KEY CASES 2022

List of cases recommended by the Jurisconsult and approved by the Bureau European Court of Human Rights March 2023



COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

COUNCIL OF EUROPE

CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

NOTE

A selection of the most important cases dealt with by the Court (also referred to as "key cases") is made quarterly by the Bureau, upon recommendation by the Jurisconsult (see Title I, Chapters II and III, of the Rules of Court about their respective roles). This list contains the selection of key cases for 2022.

Cases are listed by reference to the relevant Convention Articles and keywords, then alphabetically by respondent State and by applicant. They are also listed under the importance level "Key cases" in the HUDOC case-law database.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by "[GC]". Decisions are indicated by "(dec.)".

Chamber judgments that are not yet "final" within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention are marked "(not final)". In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43, it will not be included in the present list.

For information on the manner of citing the Court's case-law, please see here.

Article 44 § 2 – Final judgments

The judgment of a Chamber shall become final

(a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or

(b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or

(c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43.

Article 43 – Referral to the Grand Chamber

 Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.
A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.
If the panel accepts the request, the Grand Chamber shall decide the case by means of a judgment.

Contents

CASES BY ARTICLE	4
CASES BY RESPONDENT STATE	15
CASES BY APPLICANT	17

Cases by Article

ARTICLE 1

JURISDICTION OF STATES

Refusal to repatriate nationals held in Kurdish-run camps after the fall of "Islamic State": outside jurisdiction as to alleged ill-treatment; within jurisdiction as to the right to enter own State

H.F. and Others v. France [GC], nos. 24384/19 and 44234/20, 14 September 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 2

LIFE

Specific omissions and delays by the national authorities in conducting and organising operation to rescue refugees whose boat had sunk, causing several deaths: *violation*

Safi and Others v. Greece, no. 5418/15, 7 July 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (SUBSTANTIVE ASPECT)

Death by euthanasia of applicant's mother, who had suffered from depression for about 40 years, as authorised by legal framework: *no violation*

Mortier v. Belgium, no. 78017/17, 4 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

EFFECTIVE INVESTIGATION

Lack of effective investigation into the sinking of a boat carrying refugees, some of whom died: *violation*

Safi and Others v. Greece, no. 5418/15, 7 July 2022

POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (PROCEDURAL ASPECT)

Lack of independence of board subsequently reviewing all acts of euthanasia, allowing doctor who carried out specific act to vote on its legality, and excessive length of criminal investigation: *no violation*

Mortier v. Belgium, no. 78017/17, 4 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 3

EXTRADITION

No real individual risk of ill-treatment in case of extradition of ethnic Uzbeks to Kyrgyzstan: *extradition would not constitute a violation*

Khasanov and Rakhmanov v. Russia [GC], nos. 28492/15 and 49975/15, 29 April 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

No risk of irreducible life sentence in the event of extradition to the USA, the applicant becoming eligible for parole after reduction of charges: *inadmissible*

McCallum v. Italy (dec.) [GC], no. 20863/21, 21 September 2022

Decision | Legal summary

No evidence showing a real risk of a sentence of life imprisonment without parole in the event of the applicant's extradition to, and conviction in, the USA: *no violation*

Sanchez-Sanchez v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 22854/20, 3 November 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

DEGRADING TREATMENT

Body searches of refugees arriving on a Greek island after their boat had sunk, who were ordered by the security forces to undress at the same time and in the same place, in front of at least thirteen people: *violation*

Safi and Others v. Greece, no. 5418/15, 7 July 2022

Placement of minor in adult reception centre in inadequate conditions for more than four months and subjected to ageassessment procedure breaching Article 8: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, no. 5797/17, 21 July 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

No risk of irreducible life sentence in the event of extradition to the USA, the applicant becoming eligible for parole after reduction of charges: *inadmissible*

McCallum v. Italy (dec.) [GC], no. 20863/21, 21 September 2022

Decision | Legal summary

No evidence showing a real risk of a sentence of life imprisonment without parole in the event of the applicant's extradition to, and conviction in, the USA: *no violation*

Sanchez-Sanchez v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 22854/20, 3 November 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

INHUMAN TREATMENT

Placement of minor in adult reception centre in inadequate conditions for more than four months and subjected to ageassessment procedure breaching Article 8: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, no. 5797/17, 21 July 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

No risk of irreducible life sentence in the event of extradition to the USA, the applicant becoming eligible for parole after reduction of charges: *inadmissible*

McCallum v. Italy (dec.) [GC], no. 20863/21, 21 September 2022

Decision | Legal summary

No evidence showing a real risk of a sentence of life imprisonment without parole in the event of the applicant's extradition to, and conviction in, the USA: *no violation*

Sanchez-Sanchez v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 22854/20, 3 November 2022

EFFECTIVE INVESTIGATION

Failure to effectively investigate alleged death threats against vulnerable rape victim by her abuser and father, in breach of domestic law: *violation*

J.I. v. Croatia, no. 35898/16, 8 September 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

INHUMAN OR DEGRADING PUNISHMENT

Conversion, upon prisoner's transfer, of a foreign reducible life sentence into an irreducible one due to unavailability of parole for life prisoners in his home State: *violation*

Kupinskyy v. Ukraine, no. 5084/18, 10 November 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

CIVIL RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS

Lack of judicial review of premature termination *ex lege*, after legislative reform, of a serving judge's mandate as member of the National Council of the Judiciary: *violation*

Grzęda v. Poland [GC], no. 43572/18, 15 March 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ACCESS TO COURT

Lack of judicial review of premature termination *ex lege*, after legislative reform, of a serving judge's mandate as member of the National Council of the Judiciary: *violation*

Grzęda v. Poland [GC], no. 43572/18, 15 March 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

FAIR HEARING

Use of bank documents, for the re-setting of a tax fine, obtained by a judicial order on pain of penalty payments, not within scope of protection of privilege against self-incrimination: *no violation*

De Legé v. the Netherlands, no. 58342/15, 4 October 2022

Article 6 § 1 (administrative)

FAIR HEARING

Tax debt time-barred by retroactive effect of new case-law but subsequently reinstated, while dispute still pending, by retrospective but foreseeable legislation restoring legal certainty: *no violation*

Vegotex International S.A. v. Belgium [GC], no. 49812/09, 3 November 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 7

NULLUM CRIMEN SINE LEGE

Advisory opinion on the applicability of statutes of limitation to the prosecution, conviction and punishment in respect of an offence constituting, in substance, an act of torture

Advisory opinion requested by the Armenian Court of cassation [GC], request no. P16-2021-001, 26 April 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

Conviction for breach of the prohibition on entry and stay in a specific conflict zone, which was lifted at the time of the adjudication of the case following a change in the situation in that zone: *no violation*

Mørck Jensen v. Denmark, no. 60785/19, 18 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

NULLA POENA SINE LEGE

Advisory opinion on the applicability of statutes of limitation to the prosecution, conviction and punishment in respect of an offence constituting, in substance, an act of torture

Advisory opinion requested by the Armenian Court of cassation [GC], request no. P16-2021-001, 26 April 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

HEAVIER PENALTY

Conversion, upon prisoner's transfer, of a foreign reducible life sentence into an irreducible one due to unavailability of parole for life prisoners in his home State: *violation*

Kupinskyy v. Ukraine, no. 5084/18, 10 November 2022

ARTICLE 8

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE AND FAMILY LIFE

Inability to obtain recognition of a legal relationship between a child and the biological mother's ex-partner: *no violation*

C.E. and Others v. France, nos. 29775/18 and 29693/19, 24 March 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Unaccompanied minor asylum-seeker placed in adult reception centre, not provided minimum procedural guarantees in ageassessment procedure: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, no. 5797/17, 21 July 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Significant flaws in criminal investigation concerning alleged sexual harassment at the workplace: *violation*

C. v. Romania, no. 47358/20, 30 August 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Collection of data on sexual behaviour of potential blood donor based on speculation, and excessive length of data retention by public body: *violation*

Drelon v. France, nos. 3153/16 and 27758/18, 8 September 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Doctors' failure to involve son in procedure leading to mother's death by euthanasia, in the absence of her wish to do so, in accordance with law: *no violation*

Mortier v. Belgium, no. 78017/17, 4 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS

Inability to obtain recognition of a legal relationship between a child and the biological mother's ex-partner: *no violation*

C.E. and Others v. France, nos. 29775/18 and 29693/19, 24 March 2022

Unaccompanied minor asylum-seeker placed in adult reception centre, not provided minimum procedural guarantees in ageassessment procedure: *violation*

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, no. 5797/17, 21 July 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Significant flaws in criminal investigation concerning alleged sexual harassment at the workplace: *violation*

C. v. Romania, no. 47358/20, 30 August 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Doctors' failure to involve son in procedure leading to mother's death by euthanasia, in the absence of her wish to do so, in accordance with law: *no violation*

Mortier v. Belgium, no. 78017/17, 4 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 10

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

No legitimate aim for civil defamation proceedings against a media outlet, seeking to protect "reputation" of a public authority as such and unrelated to any economic activity: *violation*

OOO Memo v. Russia, no. 2840/10, 15 March 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Justified revocation of broadcasting licence of a TV channel after repeated and serious breach of the statutory requirement to ensure political balance and pluralism in news bulletins: *no violation*

NIT S.R.L. v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], no. 28470/12, 5 April 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Suspended prison sentence for offence of sexual exposure imposed on Femen activist for topless performance in church as protest against Catholic church's position on abortion: *violation*

Bouton v. France, no. 22636/19, 13 October 2022

ARTICLE 11

FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION

Dismissal of employees on account of their involvement in a strike organised outside a trade-union context: *Article 11 not applicable; inadmissible*

Barış and Others v. Turkey (dec.), nos. 66828/16 et al., 14 December 2021

Decision | Legal summary

Application of Foreign Agents Act to non-governmental organisations and their directors neither prescribed by law nor necessary in a democratic society: *violation*

Ecodefence and Others v. Russia, nos. 9988/13 et al.,14 June 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 14

DISCRIMINATION (ARTICLE 8)

No discrimination against wheelchair user unable to access two local public buildings, given other considerable measures to improve accessibility: *no violation*

Arnar Helgi Lárusson v. Iceland, no. 23077/19, 31 May 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Discriminatory treatment of widower, taking care full-time of children, by terminating his survivor's pension when youngest child reached adulthood, while widows continued to receive one: *violation*

Beeler v. Switzerland [GC], no. 78630/12, 11 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Lack of independent effective investigation into arguable allegations of racial profiling by police during identity check on a train: *violation*

Basu v. Germany, no. 215/19, 18 October 2022

Allegations of racial profiling by police during identity check on a street duly examined and found unsubstantiated by administrative courts: *no violation*

Muhammad v. Spain, no. 34085/17, 18 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

DISCRIMINATION (ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1)

Very weighty reasons for exclusion of employment periods accrued in other former USSR states in state pension calculation for permanently resident non-citizens, in contrast to Latvian citizens: *no violation*

Savickis and Others v. Latvia [GC], no. 49270/11, 9 June 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

Advisory opinion on the difference in treatment between landowners' associations "having a recognised existence on the date of the creation of an approved municipal hunters' association" and landowners' associations set up after that date

Advisory opinion requested by the French *Conseil d'État* [GC], request no. P16-2021-002, 13 July 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

ARTICLE 34

HINDER THE EXERCISE OF THE RIGHT OF APPLICATION

Failure to comply with interim measure through enforcement of dissolution order against a non-governmental organisation: *violation*

Ecodefence and Others v. Russia, nos. 9988/13 et al., 14 June 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 46

Article 46 § 4

INFRINGEMENT PROCEEDINGS

Infringement proceedings against Türkiye for failure to abide by Court's final judgment explicitly indicating applicant's immediate release: *violation*

Kavala v. Türkiye [GC], no. 28749/18, 11 July 2022

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

FREEDOM OF MOVEMENT

Danish national prohibited from entering and staying, without permission, in areas in which a terrorist organisation is a party to an ongoing armed conflict (the al-Raqqa district in Syria): *no violation*

Mørck Jensen v. Denmark, no. 60785/19, 18 October 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

STAND FOR ELECTION

Advisory opinion on the assessment of the proportionality of a general prohibition on standing for election after removal from office in impeachment proceedings

Advisory opinion requested by the Lithuanian Supreme Administrative Court [GC], request no. P16-2020-002, 8 April 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

ENTER OWN COUNTRY

Lack of review with safeguards against arbitrariness for refusal to repatriate nationals held with their young children in Kurdish-run camps after the fall of "Islamic State": *violation*

H.F. and Others v. France [GC], nos. 24384/19 and 44234/20, 14 September 2022

Judgment | Legal summary

PROTOCOL No. 16

ADVISORY OPINIONS

Advisory opinion on the assessment of the proportionality of a general prohibition on standing for election after removal from office in impeachment proceedings

Advisory opinion requested by the Lithuanian Supreme Administrative Court [GC], request no. P16-2020-002, 8 April 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

Advisory opinion on the applicability of statutes of limitation to the prosecution, conviction and punishment in respect of an offence constituting, in substance, an act of torture

Advisory opinion requested by the Armenian Court of cassation [GC], request no. P16-2021-001, 26 April 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

Advisory opinion on the difference in treatment between landowners' associations "having a recognised existence on the date of the creation of an approved municipal hunters' association" and landowners' associations set up after that date

Advisory opinion requested by the French *Conseil d'État* [GC], request no. P16-2021-002, 13 July 2022

Opinion | Legal summary

Cases by respondent State

BELGIUM

Mortier v. Belgium, no. 78017/17, 4 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Vegotex International S.A. v. Belgium [GC], no. 49812/09, 3 November 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

CROATIA

J.I. v. Croatia, no. 35898/16, 8 September 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

DENMARK

Mørck Jensen v. Denmark, no. 60785/19, 18 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

FRANCE

Bouton v. France, no. 22636/19, 13 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

C.E. and Others v. France, nos. 29775/18 and 29693/19, 24 March 2022 Judgment | Legal summary Drelon v. France, nos. 3153/16 and 27758/18, 8 September 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

H.F. and Others v. France [GC], nos. 24384/19 and 44234/20, 14 September 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

GERMANY

Basu v. Germany, no. 215/19, 18 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

GREECE

Safi and Others v. Greece, no. 5418/15, 7 July 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

ICELAND

Arnar Helgi Lárusson v. Iceland, no. 23077/19, 31 May 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

ITALY

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, no. 5797/17, 21 July 2022 Judgment | Legal summary McCallum v. Italy (dec.) [GC], no. 20863/21, 21 September 2022 Decision | Legal summary

LATVIA

Savickis and Others v. Latvia [GC], no. 49270/11, 9 June 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA

NIT S.R.L. v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], no. 28470/12, 5 April 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

NETHERLANDS

De Legé v. the Netherlands, no. 58342/15, 4 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

POLAND

Grzęda v. Poland [GC], no. 43572/18, 15 March 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

ROMANIA

C. v. Romania, no. 47358/20, 30 August 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

RUSSIA

Ecodefence and Others v. Russia, nos. 9988/13 et al., 14 June 2022 Judgment | Legal summary Khasanov and Rakhmanov v. Russia [GC], nos. 28492/15 and 49975/15, 29 April 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

OOO Memo v. Russia, no. 2840/10, 15 March 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

SPAIN

Muhammad v. Spain, no. 34085/17, 18 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

SWITZERLAND

Beeler v. Switzerland [GC], no. 78630/12, 11 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

TÜRKIYE

Barış and Others v. Turkey (dec.), nos. 66828/16 et al., 14 December 2021 Decision | Legal summary

Kavala v. Türkiye [GC], no. 28749/18, 11 July 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

UKRAINE

Kupinskyy v. Ukraine, no. 5084/18, 10 November 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

UNITED KINGDOM

Sanchez-Sanchez v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 22854/20, 3 November 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Cases by applicant

A

Arnar Helgi Lárusson v. Iceland, no. 23077/19, 31 May 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

B

Barış and Others v. Turkey (dec.), nos. 66828/16 et al., 14 December 2021, Decision | Legal summary

Basu v. Germany, no. 215/19, 18 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Beeler v. Switzerland [GC], no. 78630/12, 11 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Bouton v. France, no. 22636/19, 13 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

С

C. v. Romania, no. 47358/20, 30 August 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

C.E. and Others v. France, nos. 29775/18 and 29693/19, 24 March 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

D

Darboe and Camara v. Italy, no. 5797/17, 21 July 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

De Legé v. the Netherlands, no. 58342/15, 4 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Drelon v. France, nos. 3153/16 and 27758/18, 8 September 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

E

Ecodefence and Others v. Russia, nos. 9988/13 et al., 14 June 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

G

Grzęda v. Poland [GC], no. 43572/18, 15 March 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

H

H.F. and Others v. France [GC], nos. 24384/19 and 44234/20, 14 September 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

J

J.I. v. Croatia, no. 35898/16, 8 September 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

K

Kavala v. Türkiye [GC], no. 28749/18, 11 July 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Khasanov and Rakhmanov v. Russia [GC], nos. 28492/15 and 49975/15, 29 April 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Kupinskyy v. Ukraine, no. 5084/18, 10 November 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Μ

McCallum v. Italy (dec.) [GC], no. 20863/21, 21 September 2022 Decision | Legal summary

Mørck Jensen v. Denmark, no. 60785/19, 18 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Mortier v. Belgium, no. 78017/17, 4 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Muhammad v. Spain, no. 34085/17, 18 October 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Ν

NIT S.R.L. v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], no. 28470/12, 5 April 2022. Judgment | Legal summary

0

OOO Memo v. Russia, no. 2840/10, 15 March 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

S

Safi and Others v. Greece, no. 5418/15, 7 July 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Sanchez-Sanchez v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 22854/20, 3 November 2022 Judgment | Legal summary

Savickis and Others v. Latvia [GC], no. 49270/11, 9 June 2022, Judgment | Legal summary

V

Vegotex International S.A. v. Belgium [GC], no. 49812/09, 3 November 2022 Judgment | Legal summary