violation*

X and Others v. Albania, 73548/17 and 45521/19, 31.5.2022Judgment | Legal summary

PROTOCOL No. 16

Advisory opinions

Advisory opinion on the assessment of the proportionality of a general prohibition on standing for election after removal from office in impeachment proceedings

Advisory opinion requested by the Lithuanian Supreme Administrative

Court [GC], P16-2020-002, 8.4.2022Opinion | Legal summary

Advisory opinion on the applicability of statutes of limitation to the prosecution, conviction and punishment in respect of an offence constituting, in substance, an act of torture

Advisory opinion on the difference in treatment between landowners' associations "having a recognised existence on the date of the creation of an approved municipal hunters' association" and those set up after that date

Advisory opinion requested by the French Conseil d'État [GC], P16-2021-002, 13.7.2022......Opinion | Legal summary